

Accurate RBI Records for Players of the Deadball Era: Part 11 — The Players on the 1914 Detroit Tigers.

by Herm Krabbenhoft

APPENDIX

Appendix 1 — Game-By-Game Details for the Runs Scored by the 1914 Detroit Tigers. (Page 1)

Appendix 2 — Analysis of “Either-Or” RBI Games. (Page 26)

Appendix 2A — Analysis of “Either-Or” RBI Game on September 06, 1914. (Page 26)

Appendix 2B — Analysis of “Either-Or” RBI Game on October 04, 1914. (Page 60)

Appendix 3 — Table 3B — RBIs Collected by Selected Tigers Players During 1913-19 Seasons. (Page 87)

Appendix 1 — Game-By-Game Details for the Runs Scored by the 1914 Detroit Tigers

Explanatory Notes for Appendix A-1:

1. An asterisk in the OPP column indicates that the game was played at the opponent’s ballpark.
2. For runs scored on plays in which a fielding error was committed, the following information is provided:

- (a) the starting base of the run-scorer is indicated in the R-Scorer column;
- (b) the number of outs when the batter put the ball in play is indicated in the R-Event column;
- (c) the type of fielding error is indicated in the R-Event column —

- * (wt) — wild throw.
- * (wtf) — wild throw to first.
- * (wts) — wild throw to second.
- * (wtt) — wild throw to third.
- * (wth) — wild throw to home.
- * (fg) — fumbled grounder.
- * (fpu) — fumbled pickup (of a hit to the outfield).
- * (mf) — muffed flyball.
- * (mc) — muffed catch (of a thrown ball).

(d) and if the batter did not get credit for an RBI, the batter’s name is enclosed in parentheses in the R-Batter column.

3. The run-scoring events are designated as follows:

- * S-1 — 1-RBI single
- * D-1 — 1-RBI double
- * T-1 — 1-RBI triple
- * HR-1 — 1-RBI homer
- * W-1 — 1-RBI bases-loaded walk
- * HBP-1 — 1-RBI bases-loaded hit-by-pitch
- * GO-1 — 1-RBI groundout
- * GDP-1 — 1-RBI groundout double play
- * SF-1 — 1-RBI sacrifice fly
- * sac-1 — 1-RBI sacrifice bunt
- * FCFO-1 — 1-RBI fielder’s-choice-force-out
- * SOFC-1 — 1-RBI safe-on-fielder’s-choice
- * WP — wild pitch
- * PB — passed ball
- * BK — balk
- * SB — stolen base (steal of home)
- * IS — infield single
- * BS — bunt single

Appendix A-1 — Details of the Runs Scored by the 1914 Detroit Tigers

Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
------	-----	-----	-----	----------	---------	----------

4-14	STL	1	13	Bush	T-2	Cobb
		2	13	Baumann	T-2	Cobb
		3	13	Cobb	SF-1	Veach
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
4-16	STL	1	1	Bush	SF-1	Cobb
		2	4	Cobb	S-1	Crawford
		3	4	Crawford	S-1	Moriarty
		4	5	Bush (2nd)	SB + E-2 (wtt)	---
		5	6	Burns	S-1	Stanage
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
4-17	STL	1	1	Bush	T-1	Crawford
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
4-18	CLE	1	1	Cobb	D-1	Veach
		2	3	Bush	WP	---
		3	3	Crawford	HR-1	Crawford
		4	4	Moriarty	S-1	Stanage
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
4-19	CLE	1	3	Moriarty	S-1	Boehler
		2	3	Bush	D-1	Kavanagh
		3	3	Kavanagh	S-1	Cobb
		4	8	Kavanagh	D-1	Cobb
		5	8	Cobb	T-1	Veach
		6	8	Veach	S-1	Burns
		7	9	Kavanagh	S-1	Veach
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
4-21	CLE	1	5	Bush	S-2	Cobb
		2	5	Kavanagh	S-2	Cobb
		3	5	Cobb	T-1	Crawford
		4	5	Crawford	T + E-4 (mc)	(Crawford)
		5	6	Cobb	D-1	Crawford
		6	7	Veach (2nd)	sac + E-2 (wtt); SOFC	(Burns)
		7	7	Burns	S-1	Coveleski
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter

4-22	STL*	1	3	Kavanagh	S-1	Crawford
		2	3	Cobb	S-2	Veach
		3	3	Crawford	S-2	Veach
		4	5	Cobb (1st)	S + E-4 (mc)	(Crawford)
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
4-23	STL*	1	3	Bush	D-1	Kavanagh
		2	3	Kavanagh	SF-1	Cobb
		3	3	Crawford	D-1	Veach
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
4-24	STL*	1	2	Crawford	SF-1	Veach
		2	6	Crawford	S-1	Burns
		3	6	Veach	D-1	Moriarty
		4	6	Burns	SF-1	Dubuc
		5	6	Moriarty (2nd)	SB + E-2 (wtt)	---
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
4-25	STL*	1	1	Cobb	HR-2	Crawford
		2	1	Crawford	HR-2	Crawford
		3	3	Bush (1st)	IS + E-6	(Cobb)
		4	8	Crawford	S-1	Burns
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
4-26	STL*	1	5	Veach (2nd)	SB + E-5 (mc)	---
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
4-28	CHI	1	3	Bush	HR-2	Kavanagh
		2	3	Kavanagh	HR-2	Kavanagh
		3	8	Kavanagh	D-2	Crawford
		4	8	Cobb	D-2	Crawford
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
4-29	CHI	1	11	Moriarty	SF-1	Dubuc
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
4-30	CHI	1	4	Kavanagh	SOFC-1	Crawford
		2	4	Cobb (2nd)	S + E-7	(Veach)
		3	8	Kavanagh	S-1	Burns
		4	8	Cobb	S-2	Moriarty

		5	8	Veach	S-2	Moriarty
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
5-1	CHI	1	1	Bush (3rd)	K + DTS (2-3)	(Crawford)
		2	1	Cobb (2nd)	K + DTS (2-3) + E-2 (mc)	(Crawford)
		3	4	Crawford	S-1	Burns
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
5-2	CLE*	---	---	---	---	---
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
5-3	CLE*	1	1	Bush	W-1	Veach
		2	1	Cobb (3rd)	FO + E-7 (wth)	(Burns)
		3	5	Bush	HR-2	Cobb
		4	5	Cobb	HR-2	Cobb
		5	6	Burns	S-1	Dubuc
		6	7	Crawford (3rd)	(2-out) SOE-8 (mf)	(Moriarty)
		7	8	Dauss	S-1	Kavanagh
		8	8	Bush (2nd)	S + E-2 (wts)	(Kavanagh)
		9	8	Kavanagh	S-1	Cobb
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
5-4	CLE*	1	1	Bush	S-1	Kavanagh
		2	1	Kavanagh	S-1	Crawford
		3	1	Crawford	S-1	Burns
		4	3	Cobb	S-1	Burns
		5	3	Burns	D-1	Moriarty
		6	5	Cobb	OUT-1	Veach
		7	7	Kavanagh	T + E-8 (wt)	(Kavanagh)
		8	9	Crawford	S-1	Burns
		9	9	Veach (1st)	S + E-7 (wth)	(Burns)
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
5-5	CLE*	1	2	Crawford	SF-1	Moriarty
		2	3	Bush	D-1	Cobb
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
5-6	CHI*	1	1	Kavanagh	SF-1	Crawford
		2	3	Cobb	S-2	High

		3	3	Crawford	S-2	High
		4	5	Cobb	T-1	Crawford
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
5-8	CHI*	1	2	Crawford	SF-1	Burns
		2	2	High	S-1	Stanage
		3	3	Crawford	E-2	---
		4	6	Burns	S-1	Stanage
		5	6	Stanage	S-2	Bush
		6	6	Dubuc	S-2	Bush
		7	7	Cobb	T-1	Crawford
		8	9	Cobb	S-1	Crawford
		9	9	Crawford	S-1	Moriarty
		10	9	Burns	SB	---
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
5-9	CHI*	1	2	Burns	SF-1	Stanage
		2	3	Bush	T-1	Kavanagh
		3	5	Stanage	S-1	Kavanagh
		4	5	Kavanagh (2nd)	SOE-4	(Crawford)
		5	6	Burns	SF-1	Stanage
		6	8	High	WP	---
		7	9	Stanage	S-1	Kavanagh
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
5-10	CHI*	---	---	---	---	---
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
5-12	NY*	1	1	Bush	D-1	Cobb
		2	1	Kavanagh	SF-1	Crawford
		3	1	Cobb	SF-1	Burns
		4	8	Moriarty	S-1	Bush
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
5-14	NY*	1	8	Kavanagh	PB	---
		2	8	Cobb	S-2	Veach
		3	8	Crawford	S-2	Veach
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter

5-15	NY*	1	2	Burns	HR-1	Burns
		2	6	Kavanagh (2nd)	SOFC + rundown	(Cobb)
		3	7	Moriarty	W-1	Bush
		4	8	Cobb	SF-1	High
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
5-16	BOS*	---	---	---	---	---
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
5-18	BOS*	---	---	---	---	---
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
5-19	BOS*	1	2	Veach	SB	---
		2	2	Moriarty	S-1	Stanage
		3	3	Bush	S-1	Cobb
		4	4	Moriarty	SB + E-2	---
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
5-20	BOS*	1	4	Heilmann	S-1	Burns
		2	8	Kavanagh	T-1	Crawford
		3	8	Crawford	S-1	Veach
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
5-21	PHI*	1	1	Kavanagh	S-1	Crawford
		2	2	Burns	HR-1	Burns
		3	3	Heilmann	S-1	Burns
		4	3	Crawford	S-2	Moriarty
		5	3	Burns	S-2	Moriarty
		6	6	Bush	D-1	Kavanagh
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
5-22	PHI*	1	2	Burns	D-2	McKee
		2	2	Stanage	D-2	McKee
		3	4	Burns	GO-1	Moriarty
		4	8	Burns	HR-1	Burns
		5	9	Kavanagh	HR-1	Kavanagh
		6	9	High	S-1	Burns
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
5-23	PHI*	1	1	Kavanagh	D-1	Heilmann

		2	1	Heilmann	S-1	Veach
		3	5	Moriarty	D-1	Bush
		4	6	Crawford	D-2	Burns
		5	6	Veach	D-2	Burns
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
5-25	WAS*	1	3	Main	D-1	Bush
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
5-26	WAS*	1	6	Bush	SF-1	Crawford
		2	7	Moriarty	S-1	Stanage
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
5-27	WAS*	—	—	—	—	—
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
5-28	WAS*	1	6	Bush	D-1	High
		2	6	High	D-1	Crawford
		3	6	Crawford	S-1	Burns
		4	6	Veach	T-2	Moriarty
		5	6	Burns	T-2	Moriarty
		6	7	Bush (2nd)	BS + E-4	(High)
		7	7	Kavanagh	S-2	Crawford
		8	7	High	S-2	Crawford
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
5-30 (1)	STL*	1	8	Veach	S-1	Stanage
		2	8	Moriarty	S-1	Coveleski
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
5-30 (2)	STL*	—	—	—	—	—
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
5-31	STL*	1	5	Crawford	HR-1	Crawford
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
6-1	CHI	1	11	Crawford	HR-1	Crawford
		2	13	Moriarty	S-1	Bush
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
6-2	CHI	1	1	Vitt	S-2	Kavanagh
		2	1	Crawford	S-2	Kavanagh
		3	5	High	S-2	Moriarty

		4	5	Kavanagh	S-2	Moriarty
		5	5	Burns	S-1	Stanage
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
6-3	STL	1	9	Baker	D-1	Dubuc
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
6-5 (1)	STL	1	4	Heilmann	WP	---
		2	8	Crawford	D-2	Burns
		3	8	Kavanagh	D-2	Burns
		4	8	Burns	D-1	Moriarty
		5	8	Moriarty	S-1	Veach
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
6-5 (2)	STL	1	1	High	S-1	Crawford
		2	1	Veach	SB	---
		3	4	Kavanagh (1st)	SB + E-2 (wts)	---
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
6-6	PHI	1	4	Bush	S-1	Crawford
		2	6	Bush	S-1	Cobb
		3	11	Moriarty	S-1	Kavanagh
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
6-7	PHI	1	1	Bush	S-1	Cobb
		2	1	Cobb	S-1	Veach
		3	4	Kavanagh	S-1	Coveleski
		4	7	Moriarty	SB	---
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
6-8	PHI	1	1	Bush	S-1	Cobb
		2	5	Veach	WP	---
		3	6	Cavet	S-2	Cobb
		4	6	Bush	S-2	Cobb
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
6-9	PHI	1	3	Dubuc	D-1	Moriarty
		2	4	Cobb	SB	---
		3	4	Kavanagh	WP	---
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
6-10	BOS	1	5	Kavanagh (1st)	SOE-1	(Burns)

		2	5	Burns	SF-1	Stanage
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
6-11	BOS	1	1	Bush	S-1	High
		2	4	Kavanagh	D-1	Burns
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
6-12	BOS	1	1	Bush	SF-1	Moriarty
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
6-13	BOS	1	4	Veach	S-1	Burns
		2	4	Kavanagh	S-1	Stanage
		3	4	Burns	S-1	Moriarty
		4	5	Veach	SF-1	Burns
		5	9	Cobb	D-1	Kavanagh
		6	9	Kavanagh	S-1	Burns
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
6-14	NY	1	8	High	S-2	Cobb
		2	8	Bush	S-2	Cobb
		3	8	Moriarty	GO-1	Crawford
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
6-15	NY	1	2	Veach	T-1	Stanage
		2	2	Stanage	S-1	Boehler
		3	4	Burns	T-1	Boehler
		4	4	Boehler	sac-1	Bush
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
6-16	NY	1	6	Veach	D-2	Coveleski
		2	6	Burns	D-2	Coveleski
		3	6	Coveleski	S-1	Bush
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
6-17	NY	1	2	Veach	T-1	Kavanagh
		2	8	Moriarty	S-1	Cobb
		3	9	Kavanagh	S-1	Bush
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
6-18	WAS	1	4	Cobb (1st)	D-1	Crawford
		2	4	Crawford	SF-1	Veach
		3	4	Kavanagh	HR-1	Kavanagh

		4	8	Bush (3rd)	(1-out) SOE-5 (fg)	(Cobb)
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
6-19	WAS	1	5	Veach	S-1	Burns
		2	8	Bush	S-1	Cobb
		3	10	Bush	S-1	Veach
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
6-20	WAS	1	7	Crawford	S-1	Veach
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
6-21	WAS	1	2	Crawford	S-1	Veach
		2	3	Moriarty	SF-1	Veach
		3	6	Veach (3rd)	(1-out) SOE-9 (mf)	(Stanage)
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
6-22	WAS	1	1	Moriarty	SB	---
		2	2	Kavanagh	D-1	Burns
		3	7	Veach	S-1	Burns
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
6-23	CLE	1	7	Baker	D-2	Bush
		2	7	Moriarty	D-2	Bush
		3	7	Bush	GO-1	Purtell
		4	8	Crawford	S-1	Veach
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
6-24	CHI*	1	4	Purtell	SF-1	Crawford
		2	5	Veach	PB	---
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
6-25	CHI*	1	1	Bush	S-1	Veach
		2	7	Stanage (1st)	sac + SOE -1	(Dauss)
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
6-26	CHI*	1	8	Stanage	GO-1	Purtell
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
6-27	CHI*	1	2	Kavanagh	S-1	Burns
		2	5	Bush (1st)	GO + E-3	(Purtell)
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
6-28	CLE	1	1	Bush (2nd)	sac + E-5	(High)
		2	1	Vitt	S-2	Crawford

		3	1	High	S-2	Crawford
		4	1	Kavanagh	S-1	Stanage
		5	3	Kavanagh	GO + E-3	(Burns)
		6	6	Burns	GO-1	Bush
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
6-29	CHI	1	1	Bush	GO-1	High
		2	8	McKee	SF-1	High
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
6-30	CHI	1	5	Bush	S-1	Heilmann
		2	5	Vitt	S-1	Crawford
		3	5	Heilmann	S-1	Veatch
		4	6	Dubuc	D-2	Vitt
		5	6	Bush	D-2	Vitt
		6	8	Baker	S-1	Dubuc
		7	8	Dubuc	SB	---
		8	8	Vitt (3rd)	(2-out) SOE-3 (fg)	(Heilmann)
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
7-2	CLE	1	1	Vitt	D-1	Crawford
		2	5	Burns	S-1	McKee
		3	6	Crawford	S-1	Kavanagh
		4	7	Bush	S-1	High
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
7-3	CLE	1	1	Vitt	S-2	Veatch
		2	1	Crawford	S-2	Veatch
		3	3	Bush	GO-1	High
		4	4	Burns	S-1	Coveleski
		5	7	High	S-2	Veatch
		6	7	Crawford	S-2	Veatch
		7	7	Kavanagh	S-1	Burns
		8	7	Burns	S-1	Coveleski
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
7-4 (1)	CLE	1	1	Bush	SF-1	Crawford

		2	1	Vitt	S-2	Burns
		3	1	Heilmann	S-2	Burns
		4	5	Bush	S-1	Vitt
		5	5	Vitt	D-1	Heilmann
		6	5	Heilmann	S-1	Veach
		7	5	Veach	D-1	Kavanagh
		8	9	Vitt	D-1	Veach
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
7-4 (2)	CLE	1	2	Kavanagh	D-1	Burns
		2	2	Burns	S-1	McKee
		3	12	Kavanagh (2nd)	sac + E-1 (wtt)	(McKee)
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
7-5 (1)	STL	1	1	Bush	WP	---
		2	1	Vitt	SF-1	Crawford
		3	3	Vitt	S-1	Crawford
		4	7	Bush	HR-2	Heilmann
		5	7	Heilmann	HR-2	Heilmann
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
7-5 (2)	STL	---	---	---	---	---
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
7-8	PHI*	---	---	---	---	---
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
7-9 (1)	PHI*	1	1	Bush	SF-1	Crawford
		2	1	Vitt	FCFO-1	Kavanagh
		3	1	High	S-1	Burns
		4	1	Kavanagh	S + E-7 (fpu)	(Burns)
		5	1	Burns	S-1	Stanage
		6	1	Stanage (2nd)	SOE-4	(Bush)
		7	2	Vitt	D-1	Crawford
		8	4	Bush	S-1	Heilmann
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
7-9 (2)	PHI*	1	1	Heilmann	D-1	Crawford
		2	3	Bush	S-1	Heilmann

		3	3	Heilmann	S-1	Veach
		4	4	Dubuc	HR-1	Dubuc
		5	7	Crawford	HR-1	Crawford
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
7-10	PHI*	1	8	Crawford	S-1	Kavanagh
		2	8	Veach	S-1	Burns
		3	8	Kavanagh	WP	---
		4	8	Burns	S-1	Bush
		5	8	High (3rd)	(1-out) 1-RBI grounder + SOE-5	Heilmann
		6	8	Bush	SF-1	Crawford
		7	9	Kavanagh	S-1	McKee
		8	9	McKee	sac-1	Bush
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
7-11	WAS*	1	2	Veach	S-1	Kavanagh
		2	9	High	FCFO-1	Veach
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
7-13	WAS*	---	---	---	---	---
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
7-14	WAS*	1	7	Veach	SF-1	Burns
		2	9	Crawford	FCFO-1	Stanage
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
7-15	WAS*	1	1	Purtell (2nd)	SOE-6	(Heilmann)
		2	3	Bush	SF-1	Purtell
		3	4	Kavanagh	S-1	Stanage
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
7-16	BOS*	1	4	Heilmann	T-2	Veach
		2	4	Crawford	T-2	Veach
		3	5	Dauss	W-1	Crawford
		4	5	Bush	S-2	Veach
		5	5	Purtell	S-2	Veach
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
7-17	BOS*	1	6	Stanage	S-1	Heilmann
		2	9	Heilmann	W-1	Burns

Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
7-18	BOS*	1	5	Kavanagh	S-1	Dubuc
		2	7	High	S-1	Dubuc
		3	13	Veach	D-2	High
		4	13	Kavanagh	D-2	High
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
7-20	BOS*	1	9	Heilmann	S-1	Crawford
		2	9	Crawford (1st)	sac + SOE-1	(Veach)
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
7-21	NY*	1	3	Bush (1st)	BS + E-5	(Purtell)
		2	3	Purtell	S-1	Crawford
		3	3	Veach	HR-2	Kavanagh
		4	3	Kavanagh	HR-2	Kavanagh
		5	7	Bush	S-1	Purtell
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
7-22 (1)	NY*	1	2	Kavanagh	S-1	Stanage
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
7-22 (2)	NY*	1	1	Bush	S-2	Crawford
		2	1	Moriarty	S-2	Crawford
		3	1	High	SF-1	Veach
		4	8	Burns	S-1	Moriarty
		5	9	Crawford	HR-1	Crawford
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
7-23	NY*	1	2	Crawford	T + E-4	(Crawford)
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
7-25	PHI	1	4	Moriarty	W-1	Veach
		2	4	Heilmann	SF-1	Kavanagh
		3	7	High	S-1	Moriarty
		4	7	Bush	SB	---
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
7-26	PHI	1	2	Crawford	T-1	Kavanagh
		2	2	Kavanagh	S-1	Burns
		3	6	Moriarty	SF-1	Crawford
		4	6	High	SF-1	Veach

		5	8	Moriarty	D-1	Crawford
		6	9	Burns	SF-1	McKee
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
7-27	PHI	1	3	Baker	D-1	Cavet
		2	4	Veach (2nd)	FO + E-9 (wt)	(Baker)
		3	7	Bush	S-1	Heilmann
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
7-28	PHI	1	4	Moriarty	S-1	Crawford
		2	6	Dauss	T-2	Crawford
		3	6	High	T-2	Crawford
		4	8	Bush	W-1	Veach
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
7-29	WAS	1	3	Boehler	D-2	High
		2	3	Bush	D-2	High
		3	3	High (3rd)	(2-out) SOE-4 (fg)	(Crawford)
		4	5	Bush	T-2	High
		5	5	Moriarty	T-2	High
		6	5	High	HR-2	Crawford
		7	5	Crawford	HR-2	Crawford
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
7-30	WAS	1	3	Bush	T-2	Crawford
		2	3	Moriarty	T-2	Crawford
		3	10	Moriarty	WP	---
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
7-31	WAS	1	7	Burns	S-1	Heilmann
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
8-1	WAS	---	---	---	---	---
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
8-2	NY	1	4	Moriarty	S-1	Crawford
		2	6	Moriarty	SF-1	Veach
		3	8	High	D-2	Veach
		4	8	Crawford	D-2	Veach
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
8-3	NY	1	2	Veach	S-1	Baker

		2	2	Heilmann (2nd)	S + FC	(Baker)
		3	6	Heilmann	S-2	Coveleski
		4	6	Burns	S-2	Coveleski
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
8-4	NY	1	1	Bush	S-1	Crawford
		2	1	Crawford	T-1	Veach
		3	1	Veach	HR-2	Heilmann
		4	1	Heilmann	HR-2	Heilmann
		5	4	Dauss	HR-1	Dauss
		6	6	Dauss	W-1	High
		7	6	Bush	GO-1	Crawford
		8	6	Moriarty	T-2	Veach
		9	6	High	T-2	Veach
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
8-5	NY	1	3	Moriarty	T-2	Crawford
		2	3	High	T-2	Crawford
		3	3	Crawford	S-1	Veach
		4	6	Veach	SF-1	Burns
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
8-7	BOS	1	4	Moriarty	T-1	Cobb
		2	4	Cobb	SF-1	Crawford
		3	8	Bush	S-1	Crawford
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
8-8	BOS	1	2	Veach	D-1	Burns
		2	2	Burns	S-1	Cavet
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
8-9	BOS	1	1	Moriarty	S-1	Crawford
		2	3	Bush	S-1	Cobb
		3	3	Cobb	E-4	---
		4	3	Crawford	T-1	Veach
		5	5	Crawford	T-1	Veach
		6	6	Burns	HR-1	Burns
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter

8-13	CLE*	1	1	Moriarty	SF-1	Veach
		2	2	Kavanagh	GO-1	Stanage
		3	8	Cobb (2nd)	(1-out) SOE-1 (mc)	(Veach)
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
8-14	CLE*	1	2	Crawford	S-1	Kavanagh
		2	5	Kavanagh	GO-1	Stanage
		3	5	Burns	S-1	Bush
		4	6	Burns	S-1	Stanage
		5	7	Bush	S-2	Cobb
		6	7	Moriarty	S-2	Cobb
		7	8	Burns	D-2	Bush
		8	8	Stanage	D-2	Bush
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
8-15	CLE*	1	2	Veach	GO-1	Burns
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
8-16	CLE*	1	1	Bush	FCFO-1	Crawford
		2	1	Moriarty (3rd)	(1-out) SOE-6 (wth)	(Veach)
		3	1	Crawford	GO-1	Kavanagh
		4	1	Veach	PB	---
		5	2	Stanage	W-1	Crawford
		6	2	Bush	PB	---
		7	2	Cobb	PB	---
		8	2	Crawford	PB	---
		9	3	Kavanagh	W-1	Bush
		10	3	Burns	D-2	Moriarty
		11	3	Heilmann	D-2	Moriarty
		12	7	Burns	S-2	Moriarty
		13	7	Cavet	S-2	Moriarty
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
8-18 (1)	PHI*	1	2	Crawford	FCFO-1	Burns
		2	3	Coveleski	GO-1	Cobb
		3	6	Crawford	S-1	Kavanagh

Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
8-18 (2)	PHI*	1	5	Kavanagh	S-1	Burns
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
8-19	PHI*	1	2	Veach	S-2	Burns
		2	2	Kavanagh	S-2	Burns
		3	7	Burns	FCFO-1	Bush
		4	7	High	S-1	Cobb
		5	7	Bush	S-2	Crawford
		6	7	Moriarty	S-2	Crawford
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
8-20	PHI*	1	1	Moriarty	HR-1	Moriarty
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
8-22	WAS*	1	3	Burns (3rd)	(1-out) 1-RBI SOE-6 (fg)	Bush
		2	4	Cobb	D-3	Stanage
		3	4	Veach	D-3	Stanage
		4	4	Kavanagh	D-3	Stanage
		5	5	Moriarty (3rd)	(1-out) SOE-7 (mf)	(Veach)
		6	5	Crawford	S-1	Kavanagh
		7	5	Veach	SB	---
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
8-24 (1)	WAS*	1	1	Bush	T-2	Veach
		2	1	Moriarty	T-2	Veach
		3	4	Crawford	S-1	Kavanagh
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
8-24 (2)	WAS*	1	1	Moriarty	SF-1	Crawford
		2	2	Burns	D-1	Dauss
		3	5	McKee	D-1	Bush
		4	5	Bush	S-1	Moriarty
		5	5	Moriarty	SB	---
		6	8	Cobb	SF-1	Crawford
		7	8	Kavanagh	T-2	McKee
		8	8	Heilmann	T-2	McKee
		9	9	Moriarty	S-1	Veach

		10	9	Cobb	S-1	Kavanagh
		11	9	Veach	SF-1	Heilmann
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
8-25	WAS*	1	3	Reynolds	S-1	Cobb
		2	3	Bush (1st)	S + E-1	(Cobb)
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
8-26	BOS*	1	3	Bush (2nd)	FCFO + E-2	(Cobb)
		2	6	Cobb	W-1	Heilmann
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
8-27	BOS*	1	8	Kavanagh	S-1	Heilmann
		2	8	Moriarty	S-1	Vitt
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
8-28	BOS*	1	8	Bush	D-2	Cobb
		2	8	Vitt	D-2	Cobb
		3	8	Cobb (2nd)	(2-out) SOE-6 (mf)	(Crawford)
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
8-29	NY*	1	3	Coveleski (3rd)	SOE-6 (wth)	(Bush)
		2	6	Cobb	FCFO-1	Veach
		3	8	Cobb	S-1	Crawford
		4	8	Crawford	HR-2	Veach
		5	8	Veach	HR-2	Veach
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
8-31 (1)	NY*	1	6	Cobb	S-1	Burns
		2	6	Veach	S-1	Moriarty
		3	6	Burns	SB	—
		4	6	Moriarty	D-1	Dauss
		5	7	Cobb	T-1	Crawford
		6	7	Crawford	SF-1	Veach
		7	13	Bush	HR-3	Crawford
		8	13	Cobb	HR-3	Crawford
		9	13	Crawford	HR-3	Crawford
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
8-31 (2)	NY*	1	6	Vitt	D-1	Cobb

		2	6	Cobb	D-1	Crawford
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
9-1	NY*	1	2	Veach	SF-1	Stanage
		2	3	Bush	S-1	Cobb
		3	3	Vitt	S-1	Crawford
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
9-2	NY*	1	4	Vitt	SF-1	Crawford
		2	6	Bush	GO-1	Crawford
		3	6	Vitt	D-3	Burns
		4	6	Cobb	D-3	Burns
		5	6	Veach	D-3	Burns
		6	7	Heilmann	S-1	Vitt
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
9-4	STL	1	1	Cobb	S-1	Crawford
		2	4	Crawford	SF-1	Veach
		3	5	Coveleski	S-2	Crawford
		4	5	Vitt	S-2	Crawford
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
9-5	STL	---	---	---	---	---
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
9-6	STL	1	1	Vitt	D-1 OR OUT-1 OR S-2	Cobb OR Crawford OR Veach
		2	1	Cobb	S-1 or S-2 OR S-1	Veach OR Burns
		3	4	Crawford	T-2	Moriarty
		4	4	Burns	T-2	Moriarty
		5	4	Moriarty	S-1	Stanage
		6	4	Stanage	W-1	Cobb
		7	4	Cavet	T-3	Crawford
		8	4	Vitt	T-3	Crawford
		9	4	Cobb	T-3	Crawford
		10	4	Crawford	T + E-6 (mc)	(Crawford)

		11	5	Burns	S-1 OR OUT-1 OR S-1 OR S-1	Moriarty OR Stanage OR Bush OR Vitt
		12	7	Bush	S-1 OR S-1 or S-2 OR OUT-1	Vitt OR Cobb OR Crawford
		13	7	Vitt	S-1 OR OUT-1	Cobb OR Crawford
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
9-7 (1)	CHI	1	6	Dubuc	S-2	Cobb
		2	6	Bush	S-2	Cobb
		3	6	Vitt	WP	---
		4	6	Crawford	S + E-1	(Burns)
		5	8	Crawford	S-1	Veach
		6	12	Bush	S-2	Crawford
		7	12	Cobb	S-2	Crawford
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
9-7 (2)	CHI	1	1	Vitt	T-2	Crawford
		2	1	Cobb	T-2	Crawford
		3	1	Crawford	T + E-7	(Crawford)
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
9-8	CHI	1	1	Bush	S-1	Cobb
		2	2	Burns	SF-1	Moriarty
		3	2	Stanage (2nd)	(2-out) SOE-f (fg)	(Bush)
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
9-11	CHI*	1	1	Cobb	S-1	Crawford
		2	2	Heilmann	S-1	Stanage
		3	2	Stanage	S-1	Bush
		4	3	Heilmann	S-1	Moriarty
		5	6	Dauss	S-1	Cobb
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
9-12	CHI*	1	4	Burns	D-1	Moriarty

		2	4	Moriarty	S-1	Stanage
		3	5	Vitt (1st)	BS + E-1	(Cobb)
		4	5	Cobb	GO-1	Veach
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
9-13	CHI*	1	9	Cobb	S-1	Veach
		2	9	Crawford (1st)	S + E-9	(Veach)
		3	9	Veach	S-1	Burns
		4	9	Burns	S-1	Moriarty
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
9-14	CLE*	1	1	Vitt	GO-1	Crawford
		2	1	Cobb	S-1	Veach
		3	1	Veach	D-1	Burns
		4	6	Burns	S-2	Coveleski
		5	6	Moriarty	S-2	Coveleski
		6	7	Cobb	GO-1	Veach
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
9-15	CLE*	1	3	Cobb	GDP-1	Veach
		2	4	Bush	SB + E-2	---
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
9-16	CLE*	1	2	Veach	FCFO-1	Moriarty
		2	5	McKee	sac-1	Bush
		3	7	McKee	S-1	Vitt
		4	7	Oldham	S-2	Cobb
		5	7	Bush	S-2	Cobb
		6	7	Vitt (1st)	S + E-8	(Cobb)
		7	7	Cobb (2nd)	GO-1	Crawford
		8	8	Moriarty	D-1	Oldham
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
9-17	PHI	1	1	Bush	S-1	Cobb
		2	1	Cobb	SF-1	Crawford
		3	2	Burns	S-1	Moriarty
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
9-18	PHI	1	1	Vitt	D-2	Veach

		2	1	Crawford	D-2	Veach
		3	1	Veach	S-1	Burns
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
9-19	PHI	1	1	Bush	S-1	Cobb
		2	1	Cobb	SF-1	Veach
		3	6	Vitt	S-1	Cobb
		4	7	Burns	HR-1	Burns
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
9-20 (1)	BOS	1	3	Vitt	T-1	Cobb
		2	8	Burns	GO-1	Bush
		3	9	Cobb (1st)	SB + E-6 + E-7	---
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
9-20 (2)	BOS	1	1	Bush	D-1	Cobb
		2	7	Kavanagh	WP	---
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
9-21	BOS	1	5	Burns (2nd)	SOE-3 (wtf)	(McKee)
		2	5	Moriarty	D-2	Dauss
		3	5	McKee	D-2	Dauss
		4	5	Dauss (2nd)	BS + E-2	(Bush)
		5	5	Bush	S-1	Cobb
		6	5	Cobb	S-1	Veach
		7	8	Veach	GO-1	Dauss
		8	8	Burns	(2-out) SOE-4 (wtf)	(Bush)
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
9-22 (1)	BOS	1	5	Coveleski	T-2	Cobb
		2	5	Vitt	T-2	Cobb
		3	5	Cobb	SF-1	Crawford
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
9-22 (2)	BOS	---	---	---	---	---
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
9-25	NY	1	1	Bush	GO-1	Crawford
		2	5	McKee	S-1	Cobb
		3	8	Crawford	S-1	Veach

		4	8	Veach	S-1	McKee
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
9-26 (1)	NY	1	1	Dauss	T-1	Bush
		2	6	Vitt	S-1	Veach
		3	6	Crawford	D-1	Heilmann
		4	6	Veach	S-2	Moriarty
		5	6	Heilmann	S-2	Moriarty
		6	7	Bush	SF-1	Crawford
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
9-26 (2)	NY	1	2	Crawford	SF-1	Veach
		2	5	Veach	SF-1	Moriarty
		3	6	Dubuc	WP	---
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
9-27	WAS	1	4	Cobb	WP	---
		2	4	Veach	S-1	Heilmann
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
9-28	WAS	1	1	Bush	GO-1	Vitt
		2	2	Moriarty	S-1	Vitt
		3	6	Veach	S-1	Moriarty
		4	6	Heilmann (2nd)	sac + E-5 (wtf)	(Stanage)
		5	6	Moriarty (1st)	sac + E-5 (wtf)	(Stanage)
		6	6	Stanage	S-1	Bush
		7	7	Crawford (2nd)	BS + E-1	(Heilmann)
		8	7	Heilmann	SB	---
		9	7	Moriarty	W-1	Vitt
		10	7	Coveleski	S-2	Cobb
		11	7	Bush	S-2	Cobb
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
9-29	STL*	1	7	High	GO-1	Kavanagh
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
9-30	STL*	1	1	Cobb	D-1	Crawford
		2	1	Crawford	S-1	Veach
		3	1	Veach	T-1	Kavanagh

		4	3	Cobb	SB	---
		5	3	Crawford	SB + WP	---
		6	7	Vitt	S-2	Veach
		7	7	Cobb	S-2	Veach
		8	7	Crawford	S-1	Moriarty
		9	8	Bush	WP	---
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
10-1	STL*	1	1	Bush	S-1	Cobb
		2	6	Vitt	T-1	Cobb
		3	6	Cobb	GO-1	Veach
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
10-3	CLE	1	3	Vitt	S-1	Crawford
		2	3	Cobb	S-1	Veach
		3	5	Veach	D-1	Kavanagh
		4	9	Dubuc (3rd)	(0-out) SOE-1 (fg)	(Cobb)
		5	9	Bush	WP	---
		6	9	Vitt	S-1	Crawford
Date	OPP	R #	Inn	R-Scorer	R-Event	R-Batter
10-4	CLE	1	3	Bush	S-1 OR OUT-1	Cobb OR Crawford
		2	4	Veach	S-1 OR S-1	Moriarty OR Stanage
		3	6	Cobb	HR-1	Cobb
		4	7	Moriarty	S-1	Dubuc
		5	7	Stanage	W-1	Cobb
		6	7	Dubuc (3rd)	(1-out) 1-RBI SOE-4 (fg)	Crawford
		7	7	Cobb (2nd)	FCFO-1	Veach
		8	7	Crawford (3rd)	E-1 (wts)	---
		9	7	Veach (2nd)	E-1 (wts)	---
		10	7	Kavanagh	WP OR T-1	--- OR Moriarty
		11	7	Moriarty	WP OR S-1	--- OR Stanage

Appendix 2: Analysis of Games With “Either-Or” RBIs — September 6 and October 4.

Appendix 2A: Analysis of “Either-Or” RBI Game on September 6, 1914.

September 6, 1914 — Detroit vs. St. Louis — Detroit scored 13 runs

First Inning — Detroit scored 2 runs

Detroit Free Press (DFP) — “In the first Detroit got two [runs] on Vitt’s single, Cobb’s double, and a blow by Veach.”

Detroit Journal (DJ), *Detroit News (DN)*, *Detroit Times (DT)*, *St. Louis Globe-Democrat (SLGD)*, *St. Louis Post-Dispatch (SLPD)*, *St. Louis Republic (SLREP)* — Nothing at all.

From the limited information given in the *DFP* account all one can confidently conclude is that it appears that Vitt and Cobb scored the two first-inning runs. The Tigers game-starting batting order, according to the box scores given in the various newspaper accounts, was Bush-Vitt-Cobb-Crawford-Veach-Burns-Moriarty-Stanage-Cavet.

Thus, here are four reasonable scenarios which can be contrived to deal with the “who-batted-in-whom?” question for the two first-inning runs:

- (1) Bush was retired for the first out. Vitt singled. Cobb doubled, batting in Vitt and taking third on the throw-in. Crawford was retired for the second out, batting in Cobb. Veach singled. Burns was retired for the third out, ending the inning. ==> RBIs: Cobb 1, Crawford 1.
- (2) Bush was retired for the first out. Vitt singled. Cobb doubled, batting in Vitt. Crawford was retired for the second out. Veach singled, batting in Cobb. Burns was retired for the third out. ==> RBIs: Cobb 1, Veach 1.
- (3) Bush was retired for the first out. Vitt singled. Cobb doubled, advancing Vitt to third. Crawford was retired for the second out, batting in Vitt. Veach singled, batting in Cobb. Burns was retired for the third out. ==> RBIs: Crawford 1, Veach 1.
- (4) Bush was retired for the first out. Vitt singled. Cobb doubled, advancing Vitt to third. Crawford was retired for the second out, the runners holding their bases. Veach singled, batting in both Vitt and Cobb. Burns was retired for the third out. ==> RBIs: Veach 2.

From these four scenarios, the “either-or” RBI numbers are: Cobb (0 or 1); Crawford (0 or 1); and Veach (0 or 1 or 2). Other reasonable scenarios, also in complete accord with the official DBD records, can be devised for the two first-inning runs can be devised, as discussed later on.

Fourth Inning — Detroit scored 8 runs

DFP — “Crawford was first up in the Detroit fourth and was safe when his easy grounder seeped through Pratt. After Veach had been chucked out, Burns scratched a hit to third. Moriarty banged one to left center and both Shotton and Walker started for it. The ball hit Shotton on the ends of the fingers and again on the knee and he punted [it] a full 15 yards to the left-field foul line, two runs scoring and Moriarty going to third. Stanage and Cavet hit and Vitt’s walk filled the sacks after Bush had flied. Cobb viewed four bad ones, forcing Stanage [home] and then came Crawford with his three-bagger to right. Austin let the ball get away when it was thrown to him and Crawford loped the rest of the way in. Veach obliged by letting them put him out for the second time in the inning.” [NOTE: According to the official Day-By-Day records, Moriarty had two hits, one single and one triple; also, Shotton was not charged with any fielding errors.]

DJ — “Crawford singled through Pratt and Veach went out. Burns singled, putting Crawford on third. Moriarty’s fly got away from Shotton and bounced almost to the left field pavilion, Crawford and Burns scoring, while Moriarty pulled up at third. Stanage and Cavet singled, Moriarty scoring. Bush flied out and Vitt walked, filling the bases. Cobb walked, putting Stanage across and Crawford’s three-base smash to right cleaned the bases. Veach grounded out for the second time in the inning.” [NOTE: According to the official Day-By-Day records, Moriarty had two hits, one single and one triple; also, Shotton was not charged with any fielding errors.]

DN — “Crawford singled through Pratt. Veach grounded out to Weilman. Burns bunted a single to Austin. Moriarty tripled off Shotton’s shins, Crawford and Burns scoring. Stanage singled to left, scoring Moriarty. Cavet singled to right. Stanage took third on Bush’s fly to Williams. Vitt walked, filling the bases. Cobb walked, forcing Stanage in. With [the] bases full Crawford tripled over Williams’ head in right, Cavet, Vitt, and Cobb scoring. Pratt made a wild throw to third to cut off Crawford and he also scored. Veach grounded out for the second time during the inning.”

DT, *SLGD*, *SLPD* — Nothing at all.

St. Louis Republic (SLREP) — “Crawford opened the fourth with a single. Veach sacrificed perfectly. Austin committed a fumble on Burns’ grounder and Crawford moved to third. Shotton made a plain muff of Moriarty’s fly, and as the ball rolled away from him both Crawford and Burns scored. Moriarty took third. Stanager singled, scoring Moriarty, and Cavet also scored [should be ‘singled’]. Bush flied to Williams and Stanager went to third on the throw-in. Vitt walked, filling the bases. Cobb walked, forcing home Stanager. Crawford tripled and three runs counted ahead of him. On a delayed throw-in Crawford scored, which brought the total to eight runs. Veach ended the burlesque with a bounder to Pratt.” [NOTE: According to the official Day-By-Day records, Moriarty had two hits, one single and one triple; also, Shotton was not charged with any fielding errors; also, Veach was not shown with any sacrifice hits.]

From the very detailed descriptions provided in several newspaper accounts — especially the batter-by-batter play-by-play given in the *DN* account — it is known with 100% confidence who scored each of the eight runs and who, if anyone, batted in each of the eight runs: (1 and 2) Crawford and Burns scored on a 2-RBI triple by Moriarty; (3) Moriarty scored on a 1-RBI single by Stanager; (4) Stanager scored on a 1-RBI bases-loaded walk to Cobb; (5, 6, and 7) Cavet, Vitt, and Cobb scored on a 3-RBI triple by Crawford; (8) Crawford scored on his triple coupled with a fielding error by the shortstop Pratt.

Fifth Inning — Detroit scored 1 run

DFP — Nothing at all (except that it was mentioned in a sidebar that Cavet struck out in the fifth inning batting left-handed and right-handed in the seventh inning).

DJ, DN, DT, SLGD, SLPD, SLREP — Nothing at all.

It might seem that, since the various newspaper accounts provided no information about the fifth-inning run, one is left with a complete void with respect to identifying who scored the run and who might have batted in the run. Fortunately, however, that is not the case, as indicated below.

Seventh Inning — Detroit scored 2 runs

DFP — Nothing at all (except that it was mentioned in a sidebar that Cavet struck out in the fifth inning batting left-handed and right-handed in the seventh inning).

DJ, DN, DT, SLGD, SLPD, SLREP — Nothing at all.

It might seem that, since the various newspaper accounts provided no information about the two seventh-inning runs, one is left with a complete void with respect to identifying who scored the runs and who might have batted in the runs. Fortunately, however, that is not the case, as indicated below.

SUMMARY of the 13 runs scored by the Tigers

- 1 (First Inning) — Vitt scored on a 1-RBI double by Cobb ... OR ... on a 1-RBI out by Crawford ... OR ... on a 2-RBI single by Veach ... OR ...
- 2 (First Inning) — Cobb scored on a 1-RBI out by Crawford ... OR ... on a 1-RBI or 2-RBI single by Veach ... OR ...
- 3 (Fourth Inning) — Crawford scored on a 2-RBI triple by Moriarty.
- 4 (Fourth Inning) — Burns scored on a 2-RBI triple by Moriarty.
- 5 (Fourth Inning) — Moriarty scored on a 1-RBI single by Stanager.
- 6 (Fourth Inning) — Stanager scored on a 1-RBI bases-loaded walk to Cobb.
- 7 (Fourth Inning) — Cavet scored on a 3-RBI triple by Crawford.
- 8 (Fourth Inning) — Vitt scored on a 3-RBI triple by Crawford.
- 9 (Fourth Inning) — Cobb scored on a 3-RBI triple by Crawford.
- 10 (Fourth Inning) — Crawford scored on his triple coupled with a fielding error (wild throw to third) by the second baseman Pratt.
- 11 (Fifth Inning) — ???... see below for possibilities.
- 12 (Seventh Inning) — ??? ... see below for possibilities.
- 13 (Seventh Inning) — ??? ... see below for possibilities.

While none of the various newspaper accounts provided any details for the one run scored in the fifth inning and the two runs scored in the seventh inning, one is still able to deduce who scored the runs. Fortunately, because of the detailed information given for the two runs scored in the first inning and the eight runs scored in the fourth inning, we know for certain who scored those ten runs — Vitt (2), Cobb (2), Burns (1), Moriarty (1), Stanager (1), Cavet (1), and Crawford (2). And, from the runs-scored numbers shown on the official Day-By-Day records (and the newspaper box scores), we know the total runs-scored numbers for each of the players — Vitt (3), Cobb (2), Burns (2), Moriarty (1), Stanager (1), Cavet (1), Crawford (2), and Bush (1). Thus, we can deduce with 100% confidence who scored the three runs tallied in the fifth and seventh innings — alphabetically, Burns (1), Bush (1),

and Vitt (1). Moreover, because of the detailed batter-by-batter information given for the fourth inning, we know for certain that Veach (who had the fifth spot in the batting lineup) made the final out in the fourth inning. Therefore, we know for certain that Burns (who occupied the sixth slot in the batting order) led off the fifth inning. And since we know that Bush and Vitt occupied the first and second positions, respectively, in the batting order, we know for certain that Burns must have scored the fifth-inning run. [For Bush to have scored the fifth-inning run, Burns and the seventh-, eighth-, and ninth-slotted batters (Moriarty, Stanage, and Cavet, respectively) would have to have been retired in the fifth before Bush could have gotten on base ... i.e., the fifth inning would have ended before Bush could have gotten on base and eventually scored. Therefore, it is logistically impossible for Bush (as well as Vitt) to have scored the fifth-inning run. And, therefore, Burns must have scored the fifth-inning run.] And, therefore, Bush and Vitt must have scored the two seventh-inning runs.

With regard to who, if anyone, batted in Burns in the fifth inning, all one can do is give “either-or” RBI credit. Likewise for the seventh-inning runs scored by Bush and Vitt. Logistically, for a player to get on base with nobody out and then score, one of only the five players positioned immediately after him in the batting order can bat him in. If, however, a player gets on base with one out and then scores, one of only the next four players can drive him home. And, if a player gets on base with two out and then scores, one of only the next three batters can knock him across the plate. Therefore, for the fifth-inning run scored by Burns, who led off the frame, the five players who could have batted him home were Moriarty or Stanage or Cavet or Bush or Vitt. However, from the *DFP* sidebar information, we know that Cavet struck out (batting left-handed) in the fifth inning. Thus, Cavet could not have batted in Burns. For the two seventh-inning runs, we know from the *DFP* sidebar that Cavet struck out (batting right-handed). Thus, if Cavet led off the seventh inning, one of the four players positioned immediately after Bush in the batting order could have knocked him — Vitt or Cobb or Crawford or Veach. If, however, Stanage led off the seventh inning (and was necessarily retired, either directly or subsequently, on the basepath), then Vitt or Cobb or Crawford could have batted Bush home. Similarly for the seventh-inning run scored by Vitt: If Cavet led off the seventh stanza, the four players who logistically could have plated him were Cobb or Crawford or Veach or Burns. If, however, Stanage led off the seventh session, then only Cobb or Crawford or Veach could have batted him across the plate. It is of paramount importance, however, to understand that these logistical conclusions are not the whole story — because there may be other aspects of the game that further limit the players who could have batted in Burns in the fifth inning and Bush and/or Vitt in the seventh inning.

For instance, here is an absolute fact which needs to be taken into account. According to the newspaper box scores and the official DBD records, Moriarty (who occupied the seventh slot in the batting order) was the very last player to bat for the Tigers in the game, i.e., in the bottom of the eighth inning (because Detroit did not bat in the bottom of the ninth inning). Moriarty had five completed plate appearances: five at bats, no walks, no sacrifices, and he was not hit by any pitched balls. Each of the players who followed Moriarty in the batting lineup — Stanage (in the eighth spot) and Cavet (in the ninth position) — had four completed plate appearances: four at bats, no walks, no sacrifices, and no hit-by-pitches. At least three players must have batted in the eighth inning — Moriarty and at least the two players who immediately preceded him in the batting order — Burns (in the sixth slot) and Veach (in the fifth spot). Thus, neither Veach nor Burns nor Moriarty could have batted in the seventh inning. And, therefore, none of them could have batted in a run in the seventh inning. So, combining this factual information with the *a priori* logistics for the seventh-inning runs results in the following RBI possibilities: Bush could have been batted in by Vitt or by Cobb or by Crawford, *but not by Veach*; Vitt could have been batted in by Cobb or by Crawford, *but not by Veach or by Burns*.

There are several other facts which need to be considered in trying to deduce the identities of the players who may have batted in Burns, Bush, and Vitt. For example, (a) for the game, the Tigers had six men left on base; (b) Weillman, the Browns starting pitcher, hurled the first four innings, giving up ten hits and ten runs (nine earned runs) and issuing two walks; (c) Leverenz, the only other St. Louis pitcher, tossed the final four innings, giving up six hits, three runs (one earned run) and issuing two walks; (d) since Crawford led off the fourth inning, Cobb must have been the last player to have had a completed plate appearance in the third inning; (e) etc. All of these facts are included in the analysis that follows.

Let’s mention at the outset that the intent of this analysis is *not* to proclaim what actually happened in the any of the innings (except the fourth, for which we already know exactly what happened). The intent is come up with sensible scenarios that could have happened and which are in complete accord with the official DBD statistics AND which yield RBI numbers that are in alignment with the *a priori* logistics. Also, it is not the intent of the analysis to come up with every possible scenario — the objective is to contrive one reasonable (i.e., not far-fetched) scenario for each player identified by the *a priori* logistics as a possible RBI man for the fifth-inning run scored by Burns and the seventh-inning runs scored by Bush and Vitt.

OK, let’s begin:

For Crawford to lead off the fourth inning, Cobb had to be the final batter in the third inning.

And, we know that, since Veach singled in the first inning (with two outs), Burns could have had a completed plate appearance (perhaps making/causing the final out) in the first inning. Let’s, for the time being, assume that Burns did bat in the first inning. [**ASSUMPTION #1**]

Thus, considering the batting lineup, there were at most six players with completed plate appearances after Burns batted in the first inning and before Crawford led off the fourth inning. Those six players were Moriarty, Stanage, Cavet, Bush, Vitt, and Cobb.

Since there must have been a total of six outs combined in the second and third innings, each of those six players must have ultimately been retired — Moriarty, Stanage, and Cavet in the second inning and Bush, Vitt, and Cobb in the third inning.

And, from the descriptions given in the various newspaper accounts, we know for certain the eleven players who batted in the fourth inning.

Fortunately (from an analysis standpoint), St. Louis used two pitchers in the game — Weilman hurled the first four innings and Leverenz tossed the final four innings. According to the official DBD records, we know that Weilman gave up ten hits and issued two walks.

From the descriptions given in the newspaper accounts for the first and fourth innings, we know that nine of the ten hits off Weilman were made in those two innings — three hits in the first frame (by Vitt, Cobb, and Veach) and six hits in the fourth frame (by Crawford, Burns, Moriarty, Stanage, Cavet, and Crawford, again). Therefore, one of the six players who had plate appearances in the second and third innings got a hit (a single) and was ultimately retired on the basepath.

For the second inning, the three players with plate appearances were Moriarty, Stanage, and Cavet. According to the official DBD records, for the entire game, Moriarty had two hits and Stanage and Cavet each had one hit. According to the descriptions given in the newspaper accounts, Moriarty and Stanage and Cavet each had one hit in the fourth inning. Therefore, in the second inning, neither Stanage nor Cavet got a hit. Thus, Moriarty could have collected his other hit in the second inning; or he could have been retired in the second inning (and thereby collected his other hit in some other inning). For the time being, let's assume that Moriarty was retired in the second inning. [**ASSUMPTION #2**] Thus, the other hit off Weilman was made in the third inning.

For the third inning, the three players with plate appearances were Bush, Vitt, and Cobb, who, for the entire game, had one, two, and three hits, respectively. Since Cobb was the final batter of the third inning, it's not unlikely that he would have made or caused the third out. Therefore (assuming that Cobb did not get a hit in the third inning [**ASSUMPTION #3**], the third-inning hit was made by either Bush or Vitt. For the time being we'll hypothesize that Vitt got the third-inning hit. [**ASSUMPTION #4**] But, Vitt had to have been retired on the basepath. Vitt's retirement could have been accomplished in any of several ways — for example, he could have been put out (a) trying to stretch his single into a double, or (b) attempting to steal second base, or (c) by being caught napping, or (d) by being one of the outs of double play, etc. Since, according to the official DBD records, the Browns executed one double play in the game, let's, for the sake of simplicity, assume that Cobb hit into the 3-6 double play pulled by St. Louis, with Vitt being one of the two outs. [**ASSUMPTION #5**]

So, now, we have a reasonable batter-by-batter account of the first four innings which is in complete accord with the official DBD records and the descriptions given in the various newspaper accounts.

Let's now move on to the final four innings of the game. Leverenz pitched those four innings and faced a total of 20 batters, the first batter being Burns in the fifth inning and the last player being Moriarty in the eighth inning. From the official DBD records we know that Leverenz gave up six hits and issued two walks. From the official DBD records we know that four Detroit players received bases on balls, one walk each — Bush, Cobb, Crawford, and Vitt. And, from the descriptions of the fourth inning given in the various newspaper accounts, we know that Cobb and Vitt walked in the fourth inning. Therefore, we know that Bush and Crawford received the two free passes issued by Leverenz.

Also, from the official DBD records, we know that Detroit collected 16 hits in the game, distributed among the players as follows: Baker (0), Burns (2), Bush (1), Cavet (1), Cobb (3), Crawford (2), Heilmann (0), High (0), Moriarty (2), Stanage (1), Veach (2), and Vitt (2). And, as discussed above, we know the players who collected the ten hits that were made off Weilman in the first four innings (including Vitt's third-inning hit, according to **ASSUMPTION #5**). Therefore, doing the math, we know that the hits surrendered by Leverenz were collected by Burns (1), Bush (1), Cobb (2), Moriarty (1), and Veach (1).

Let's now continue our analysis of the final four innings by listing the 20 players Leverenz faced, arbitrarily allocating (for the time being) five players to each of the four innings. And let's include the information that we know for certain, such as that Burns got on base leading off in the fifth inning and subsequently scored; likewise for Bush and Vitt in the seventh inning. And, let's include the outs made by Cavet [striking out in the fifth inning (batting left handed) and in the seventh inning (batting right handed)]. This is the **FIRST PASS**:

FIRST PASS

Fifth Inning

Burns **ON, subsequently scored.**
Moriarty
Stanage
Cavet **OUT**
Bush

Sixth Inning

Vitt
Cobb
Crawford
Veach
Burns

Seventh Inning

Moriarty
Stanage
Cavet **OUT**
Bush **ON, subsequently scored.**
Vitt **ON, subsequently scored.**

Eighth Inning

Cobb
Crawford
Veach
Burns
Moriarty

Now, let's see what else we know that we can add to the **FIRST PASS**:

We know that Moriarty was the final batter in the eighth inning — the last inning in which the Tigers batted. Therefore, he made or caused the third out. For simplicity, we'll show him making the final out in the second pass.

We know that Stanage had no hits in the final four innings. Thus, Stanage made or caused outs in his two plate appearances in the final four innings. For simplicity, we'll consider them outs and include them in the second pass.

We know that Cobb had two hits (both singles) in the final four innings. So, they're included in the second pass.

We know that Bush had one walk and one hit (a single) in the final four innings. So, they're included in the second pass, first the single and then the walk (although that order can be reversed if needed).

We know that Crawford had no hits in the final four innings, but he did have one walk. Thus, in his two plate appearances in the final four innings, Crawford made or caused one out and drew a walk. For the time being let's assume that he received his walk in his first final-four-innings plate appearance and made or caused an out in his last final-four-innings plate appearance. [**ASSUMPTION #6**]

We know, similarly, that Veach had one hit in the final four innings and that he also made or caused one out. For the time being, let's assume that he collected his hit in his first final-four-innings plate appearance and made or caused an out in his last final-four-innings plate appearance. [**ASSUMPTION #7**]

So, incorporating these items (shown in boldface) affords the **SECOND PASS**:

SECOND PASS

FIFTH INNING

Burns **ON, subsequently scored.**
Moriarty
Stanage **OUT**
Cavet **OUT**
Bush **single**

SIXTH INNING

Vitt

Cobb **single**
Crawford **walk**
Veach **single**
Burns

SEVENTH INNING

Moriarty
Stanage **OUT**
Cavet **OUT**
Bush **walk**; subsequently scored.
Vitt **ON**, subsequently scored.

EIGHTH INNING

Cobb **single**
Crawford **OUT**
Veach **OUT**
Burns
Moriarty **OUT-3**

At this point, we need to add the other hits made by Burns and Moriarty (i.e., the hits not made in the fourth inning). And, since we have only seven of the twelve outs made in the final four innings, we also have to include five outs. In addition, according to the official DBD records, we know that two of the three runs allowed by Leverenz were unearned runs. So, we have to accommodate that as well.

Since Burns has to get on base in the fifth inning in order to score, let's assume Burns collected his other hit in the fifth inning. [**ASSUMPTION #8**] That leads to Burns having made or caused an out in each of his other two final-four-innings plate appearances.

Since two outs are already known for the fifth inning (by Stanage and by Cavet), it's seems very unlikely that Moriarty would have made an out, since that would mean that Burns would have scored from first base on two outs, one by Moriarty and the other by Stanage. So, let's assume that Moriarty collected his other hit in the fifth inning. [**ASSUMPTION #9**] That, leads to Moriarty having made or caused outs in each of his other two final-four-innings plate appearances (the last one having already been determined to be the final out of the eighth inning). Also, it is pointed out that the official DBD records show that Moriarty was credited with one stolen base. Of the two times for which we know for certain that Moriarty got on base (i.e., via his fourth-inning triple and his assumed fifth-inning single), only the fifth-inning single is amenable with Moriarty stealing a base. So, we'll include that in the fifth-inning hypothesis.

OK, incorporating these assumptions (shown in boldface) generates the **THIRD PASS**:

THIRD PASS

FIFTH INNING

Burns **single**, subsequently scored.
Moriarty **single; stolen base**
Stanage **OUT**
Cavet **OUT**
Bush **single**

SIXTH INNING

Vitt
Cobb **single**
Crawford **walk**
Veach **single**
Burns **OUT**

SEVENTH INNING

Moriarty **OUT**
Stanage **OUT**
Cavet **OUT**
Bush **walk**; subsequently scored.
Vitt **ON**, subsequently scored.

EIGHTH INNING

Cobb	single
Crawford	OUT
Veach	OUT
Burns	OUT
Moriarty	OUT-3

At this point, it is clear that some reorganization of the innings (which initially were arbitrarily set up with five players in each of the four final innings) needs to be done — for example, presently there are four outs shown in the eighth inning. Thus, proceeding from the eighth inning, the three outs of the eighth inning were made by by Veach, Burns, and Moriarty. And, the three outs of the seventh inning were made by Stanage, Cavet, and Crawford. And, it looks like the last two outs of the sixth inning were made by Burns and Moriarty. Let's now revise the **THIRD PASS** to accommodate this information to produce the **FOURTH PASS**:

FOURTH PASS

FIFTH INNING

Burns	single, subsequently scored.
Moriarty	single; stolen base
Stanage	OUT
Cavet	OUT
Bush	single

SIXTH INNING

Vitt	
Cobb	single
Crawford	walk
Veach	single
Burns	OUT
Moriarty	OUT

SEVENTH INNING

Stanage	OUT
Cavet	OUT
Bush	walk; subsequently scored.
Vitt	ON, subsequently scored.
Cobb	single
Crawford	OUT

EIGHTH INNING

Veach	OUT
Burns	OUT
Moriarty	OUT-3

Examination of the **FOURTH PASS** reveals a red flag: **ASSUMPTION #4** (Vitt getting his second/final hit in the third inning), requires that Vitt made or caused outs in each of his two final-four-innings plate appearances (i.e., in the sixth inning and the seventh inning). **BUT**, the fact is that Vitt scored a run as a consequence of his second (i.e., last) final-four-innings plate appearance — i.e., he must have gotten on base in the seventh inning. This situation, of course, is easily resolved by having Vitt get on base via a fielding error. And, according to the official DBD records, the Browns were charged with three fielding errors — one by Pratt and two by Wallace. We know from the descriptions given in the various newspaper accounts that Pratt committed his error in the fourth inning (permitting Crawford to score the eighth run of the frame). Thus, it can be reasonably assumed that Vitt got on base in the seventh inning on a fielding error by Wallace. [**ASSUMPTION #10**] That, of course, leads to Vitt having made or caused an out in his first final-four-innings plate appearance (i.e., in the sixth inning). Incorporating this information (shown in boldface) yields the **FIFTH PASS**:

FIFTH PASS

FIFTH INNING

Burns	single, subsequently scored.
Moriarty	single; stolen base
Stanage	OUT

Cavet OUT
Bush single

SIXTH INNING

Vitt **OUT**
Cobb single
Crawford walk
Veach single
Burns OUT
Moriarty OUT

SEVENTH INNING

Stanage OUT
Cavet OUT
Bush walk; subsequently scored.
Vitt **safe on error**; subsequently scored.
Cobb single
Crawford OUT

EIGHTH INNING

Veach OUT
Burns OUT
Moriarty OUT-3

At this point, everything looks fine with respect to the organization of the innings — EXCEPT that there are only two outs shown in the fifth inning. A reasonable way to deal with this is to have a runner retired on the basepath. There are various ways of accomplishing that. For instance, Bush could have been caught trying to steal second base. For simplicity, we'll assume that Bush was caught stealing.[**ASSUMPTION #11**] [NOTE: It is pointed out that "Caught Stealing" was not an officially recorded statistic in 1914. However, consistent with ASSUMPTION #11 that Bush was caught stealing is the fact that the Browns catcher, Agnew, was credited with one assist.] Also of major importance is the fact that with Vitt getting on base in the seventh inning via a fielding error, the runs that Bush and he scored were each unearned runs — because both of them were scored with two outs *after* the third out should have retired the side without scoring any runs. Therefore, the fifth-inning run scored by Burns must have been the earned run allowed by Leverenz. Incorporating this information (shown in boldface) produces the **SIXTH PASS:**

SIXTH PASS

FIFTH INNING

Burns single, subsequently scored (**earned run**).
Moriarty single; stolen base
Stanage **OUT-1**
Cavet **OUT-2**
Bush single; **caught stealing — OUT-3**

SIXTH INNING

Vitt **OUT-1**
Cobb single
Crawford walk
Veach single
Burns **OUT-2**
Moriarty **OUT-3**

SEVENTH INNING

Stanage **OUT-1**
Cavet **OUT-2**
Bush walk; subsequently scored (**unearned run**).
Vitt **safe on error**; subsequently scored (**unearned run**).
Cobb single
Crawford **OUT-3**

EIGHTH INNING

Veach	OUT-1
Burns	OUT-2
Moriarty	OUT-3

Finally, the last item from the official DBD records that needs to be dealt with is men “left on base” (LOB) — there having been six, according to the official DBD records. From the SIXTH PASS, there were five men left on base in the final four innings — Moriarty (5th inning); Cobb (6th); Crawford (6th); Veach (6th); and Cobb (7th). And, from the DFP description for the first inning (and ASSUMPTION #1), Veach was left on base in the first inning. The “LOB” information for the final four innings is included in the **SEVENTH PASS**:

SEVENTH PASS

FIFTH INNING

Burns	ON, subsequently scored.
Moriarty	single; stolen base; LOB
Stanage	OUT-1
Cavet	OUT-2
Bush	single; caught stealing — OUT-3

SIXTH INNING

Vitt	OUT-1
Cobb	single; LOB
Crawford	walk; LOB
Veach	single; LOB
Burns	OUT-2
Moriarty	OUT-3

SEVENTH INNING

Stanage	OUT-1
Cavet	OUT-2
Bush	walk; subsequently scored (unearned run).
Vitt	safe on error; subsequently scored (unearned run).
Cobb	single; LOB
Crawford	OUT-3

EIGHTH INNING

Veach	OUT-1
Burns	OUT-2
Moriarty	OUT-3

At this point, it appears that everything is in order the final four innings — i.e., the SEVENTH PASS, which may or may not reflect what actually took place in the final four innings, is, in combination with what we developed previously for the first four innings, in complete accord with the official DBD records. So, let’s see if we can now assign RBI credit for the runs scored by Burns, Bush, and Vitt. Let’s tackle the Burns run first. As pointed out previously, Burns could have been batted in, per the *a priori* logistics, by Moriarty or by Stanage or by Cavet or by Bush, or by Vitt. But Cavet was eliminated because he struck out (batting left handed). So, here are two not-unreasonable fifth-inning sequences that mesh with the SEVENTH PASS:

Sequence-5a — Burns singles. Moriarty singles, advancing Burns to third. Moriarty steals second base. Stanage is retired, batting in Burns (with an earned run) while Moriarty holds second base. Cavet strikes out. Bush singles, advancing Moriarty to third. Bush is caught attempting to steal second, ending the fifth inning. ==> 1 RBI for Stanage.

Sequence-5b — Burns singles. Moriarty singles advancing Burns to third. Moriarty steals second base. Stanage is retired, the runners holding their bases. Cavet strikes out. Bush singles, batting in Burns (with an earned run) and sending Moriarty to third base. Bush is caught trying to steal second, ending the fifth inning. ==> 1 RBI for Bush.

OK, at this point, we have Burns scoring (an earned run) on a 1-RBI out by Stanage ... OR ... on a 1-RBI single by Bush. That leaves the possibilities, according to *a priori* logistics, of Burns being batted in by Moriarty or by Vitt. We’ll deal with those possibilities later.

Moving on, now, to the seventh inning, according to the SEVENTH PASS, the first two players to bat in the seventh inning (Stanage and Cavet) were retired, effectively before Bush stepped in the batter's box. Therefore, logistically, Bush could have been batted in by one of only the next three players behind him in the batting order — i.e., by Vitt or by Cobb or by Crawford. A similar situation obtains for Vitt, who, as shown above, could have been batted in only by Cobb or by Crawford. With that preface, here are two not-unreasonable sequences for the two unearned runs scored by Bush and Vitt in the seventh inning:

Sequence-7a — Stanage is retired for the first out in the seventh inning. Cavet is retired (striking out, batting right handed) for the second out in the seventh inning. Bush walks. Vitt reaches second base via the two fielding errors committed in the game by shortstop Wallace (perhaps first on a muffed fly or grounder followed by a wild throw), Bush moving from first to third on the errors. Cobb singles, batting in both Bush and Vitt (both runs being unearned). Crawford is retired for the third. ==> 2 RBIs for Cobb.

Sequence-7b — Stanage is retired for the first out in the seventh inning. Cavet is retired (striking out, batting right handed) for the second out in the seventh inning. Bush walks. Vitt reaches first base via one of the two fielding errors committed in the game by shortstop Wallace, Bush moving from first to second (or third) on the play. Cobb singles, batting in Bush (with an unearned run) and sending Vitt to third; on the throw-in from the outfield, Wallace muffs the ball for an error (his second of two errors in the game) and Vitt also scores (an unearned run). Crawford is retired for the third out. ==>1 RBI for Cobb.

So, at this stage of the analysis, we have Bush scoring (an unearned run) on a 1-RBI or 2-RBI single by Cobb. That leaves the possibilities, according to a *priori* logistics, of Bush being batted in by Vitt or by Crawford. For the run scored by Vitt, Sequence-7a has him scoring (an unearned run) on a 2-RBI single by Cobb. That leaves the possibility, according to a *priori* logistics, of Vitt being batted in Crawford. We'll come back to those possibilities for Bush and Vitt later.

First, let's first put together a batter-by-batter play-by-play for the entire game to double-check that everything we have contrived is in sync with the various statistics provided in the official DBD records and the descriptions from the various newspaper accounts. Included in this entire-game play-by-play are four not-unreasonable sequences for the two first-inning runs based on the *DFP* description:

Sequence-1a — Bush was retired for the first out. Vitt singled. Cobb doubled, batting in Vitt, Cobb taking third on the throw home. Crawford was retired for the second out, Cobb scoring. Veach singled. Burns was retired for the third out, ending the inning. ==> RBIs: Cobb 1, Crawford 1.

Sequence-1b — Bush was retired for the first out. Vitt singled. Cobb doubled, batting in Vitt. Crawford was retired for the second out. Veach singled, batting in Cobb. Burns was retired for the third out, ending the inning. ==> RBIs: Cobb 1, Veach 1.

Sequence-1c — Bush was retired for the first out. Vitt singled. Cobb doubled, advancing Vitt to third. Crawford was retired for the second out, Vitt scoring. Veach singled, batting in Cobb. Burns was retired for the third out, ending the inning. ==> RBIs: Crawford 1, Veach 1.

Sequence-1d — Bush was retired for the first out. Vitt singled, advancing Vitt to third. Crawford was retired for the second out, the runners holding their bases. Vitt singled, batting in both Vitt and Cobb. Burns was retired for the third out, ending the inning. ==> RBIs: Veach 2.

Here's **PLAY-BY-PLAY (A)**:

PLAY-BY-PLAY (A)

FIRST INNING

Bush — OUT-1
Vitt — singled; subsequently scored (earned run) per Sequences-7a or 7b or 7c or 7d.
Cobb — doubled; subsequently scored (earned run) per Sequences-7a or 7b or 7c or 7d.
Crawford — OUT-2
Veach — singled; LOB
Burns — OUT-3

SECOND INNING

Moriarty — OUT-1
Stanage — OUT-2
Cavet — OUT-3

THIRD INNING

Bush — OUT-1
 Vitt — singled; retired on 3-6 DP (hit into by Cobb) — OUT-2
 Cobb — hit into 3-6 DP — OUT-3

FOURTH INNING

Crawford — singled; subsequently scored (earned run) on triple by Moriarty.
 Veach — OUT-1
 Burns — singled; subsequently scored (earned run) on triple by Moriarty.
 Moriarty — tripled, batting in Crawford and Burns; subsequently scored (earned run) on single by Stanage.
 Stanage — singled, batting in Moriarty; subsequently scored (earned run) on bases-loaded walk to Cobb.
 Cavet — singled, advancing Stanage to second; subsequently scored (earned run) on triple by Crawford.
 Bush — OUT-2, advancing Stanage to third.
 Vitt — walked, filling the bases; subsequently scored (earned run) on triple by Crawford.
 Cobb — walked, forcing in Stanage; subsequently scored (earned run) on triple by Crawford.
 Crawford — tripled, batting in Cavet, Vitt, and Cobb; subsequently scored (unearned run) on error by Pratt
 Veach — OUT-3

FIFTH INNING (Sequence-5a; Sequence-5b also works)

Burns — singled; subsequently scored (earned run) on out by Stanage.
 Moriarty — singled, advancing Burns to third; stole second; LOB
 Stanage — OUT-1, batting in Burns.
 Cavet — OUT-2
 Bush — singled, advancing Moriarty to third; caught stealing — OUT-3

SIXTH INNING

Vitt — OUT-1
 Cobb — singled; LOB
 Crawford — walked, moving Cobb to second; LOB
 Veach — singled, filling bases; LOB
 Burns — OUT-2
 Moriarty — OUT-3

SEVENTH INNING (Sequence-7a; Sequence-7b also works)

Stanage — OUT-1
 Cavet — OUT-2
 Bush — walked; subsequently scored (unearned run) on single by Cobb.
 Vitt — safe at second on 2 errors by Wallace; subsequently scored (unearned run) on single by Cobb.
 Cobb — singled, batting in Bush and Vitt; LOB
 Crawford — OUT-3

EIGHTH INNING

Veach — OUT-1
 Burns — OUT-2
 Moriarty — OUT-3

Mini-SUMMARY:

Fifth-Inning RBI — Stanage (out) ... OR ... Bush (single)
 Seventh-Inning RBIs — Cobb (single 1 or single 2)

Caught Napping (0)

Caught Stealing (1) — 5th (Bush, on second with two outs, thereby ending the inning).

And, here are the official DBD records and the associated events from PBP (A):

DETROIT BATTING and BASE RUNNING

Player	AB-R-H-W	Mes h (Y/N)	Details — outcome (inning)
--------	----------	-------------------	----------------------------

)	
Bush	4-1-1-1	Y	out (1st); out (3rd); out (4th); single & CS (5th); walk & RUN (7th)
Vitt	4-3-2-1	Y	single & RUN (1st); single+DP (3rd); walk & RUN (4th); out (6th); SOE & RUN (7th)
Cobb	4-2-3-1	Y	double & RUN (1st); out (3rd); walk & RUN (4th); single & LOB (6th); single & LOB (7th)
Crawford	4-2-2-1	Y	out (1st); single & RUN (4th); triple & RUN (4th); walk & LOB (6th); out (7th)
High	0-0-0-0	Y	DEFENSIVE REPLACEMENT in top of 9th — NO PLATE APPEARANCES
Veach	5-0-2-0	Y	single & LOB (1st); out (4th); out (4th); single & LOB (6th); out (8th)
Heilmann	0-0-0-0	Y	DEFENSIVE REPLACEMENT in top of 9th — NO PLATE APPEARANCES
Burns	5-2-2-0	Y	out (1st); single & RUN (4th); single & RUN (5th); out (6th); out (8th)
Moriarty	5-1-2-0	Y	out (2nd); triple & RUN (4th); single & stolen base & LOB (5th); out (6th); out (8th)
Stanage	4-1-1-0	Y	out (2nd); single & RUN (4th); out (5th); out (7th)
Baker	0-0-0-0	Y	DEFENSIVE REPLACEMENT in top of 9th — NO PLATE APPEARANCES
Cavet	4-1-1-0	Y	out (2nd); single & RUN (4th); out (5th); out (7th)

Doubles (1) ==> Cobb (1st inning)

Triples (2) ==> Moriarty (4th inning); Crawford (4th inning)

Left on Base (6) ==> Veach (1st); Moriarty (5th); Cobb (6th); Crawford (6th); Veach (6th); Cobb (7th)

Stolen Bases (1) ==> Moriarty (5th)

ST. LOUIS PITCHING and FIELDING

Weilman's Pitching Numbers

Statistic	Quantity	Month (Y/N)	Details — Inning (Players)
H	10	Y	1st (Vitt, Cobb, Veach); 3rd (Vitt); 4th (Crawford 2, Burns, Moriarty, Stanage, Cavet)
ER	9	Y	1st (Vitt, Cobb); 4th (Crawford, Burns, Moriarty, Stanage, Cavet, Vitt, Cobb)
UER	1	Y	4th (Crawford)
W	2	Y	4th (Vitt, Cobb)
SO	0	Y	NONE

Leverenz's Pitching Numbers

Statistic	Quantity	Month (Y/N)	Details — Inning (Players)
H	6	Y	5th (Burns, Moriarty, Bush); 6th (Cobb, Veach); 7th (Cobb)
ER	1	Y	5th (Burns)
UER	2	Y	7th (Bush, Vitt)
W	2	Y	6th (Crawford); 7th (Bush)

SO	2	Y	5th (Cavet); 7th (Cavet)
----	---	---	--------------------------

Double Plays (1) ==> Cobb (3rd)

Errors (3)

Pratt (1) ==> 4th (Crawford scored)

Wallace (2) ==> 7th (Vitt reached first); 7th (Vitt advanced to second)

NOTE: For the seventh inning, we have used both of Wallace's two fielding errors to place Vitt on second base (and Bush on third base). Alternatively, one could reasonably have Vitt reach second base on just one of Wallace's two errors. Wallace's other error could be used somewhere else ... for instance, in the the third inning, allowing Vitt to advance to second base before he was put out on the 3-6 double play that Cobb hit into.

As can be seen there is complete agreement between PBP (A) and the official DBD records. Moreover, numerous variants of PBP (A) can be envisioned which are also in 100% agreement with the pertinent official DBD records. For example, in the first inning, Burns could have caused the third out rather than making the third out — i.e., he could have forced Veach out at second base and, thereby, Burns would have been left on base, not Veach. Likewise in the sixth inning — Burns could have forced Cobb out at the plate and, thereby, he would have been left on base, not Cobb.

Now, let's proceed with the other RBI possibilities generated from the *a priori* logistics (in combination with the eighth-inning batter requirements) for the seventh-inning runs. (We'll address the fifth-inning run later.)

- From the *a priori* logistics plus the eighth-inning batter requirements we have that Bush could have been batted in by Vitt or by Cobb or by Crawford; Vitt could have been batted in by Cobb or by Crawford.
- From PBP (A) we have that Bush could have been batted in by Cobb; Vitt could have been batted in by Cobb.

Thus, at this point in the analysis, we have not yet devised a reasonable scenario (a) in which Bush could have been batted in by Vitt or by Crawford and (b) in which Vitt could have been batted in by Crawford. Starting with Sequence-7b, let's try some hit-or-miss scenarios to see what shakes out.

Sequence-7c — Stanage is retired for the first out in the seventh inning. Cavet is retired (striking out, batting right handed) for the second out in the seventh inning. Bush walks. Vitt reaches second base via a fielding error committed by shortstop Wallace, Bush moving from first to third on the play. Cobb singles, scoring Bush and sending Vitt to third base. Crawford singles, scoring Vitt, but Cobb or Crawford is subsequently retired, ending the inning. ==> While this scenario works for Crawford batting in Vitt, it could not have actually happened — because, according to the official DBD records, Crawford had two hits (one single and one triple) in the game, and, according to the descriptions given for the fourth-inning in several newspaper accounts, Crawford collected both of his hits in the fourth inning. Therefore, Crawford could not have singled in the seventh inning. So, this scenario is untenable and needs to be modified:

Sequence-7d — Stanage is retired for the first out in the seventh inning. Cavet is retired (striking out, batting right handed) for the second out in the seventh inning. Bush walks. Vitt is safe on the first of two fielding errors committed by shortstop Wallace, Bush moving from first to second on the play. Cobb singles, loading the bases. Crawford walks forcing in Bush (with an unearned run). ==> While this incomplete seventh-inning scenario works for Crawford "batting" in Bush, it does not provide for Vitt scoring — with the bases sill loaded (with Vitt on third), Veach then steps into the batter's box. To achieve a complete seventh-inning scenario, Vitt must somehow score without Veach completing a plate appearance. Since the official DBD records show that the St. Louis catcher, Agnew, did not have any passed balls, and that Leverenz did not throw any wild pitches nor commit any balks, there is no obvious or straightforward way for Vitt to score where Veach does not complete his plate appearance. It could be hypothesized that Vitt scored on the second of two errors by the shortstop Wallace on a failed pickoff play, and then have Cobb or Crawford retired on the same play (after Vitt crossed the plate) to end the inning. Rather than rely on such a complex play to have Crawford get an "either-or" RBI for the run scored by Bush, we'll seek an alternative approach. Let's make a wholesale change in the last four innings of PBP (A) and see what falls out:

Instead of having Bush being caught stealing to end the fifth inning, let's have Vitt bat in the fifth frame and make the final out. That has the domino effect of having Stanage make the final out in the sixth inning (instead of making the first out in the seventh inning). That, of course, means that Cavet would have batted first in the seventh stanza. But, Crawford must remain the final batter in the seventh session. Here are new sequences for the runs scored in the fifth [Sequence-5a —> Sequence-5c and Sequence-5b —> Sequence-5d] and seventh [Sequence-7a —> Sequence-7e] innings:

Sequence-5c — Burns singles. Moriarty singles, advancing Burns to third. Moriarty steals second base. Stanage is retired, batting in Burns (with an earned run) while Moriarty holds second base. Cavet strikes out. Bush singles, advancing Moriarty to third. Vitt is retired, ending the fifth inning. ==> 1 RBI for Stanage.

Sequence-5d — Burns singles. Moriarty singles advancing Burns to third. Moriarty steals second base. Stanage is retired, the runners holding their bases. Cavet strikes out. Bush singles, batting in Burns (with an earned run) and sending Moriarty to third base. Vitt is retired, ending the fifth inning. ==> 1 RBI for Bush.

Sequence-7e — Cavet is retired (striking out, batting right handed) for the first out in the seventh inning. Bush walks. Vitt reaches second base via the two fielding errors committed in the game by shortstop Wallace (perhaps first on a muffed fly or grounder followed by a wild throw), Bush moving from first to third on the errors. Cobb singles, batting in Bush (with an unearned run) and advancing Vitt to third. Crawford is retired, batting in Vitt (with an unearned run). Cobb is caught napping to end the inning. [NOTE: "Caught Napping" (CN) was not an officially recorded statistic in 1914. However, it is noted that, according to the official DBD records, Leverenz did have two assists, which is not inconsistent with him catching a runner napping.]

The incorporation of Sequence-7e — along with the modifications for the fifth and sixth innings — in PBP (A) produce **PLAY-BY-PLAY (B)**:

PLAY-BY-PLAY (B)

FIRST INNING [exactly the same as PBP (A)]

Bush — OUT-1
Vitt — singled; subsequently scored (earned run) per Sequences-7a or 7b or 7c or 7d.
Cobb — doubled; subsequently scored (earned run) per Sequences-7a or 7b or 7c or 7d.
Crawford — OUT-2
Veach — singled; LOB
Burns — OUT-3

SECOND INNING [exactly the same as PBP (A)]

Moriarty — OUT-1
Stanage — OUT-2
Cavet — OUT-3

THIRD INNING [exactly the same as PBP (A)]

Bush — OUT-1
Vitt — singled; retired on 3-6 DP (hit into by Cobb) — OUT-2
Cobb — hit into 3-6 DP — OUT-3

FOURTH INNING [exactly the same as PBP (A)]

Crawford — singled; subsequently scored (earned run) on triple by Moriarty.
Veach — OUT-1
Burns — singled; subsequently scored (earned run) on triple by Moriarty.
Moriarty — tripled, batting in Crawford and Burns; subsequently scored (earned run) on single by Stanage.
Stanage — singled, batting in Moriarty; subsequently scored (earned run) on bases-loaded walk to Cobb.
Cavet — singled, advancing Stanage to second; subsequently scored (earned run) on triple by Crawford.
Bush — OUT-2, advancing Stanage to third.
Vitt — walked, filling the bases; subsequently scored (earned run) on triple by Crawford.
Cobb — walked, forcing in Stanage; subsequently scored (earned run) on triple by Crawford.
Crawford — tripled, batting in Cavet, Vitt, and Cobb; subsequently scored on error by Pratt
Veach — OUT-3

FIFTH INNING (Sequence-5a —> Sequence-5c; Sequence-5b —> Sequence-5d also works)

Burns — singled; subsequently scored (earned run) on out by Stanage.
Moriarty — singled, advancing Burns to third; stole second; LOB
Stanage — OUT-1, batting in Burns.
Cavet — OUT-2
Bush — singled, advancing Moriarty to third; **LOB**
Vitt — OUT-3

SIXTH INNING [very similar to PBP (A)]

Cobb — singled; LOB

Crawford — walked, moving Cobb to second; LOB
 Veach — singled, filling bases; LOB
Burns — OUT-1
Moriarty — OUT-2
Stanage — OUT-3

SEVENTH INNING (Sequence-7a → Sequence-7e)

Cavet — **OUT-1**
 Bush — walked; subsequently scored (unearned run) on single by Cobb.
 Vitt — safe at second on 2 errors by Wallace; subsequently scored (unearned run) on **out by Crawford**.
 Cobb — singled, batting in Bush; **subsequently caught napping — OUT-3**
 Crawford — **OUT-2, batting in Vitt.**

EIGHTH INNING [exactly the same as PBP (A)]

Veach — OUT-1
 Burns — OUT-2
 Moriarty — OUT-3

That the runs scored by Bush and Vitt are unearned runs follows from the reconstruction of the inning in the absence of the error, “giving the benefit of the doubt always to the pitcher in determining which bases would have been reached had there been errorless play” as stated in the Official Rules of Major League Baseball: Cavet strikes out for the first out. Bush walks. Vitt is retired for the second out (instead of being safe on an error), Bush remaining at first base. Cobb singles, advancing Bush to second base. Crawford is retired for the third out, Bush remaining at second base and Cobb remaining at first base. Therefore, no runs would have scored had there been errorless play. Therefore, the two runs that actuality did score were both unearned runs.

- So, now, as shown in PBP (B), we can state that Vitt could have been batted in by Crawford [or, as already shown in PBP (A), by Cobb] in the seventh inning.

What about Bush being batted in by Crawford? For Crawford to bat in Bush, Vitt also must score on Crawford’s plate appearance — which cannot be a hit or a walk, but must be an out (or an event equivalent to an out). Modifying Sequence-7e, here goes —

Sequence-7f — Cavet is retired (striking out, batting right handed) for the first out in the seventh inning. Bush walks. Vitt is safe on the first of two fielding errors committed in the game by shortstop Wallace, Bush moving from first to second on the play. Cobb singles, loading the bases. Crawford hits into a fielder’s-choice-force-out, Cobb being retired at second, Bush scoring (an unearned run). But shortstop Wallace makes his second of two errors (perhaps trying for adouble play) permitting Vitt to score (an unearned run). Crawford was then caught napping or stealing, thereby ending the seventh inning before Veach could complete his plate appearance, thereby having him be the first-up batter in the eighth inning. ==>This scenario works for Crawford batting in Bush ... and it’s certainly not unreasonable. Indeed, a search of nearly 151,000 (released) Retrosheet PBP accounts — **graciously carried out by Tom Ruane** — revealed that out of 107,199 bases-loaded-with-one-out situations, the Sequence-7f “two-runs-scoring” play has happened at least 454 times and that the batter was credited with an RBI (for the first run only) 447 times (98.5%).

Incorporating Sequence-7f into into PBP (B) yields **PLAY-BY-PLAY (C)**:

PLAY-BY-PLAY (C)

FIRST INNING [exactly the same as PBPs (A and B)]

Bush — OUT-1
 Vitt — singled; subsequently scored (earned run) per Sequences-7a or 7b or 7c or 7d.
 Cobb — doubled; subsequently scored (earned run) per Sequences-7a or 7b or 7c or 7d.
 Crawford — OUT-2
 Veach — singled; LOB
 Burns — OUT-3

SECOND INNING [exactly the same as PBPs (A and B)]

Moriarty — OUT-1
 Stanage — OUT-2
 Cavet — OUT-3

THIRD INNING [exactly the same as PBPs (A and B)]

Bush — OUT-1
Vitt — singled; retired on 3-6 DP (hit into by Cobb) — OUT-2
Cobb — hit into 3-6 DP — OUT-3

FOURTH INNING [exactly the same as PBPs (A and B)]

Crawford — singled; subsequently scored (earned run) on triple by Moriarty.
Veach — OUT-1
Burns — singled; subsequently scored (earned run) on triple by Moriarty.
Moriarty — tripled, batting in Crawford and Burns; subsequently scored (earned run) on single by Stanage.
Stanage — singled, batting in Moriarty; subsequently scored (earned run) on bases-loaded walk to Cobb.
Cavet — singled, advancing Stanage to second; subsequently scored (earned run) on triple by Crawford.
Bush — OUT-2, advancing Stanage to third.
Vitt — walked, filling the bases; subsequently scored (earned run) on triple by Crawford.
Cobb — walked, forcing in Stanage; subsequently scored (earned run) on triple by Crawford.
Crawford — tripled, batting in Cavet, Vitt, and Cobb; subsequently scored on error by Pratt
Veach — OUT-3

FIFTH INNING [exactly the same as PBP (B)]

Burns — singled; subsequently scored (earned run) on out by Stanage.
Moriarty — singled, advancing Burns to third; stole second; LOB
Stanage — OUT-1, batting in Burns.
Cavet — OUT-2
Bush — singled, advancing Moriarty to third; LOB
Vitt — OUT-3

SIXTH INNING [exactly the same as PBP (B)]

Cobb — singled; LOB
Crawford — walked, moving Cobb to second; LOB
Veach — singled, filling bases; LOB
Burns — OUT-1
Moriarty — OUT-2
Stanage — OUT-3

SEVENTH INNING (Sequence-7e → Sequence-7f)

Cavet — OUT-1
Bush — walked; subsequently scored (unearned run) on **a fielder's-choice-force-out by Crawford.**
Vitt — **safe at first on Wallace's first error**; subsequently scored (unearned run) on **Wallace's second error.**
Cobb — singled; **forced out at second base on fielder's choice (on ball hit by Crawford) — OUT-2**
Crawford — **safe on fielder's choice, batting in Vitt; subsequently caught napping — OUT-3**

EIGHTH INNING [exactly the same as PBPs (A and B)]

Veach — OUT-1
Burns — OUT-2
Moriarty — OUT-3

- So, as shown in PBP (C), we now have a scenario that permits us to affirm that Bush could have been batted in by Crawford or, as already shown in PBPs (A and B), by Cobb.

Now, there's only one other possible seventh-inning "batted-in-by" run left to explore — is there a scenario in which Bush could reasonably have been batted in by Vitt? Let's try this wholesale revamping of PBP (B):

Sequence-7g— Cavet is retired (striking out, batting right handed) for the first out in the seventh inning. Bush reaches second base via the two fielding errors committed in the game by shortstop Wallace (perhaps first on a muffed fly or grounder followed by a wild throw). Vitt singles, batting in Bush (with an unearned run). Cobb singles, advancing Vitt to third. Crawford grounds out, scoring Vitt (with an unearned run) and advancing Cobb to second. Cobb (or Crawford) is caught napping, ending the inning. ==> This (isolated) seventh-inning scenario works for Bush being batted in by Vitt.

BUT, Scenario-7g has Bush being safe on a fielding error instead of getting on base with a walk — as he did in all previous seventh-inning Sequences (7a, 7b, 7c, 7d 7e, and 7f). Therefore, we need to credit Bush with a walk somewhere else in the game. And, since the walk was issued by Leverenz, the walk must have been issued in the fifth inning. But, since PBP (B) (via Sequence-5c or Sequence-5d) has Bush with a single in the fifth inning,

we need to credit Bush with a hit somewhere else. We'll come back to this in moment. Sequence-7g also has Vitt hitting a single instead of being safe on a fielding error — as he was in all previous seventh-inning Sequences (7a, 7b, 7c, 7d 7e, and 7f). Therefore, we need to take Vitt's hit from somewhere else. Since Vitt had a total of two hits in the game ... and one of the hits, according to the description given for the first inning in the DFP account, was made in the first inning, his other hit, placed in the third inning according to ASSUMPTION #4, needs to be transferred to the seventh inning. That works out really nicely — because, as indicated above, we need to transfer Bush's fifth-inning single to somewhere else. So, we'll transfer it to the third inning.

That the runs scored by Bush and Vitt are unearned runs follows from the reconstruction of the inning in the absence of the error, "giving the benefit of the doubt always to the pitcher in determining which bases would have been reached had there been errorless play" as stated in the Official Rules of Major League Baseball: Cavet strikes out for the first out. Bush is retired for the second out (instead of being safe on an error). Vitt singles. Cobb singles, Vitt advancing to second base. Crawford is retired for the third out, Vitt remaining at second base, and Cobb remaining at first base. Therefore, no runs would have scored had there been errorless play. Therefore, the two runs that actually did score were both unearned runs.

[A minor variation within Sequence-7g — *shown here in italics* — allows for Cobb to bat in Vitt (without also batting in Bush, as given in Sequence-7a) — Cavet is retired (striking out, batting right handed) for the first out in the seventh inning. Bush reaches second base via the two fielding errors committed in the game by shortstop Wallace (perhaps first on a muffed fly or grounder followed by a wild throw). Vitt singles, batting in Bush (with an unearned run) *and taking second on the throw-in*. Cobb singles, *scoring* Vitt (with an unearned run). Crawford (a) grounds out, advancing Cobb to second, or (b) is safe on a fielder's-choice-force-out, Cobb being put out at second. Cobb (or Crawford) is caught napping, ending the inning.]

So, beginning with PBP (B) and incorporating Sequence-7g — and the accompanying modifications for the third and fifth innings — yields **PLAY-BY-PLAY (D)** —

PLAY-BY-PLAY (D)

FIRST INNING [exactly the same as PBPs (A , B, and C)]

Bush —	OUT-1
Vitt —	singled; subsequently scored (earned run) per Sequences-7a or 7b or 7c or 7d.
Cobb —	doubled; subsequently scored (earned run) per Sequences-7a or 7b or 7c or 7d.
Crawford —	OUT-2
Veach —	singled; LOB
Burns —	OUT-3

SECOND INNING [exactly the same as PBPs (A, B, and C)]

Moriarty —	OUT-1
Stanage —	OUT-2
Cavet —	OUT-3

THIRD INNING [very similar to PBPs (A, B, and C)]

Bush —	singled; retired on 3-6 DP (hit into by Cobb) — OUT-2
Vitt —	OUT-1
Cobb —	hit into 3-6 DP — OUT-3

FOURTH INNING [exactly the same as PBPs (A, B, and C)]

Crawford —	singled; subsequently scored (earned run) on triple by Moriarty.
Veach —	OUT-1
Burns —	singled; subsequently scored (earned run) on triple by Moriarty.
Moriarty —	tripled, batting in Crawford and Burns; subsequently scored (earned run) on single by Stanage.
Stanage —	singled, batting in Moriarty; subsequently scored (earned run) on bases-loaded walk to Cobb.
Cavet —	singled, advancing Stanage to second; subsequently scored (earned run) on triple by Crawford.
Bush —	OUT-2, advancing Stanage to third.
Vitt —	walked, filling the bases; subsequently scored (earned run) on triple by Crawford.
Cobb —	walked, forcing in Stanage; subsequently scored (earned run) on triple by Crawford.
Crawford —	tripled, batting in Cavet, Vitt, and Cobb; subsequently scored on error by Pratt
Veach —	OUT-3

FIFTH INNING [(very similar to PBPs (B and C)]

Burns —	singled; subsequently scored (earned run) on out by Stanage.
Moriarty —	singled, advancing Burns to third; stole second; LOB

Stanage — OUT-1, batting in Burns.
 Cavet — OUT-2
 Bush — **walked**; LOB
 Vitt — OUT-3

SIXTH INNING [exactly the same as PBPs (B and C)]

Cobb — singled; LOB
 Crawford — walked, moving Cobb to second; LOB
 Veach — singled, filling bases; LOB
 Burns — OUT-1
 Moriarty — OUT-2
 Stanage — OUT-3

SEVENTH INNING (Sequence-7g)

Cavet — OUT-1
 Bush — **safe on fielding error by Wallace**; subsequently scored (unearned run) on **single by Vitt**.
 Vitt — **singled, batting in Bush**; subsequently scored (unearned run) on out by Crawford.
 Cobb — singled; caught napping — OUT-3
 Crawford — OUT-2, batting in Vitt.

EIGHTH INNING [exactly the same as PBPs (A, B, and C)]

Veach — OUT-1
 Burns — OUT-2
 Moriarty — OUT-3

Mini-SUMMARY:

Fifth-Inning RBI — Stanage (out)
 Seventh-Inning RBIs — Vitt (single) and Crawford (out)

Caught Napping (1) — 7th (Cobb, on second with two outs, thereby ending the inning).

Caught Stealing (0)

To make certain that nothing slipped through the cracks in the conversion of PBP (B) to PBP (D), let's do a double-check of everything shown in PBP (D):

DETROIT BATTING and BASE RUNNING

Player	AB-R-H-W	Mes h (Y/N)	Details — outcome (inning)
Bush	4-1-1-1	Y	out (1st); single+DP (3rd); out (4th); walk& LOB (5th); safe-on-error &RUN (7th)
Vitt	4-3-2-1	Y	single &RUN (1st); out (3rd); walk &RUN (4th); out (5th); single &RUN (7th)
Cobb	4-2-3-1	Y	double &RUN (1st); out (3rd); walk &RUN (4th); single& LOB (6th); single& LOB (7th)
Crawford	4-2-2-1	Y	out (1st); single &RUN (4th); triple &RUN (4th); walk& LOB (6th); out (7th)
High	0-0-0-0	Y	DEFENSIVE REPLACEMENT in top of 9th — NO PLATE APPEARANCES
Veach	5-0-2-0	Y	single & LOB (1st); out (4th); out (4th); single & LOB (6th); out (8th)
Heilmann	0-0-0-0	Y	DEFENSIVE REPLACEMENT in top of 9th — NO PLATE APPEARANCES
Burns	5-2-2-0	Y	out (1st); single &RUN (4th); single &RUN (5th); out (6th); out (8th)
Moriarty	5-1-2-0	Y	out (2nd); triple &RUN (4th); single & stolen base& LOB (5th); out (6th); out (8th)
Stanage	4-1-1-0	Y	out (2nd); single &RUN (4th); out (5th); out (6th)

Baker	0-0-0-0	Y	DEFENSIVE REPLACEMENT in top of 9th — NO PLATE APPEARANCES
Cavet	4-1-1-0	Y	out (2nd); single &RUN (4th); out (5th); out (7th)

Doubles (1) ==> Cobb (1st inning)

Triples (2) ==> Moriarty (4th inning); Crawford (4th inning)

Left on Base (6) ==> Veach (1st); Moriarty (5th); Bush (5th); Cobb (6th); Crawford (6th); Veach (6th).

Stolen Bases (1) ==> Moriarty (5th)

ST. LOUIS PITCHING and FIELDING

Weilman's Pitching Numbers

Statistic	Quantity	Mesh (Y/N)	Details — Inning (Players)
H	10	Y	1st (Vitt, Cobb, Veach); 3rd (Bush); 4th (Crawford 2, Burns, Moriarty, Stanage, Cavet)
ER	9	Y	1st (Vitt, Cobb); 4th (Crawford, Burns, Moriarty, Stanage, Cavet, Vitt, Cobb)
UER	1	Y	4th (Crawford)
W	2	Y	4th (Vitt, Cobb)
SO	0	Y	NONE

Leverenz's Pitching Numbers

Statistic	Quantity	Mesh (Y/N)	Details — Inning (Players)
H	6	Y	5th (Burns, Moriarty); 6th (Cobb, Veach); 7th (Vitt, Cobb)
ER	1	Y	5th (Burns)
UER	2	Y	7th (Bush, Vitt)
W	2	Y	5th (Bush); 6th (Crawford)
SO	2	Y	5th (Cavet); 7th (Cavet)

Double Plays (1) ==> Cobb (3rd)

Errors (3)

Pratt (1) ==> 4th (Crawford scored)

Wallace (2) ==> 7th (Bush safe at first); 7th (Bush advanced to second).

NOTE: For the seventh inning, we have used both of Wallace's two fielding errors to place Bush on second base. Alternatively, one could reasonably have Bush reach second base on just one of Wallace's two errors. Wallace's other error could be used somewhere else ... for instance, in the the third inning, allowing Bush to advance to second base before he was put out on the 3-6 double play that Cobb hit into.

- So, now, as shown in PBP (D), we can legitimately state that Bush could have been batted in by Vitt or, as previously shown, by Cobb [PBPs (A and B)] or by Crawford [PBP (C)].

The primary objective of devising PBPs (A, B, C, and D) was to obtain reasonable RBI scenarios for the fifth-inning run scored by Burns and the seventh-inning runs scored by Bush and Vitt — consistent with the combined a

priori logistics and the eighth-inning batting requirements. That has now been achieved for the seventh-inning runs. Fortunately, in addition to the seventh inning, PBPs (A, B, C, and D) provide two reasonable RBI scenarios for the fifth-inning run scored by Burns. Thus, we can state that Burns could have been batted in by Stanage (per Sequences 5a and 5c) or by Bush (per Sequences 5b and 5d). Thus, PBPs (A, B, C, and D) provide reasonable RBI scenarios for two of the four players identified via *a priori* logistics as possible RBI men for Burns, leaving only Moriarty and Vitt needing reasonable scenarios to drive in Burns in the fifth inning. Let's address that situation now.

For Burns to be batted in by Moriarty, Burns needs to first get into scoring position, i.e., he must reach second or third. Because, according to the official DBD records, Agnew had no passed balls and Leverenz had no wild pitches and did not commit any balks, there is not a simple or obvious way for Burns to have gotten into scoring position — for Moriarty — after having reached first base with a single, which he did in PBPs (A, B, C, and D). However, Burns could reasonably reach second base via a fielding error. We'll employ this approach to reformulate Sequence-5a to give Sequence-5x:

Sequence-5x — Burns is safe on the first of two fielding errors by Wallace, taking second on the misplay. Moriarty singles, scoring Burns (with an unearned run). Moriarty steals second. Stanage is put out. Cavet strikes out. Vitt is put out. ==> This scenario works for Moriarty batting in Burns. However, there is an issue — Burns' run is unearned ... which, therefore, requires that one of the two seventh-inning runs must be earned. It may be recalled that, according to PBPs (A, B, C, and D), both of the seventh-inning runs were unearned. Thus, we'll need to make an adjustment so that only one of the seventh-inning runs is unearned.

Let's revise Sequence-7f to produce Sequence-7x:

Sequence-7x — Cavet strikes out. Bush singles. Vitt is safe on the second of two fielding errors committed by Wallace. Cobb singles, scoring Bush — but the run is unearned — because, in the absence of the error, Bush would have been on first base with two outs; Cobb's single would not have scored Bush. The next batter, Crawford, is required to have been retired, which would end the inning — without Bush (or Vitt) scoring. ==> Therefore, there is no reasonable way for Bush to score an earned run in the seventh inning if Vitt gets on base via a fielding error. Another approach needs to be devised:

Sequence-7y — Cavet strikes out. Bush singles. Vitt singles, sending Bush to second (or third). Cobb singles, scoring Bush (with an earned run), and advancing Vitt to third, from where he scores (an unearned run) when Wallace makes the second of his two errors (for instance, a muff of the throw-in), Cobb taking second on the misplay. Crawford then hits into a 3-6 double play, ending the inning. ==> This scenario does accomplish the near-term objective of having one seventh-inning run being earned (i.e., Bush's run) and the other seventh-inning run being unearned (i.e., Vitt's run).

However, an entirely new PBP needs to be generated so as to accommodate Burns reaching first on an error (instead of on a single) in the fifth inning and Vitt singling (instead of being safe on an error) in the seventh inning. Here's a PBP which satisfies the requirements imposed by statistics given in the official DBD records; this PBP, which starts from scratch and assumes that Burns did *not* bat in the first inning (i.e., contrary to ASSUMPTION #1), is designated **PLAY-BY-PLAY (E-1)**:

PLAY-BY-PLAY (E-1)

FIRST INNING

Bush — OUT-1
Vitt — singled; subsequently scored (earned run) per Sequences-7a or 7b or 7c or 7d.
Cobb — doubled; subsequently scored (earned run) per Sequences-7a or 7b or 7c or 7d.
Crawford — OUT-2
Veach — singled; **caught stealing — OUT-3**

SECOND INNING

Burns — **singled; LOB**
Moriarty — OUT-1
Stanage — OUT-2
Cavet — OUT-3

THIRD INNING

Bush — **OUT-1**
Vitt — **OUT-2**
Cobb — **OUT-3**

FOURTH INNING [exactly the same as PBPs (A, B, C, and D)]

Crawford — singled; subsequently scored (earned run) on triple by Moriarty.
 Veach — OUT-1
 Burns — singled; subsequently scored (earned run) on triple by Moriarty.
 Moriarty — tripled, batting in Crawford and Burns; subsequently scored (earned run) on single by Stanage.
 Stanage — singled, batting in Moriarty; subsequently scored (earned run) on bases-loaded walk to Cobb.
 Cavet — singled, advancing Stanage to second; subsequently scored (earned run) on triple by Crawford.
 Bush — OUT-2, advancing Stanage to third.
 Vitt — walked, filling the bases; subsequently scored (earned run) on triple by Crawford.
 Cobb — walked, forcing in Stanage; subsequently scored (earned run) on triple by Crawford.
 Crawford — tripled, batting in Cavet, Vitt, and Cobb; subsequently scored on error by Pratt
 Veach — OUT-3

FIFTH INNING (Sequence-5x)

Burns — **safe on fielding error by Wallace**; subsequently scored (**unearned run**) on single by Moriarty.
 Moriarty — singled, scoring Burns; stole second; LOB
 Stanage — OUT-1
 Cavet — OUT-2
 Bush — **walked**; LOB
 Vitt — OUT-3

SIXTH INNING [exactly the same as PBPs (B, C, and D)]

Cobb — singled; LOB
 Crawford — walked, moving Cobb to second; LOB
 Veach — singled, filling bases; LOB
 Burns — OUT-1
 Moriarty — OUT-2
 Stanage — OUT-3

SEVENTH INNING (Sequence-7y)

Cavet — OUT-1
 Bush — **singled; subsequently scored (earned run) on single by Cobb.**
 Vitt — **singled; subsequently scored (unearned run) on Cobb single coupled with Wallace's error.**
 Cobb — singled; **scoring Bush and advancing Vitt to third; took second on Wallace's error; subsequently retired on 3-6 DP (hit into by Crawford) — OUT-2 or OUT-3.**
 Crawford — **hit into 3-6 DP — OUT-3 or OUT-2**

EIGHTH INNING [exactly the same as PBPs (A, B, C, and D)]

Veach — OUT-1
 Burns — OUT-2
 Moriarty — OUT-3

Mini-SUMMARY:

Fifth-Inning RBI — Moriarty (single)
 Seventh-Inning RBIs — Cobb (single)

Caught Napping (0)

Caught Stealing (1) — 1st (Veach, on first with two outs, thereby ending the inning).

Just to be sure that PBP (E-1) is in agreement with the official DBD records, here's a detailed summary:

DETROIT BATTING and BASE RUNNING

Player	AB-R-H-W	Mes h (Y/N)	Details — outcome (inning)
Bush	4-1-1-1	Y	out (1st); out (3rd); out (4th); walk & LOB (5th); single & RUN (7th)

Vitt	4-3-2-1	Y	single &RUN (1st); out (3rd); walk &RUN (4th); out (5th); single &RUN (7th)
Cobb	4-2-3-1	Y	double &RUN (1st); out (3rd); walk &RUN (4th); single &LOB (6th); single (7th)
Crawford	4-2-2-1	Y	out (1st); single &RUN (4th); triple &RUN (4th); walk &LOB (6th); out (7th)
High	0-0-0-0	Y	DEFENSIVE REPLACEMENT in top of 9th — NO PLATE APPEARANCES
Veatch	5-0-2-0	Y	single & caught stealing (1st); out (4th); out (4th); single &LOB (6th); out (8th)
Heilmann	0-0-0-0	Y	DEFENSIVE REPLACEMENT in top of 9th — NO PLATE APPEARANCES
Burns	5-2-2-0	Y	single &LOB (2nd); single &RUN (4th); SOE-6 &RUN (5th); out (6th); out (8th)
Moriarty	5-1-2-0	Y	out (2nd); triple &RUN (4th); single & stolen base &LOB (5th); out (6th); out (8th)
Stanage	4-1-1-0	Y	out (2nd); single &RUN (4th); out (5th); out (6th)
Baker	0-0-0-0	Y	DEFENSIVE REPLACEMENT in top of 9th — NO PLATE APPEARANCES
Cavet	4-1-1-0	Y	out (2nd); single &RUN (4th); out (5th); out (7th)

Doubles (1) ==> Cobb (1st inning)

Triples (2) ==> Moriarty (4th inning); Crawford (4th inning)

Left on Base (6) ==> Burns (2nd); Moriarty (5th); Bush (5th); Cobb (6th); Crawford (6th); Veatch (6th).

Stolen Bases (1) ==> Moriarty (5th)

ST. LOUIS PITCHING and FIELDING

Weilman's Pitching Numbers

Statistic	Quantity	Mesh (Y/N)	Details — Inning (Players)
H	10	Y	1st (Vitt, Cobb, Veatch); 2nd (Burns); 4th (Crawford 2, Burns, Moriarty, Stanage, Cavet)
ER	9	Y	1st (Vitt, Cobb); 4th (Crawford, Burns, Moriarty, Stanage, Cavet, Vitt, Cobb)
UER	1	Y	4th (Crawford)
W	2	Y	4th (Vitt, Cobb)
SO	0	Y	NONE

Leverenz's Pitching Numbers

Statistic	Quantity	Mesh (Y/N)	Details — Inning (Players)
H	6	Y	5th (Moriarty,); 6th (Cobb, Veatch); 7th (Bush, Vitt, Cobb)
ER	1	Y	7th (Bush)
UER	2	Y	5th (Burns); 7th (Vitt)
W	2	Y	5th (Bush); 6th (Crawford)
SO	2	Y	5th (Cavet); 7th (Cavet)

Double Plays (1) ==> Crawford (7th)

Errors (3)

Pratt (1) ==> 4th (Crawford scored)
Wallace (2) ==> 5th (Burns safe at first); 7th (Vitt scored)

As can be seen, there is complete agreement for PBP (E-1) and the official DBD records.

Another “starting-from-scratch” PBP which accommodates Burns reaching first on an error (instead of on a single) in the fifth inning and Vitt singling (instead of being safe on an error) in the seventh inning is exactly the same as PBP (E-1) EXCEPT for the first and second innings. Thus, Sequences-1e, 1f, and 1g, each significantly impacting the possible RBIs for the two first-inning runs, are put on the table for consideration:

Sequence-1e — Bush is retired for the first out. Vitt singles. Cobb doubles, advancing Vitt to third. Crawford is retired for the second out, Vitt scoring, Cobb holding his base. Veach singles, advancing Cobb to third. Burns singles, batting in Vitt and sending Veach to third. Burns is caught stealing for the third out, ending the inning. ==> RBIs: Crawford 1, Burns 1.

Sequence-1f — Bush is retired for the first out. Vitt singles. Cobb doubles, batting in Vitt. Crawford is retired for the second out, Cobb holding his base. Veach singles, advancing Cobb to third. Burns singles, batting in Vitt and sending Veach to third. Burns is caught stealing for the third out, ending the inning. ==> RBIs: Cobb 1, Burns 1.

Sequence-1g — Bush is retired for the first out. Vitt singles. Cobb doubles, advancing Vitt to third. Crawford is retired for the second out, the runners holding their bases. Veach singles, batting in Vitt and advancing Cobb to third. Burns singles, batting in Vitt and sending Veach to third. Burns is caught stealing for the third out, ending the inning. ==> RBIs: Veach 1, Burns 1.

Incorporating Sequences-1e, 1f, 1g — and the accompanying requisite adjustment for the second inning — in PBP (E-1) produces **PLAY-BY-PLAY E-2:**

PLAY-BY-PLAY (E-2)

FIRST INNING

Bush — OUT-1
Vitt — singled; subsequently scored (earned run) per **Sequences-1e or 1f or 1g.**
Cobb — doubled; subsequently scored (earned run) per **Sequences-1e or 1f or 1g.**
Crawford — OUT-2.
Veach — singled; **LOB**
Burns — singled, batting in Cobb; subsequently caught stealing — OUT-3.

SECOND INNING [exactly the same PBPs (A, B, C, and D)]

Moriarty — OUT-1
Stanage — OUT-2
Cavet — OUT-3

THIRD INNING [exactly the same as PBP (E-1)]

Bush — OUT-1
Vitt — OUT-2
Cobb — OUT-3

FOURTH INNING [exactly the same as PBP (A, B, C, D, and E-1)]

Crawford — singled; subsequently scored (earned run) on triple by Moriarty.
Veach — OUT-1
Burns — singled; subsequently scored (earned run) on triple by Moriarty.
Moriarty — tripled, batting in Crawford and Burns; subsequently scored (earned run) on single by Stanage.
Stanage — singled, batting in Moriarty; subsequently scored (earned run) on bases-loaded walk to Cobb.
Cavet — singled, advancing Stanage to second; subsequently scored (earned run) on triple by Crawford.
Bush — OUT-2, advancing Stanage to third.
Vitt — walked, filling the bases; subsequently scored (earned run) on triple by Crawford.
Cobb — walked, forcing in Stanage; subsequently scored (earned run) on triple by Crawford.
Crawford — tripled, batting in Cavet, Vitt, and Cobb; subsequently scored on error by Pratt
Veach — OUT-3

FIFTH INNING [exactly the same as PBP (E-1)]

Burns — safe on fielding error by Wallace; subsequently scored (unearned run) on single by Moriarty.
 Moriarty — singled, scoring Burns; stole second; LOB
 Stanage — OUT-1
 Cavet — OUT-2
 Bush — walked; LOB
 Vitt — OUT-3

SIXTH INNING [exactly the same as PBP (B, C, D, and E-1)]

Cobb — singled; LOB
 Crawford — walked, moving Cobb to second; LOB
 Veach — singled, filling bases; LOB
 Burns — OUT-1
 Moriarty — OUT-2
 Stanage — OUT-3

SEVENTH INNING [exactly the same as PBP (E-1)]

Cavet — OUT-1
 Bush — singled; subsequently scored (earned run) on single by Cobb.
 Vitt — singled; subsequently scored (unearned run) on Cobb single coupled with Wallace's error.
 Cobb — singled; scoring Bush and advancing Vitt to third; took second on Wallace's error;
 subsequently retired on 3-6 DP (hit into by Crawford) — OUT-2 or OUT-3.
 Crawford — hit into 3-6 DP — OUT-3 or OUT-2

EIGHTH INNING [exactly the same as PBP (A, B, C, D, and E-1)]

Veach — OUT-1
 Burns — OUT-2
 Moriarty — OUT-3

Mini-SUMMARY:

Fifth-Inning RBI — Moriarty (single)
 Seventh-Inning RBIs — Cobb (single)

Caught Napping (0)

Caught Stealing (1) — 1st (**Burns**, on first with two outs, thereby ending the inning).

The principal difference between PPB (E-1) and PBP (E-2) is *when* Burns singled: in PBP (E-1) Burns singled in the second inning and was left on base; in PBP (E-2) Burns singled in the first inning and batted in Cobb (and then got caught stealing, instead of Veach getting caught stealing, for the third out to end the inning). PBP (E-2) is in complete accord with the official DBD records and is also not inconsistent with the *DFP* description for the first inning, nothing having been mentioned about what happened after the “blow by Veach.” That nothing was written about what took place after the “blow by Veach” would generally be interpreted to mean that nothing significant happened, as in Sequences-1a, 1b, 1c, and 1d, where Burns simply batted and was retired to end the inning. And, while I concur with that general interpretation, others may not. So, in order to be as comprehensive as possible in this analysis, let's include PBP (E-2) and its impact on the first-inning RBI possibilities.

- So, with PBPs (E-1 or E-2), now we can state that, in the fifth inning, Burns could have been batted in by Moriarty or, as already shown in PBPs (A, B, C, and D), by Stanage or by Bush.

That leaves only Burns needing a viable pathway to be batted in by Vitt in order to satisfy completely the *a priori* logistics. Let's start with PBP (D) and modify the fifth inning as follows —

Sequence-5e — Burns singles and takes third on Moriarty's single; and Moriarty steals second. Stanage is retired, (as in Sequence-5a), but Burns holds at third base. Cavet is retired, with no advancement of the runners. Then Bush walks, loading the bases. Vitt then singles, batting in Burns. With the bases still loaded and Cobb at bat, Vitt (or Bush) is caught napping, ending the inning. ==> Sequence-5e works for Burns being batted in by Vitt. However, the modification of the fifth inning of PBP (D) — having Vitt single instead of making an inning-ending out requires that the seventh inning also be modified — instead of Vitt singling, Vitt is safe on a fielding error. Sequence-7h includes all of these adjustments:

Sequence-7h — Cavet is retired for the first out in the seventh inning. Bush is safe on the first of two fielding errors by Wallace. Vitt is safe of the second of two fielding errors by Wallace, Bush and Vitt ending up at third and second or third and first or second and first. Cobb then singles, batting in Bush alone or Bush and Vitt. Then

Crawford is retired, batting in Vitt (if Cobb had not already knocked him in). Finally, Cobb is caught napping to end the inning.

It is important to mention that an inning-ending pickoff with the bases loaded — as invoked in Sequence-5e — has happened at least 137 times over the past 100 years according to the play-by-play information provided on the Retrosheet website. **Many Thanks to Mike Emeigh for graciously carrying out the search of the Retrosheet PBP file to obtain this information.** The transformation of the PBP (D) fifth inning — and the accompanying requisite adjustments in the seventh inning — afford **PLAY-BY-PLAY (F)**:

PLAY-BY-PLAY (F)

FIRST INNING [exactly the same as in PBPs (A, B, C, and D)]

Bush — OUT-1
Vitt — singled; subsequently scored (earned run) per Sequences-1a or 1b or 1c or 1d.
Cobb — doubled; subsequently scored (earned run) per Sequences-1a or 1b or 1c or 1d.
Crawford — OUT-2
Veach — singled; LOB
Burns — OUT-3

SECOND INNING [exactly the same as PBPs (A, B, C, D, and E-2)]

Moriarty — OUT-1
Stanage — OUT-2
Cavet — OUT-3

THIRD INNING [exactly the same as to PBP (D)]

Bush — singled; retired on 3-6 DP (hit into by Cobb) — OUT-2
Vitt — OUT-1
Cobb — hit into 3-6 DP — OUT-3

FOURTH INNING [exactly the same as in PBPs (A, B, C, D, and E-1 and E-2)]

Crawford — singled; subsequently scored (earned run) on triple by Moriarty.
Veach — OUT-1
Burns — singled; subsequently scored (earned run) on triple by Moriarty.
Moriarty — tripled, batting in Crawford and Burns; subsequently scored (earned run) on single by Stanage.
Stanage — singled, batting in Moriarty; subsequently scored (earned run) on bases-loaded walk to Cobb.
Cavet — singled, advancing Stanage to second; subsequently scored (earned run) on triple by Crawford.
Bush — OUT-2, advancing Stanage to third.
Vitt — walked, filling the bases; subsequently scored (earned run) on triple by Crawford.
Cobb — walked, forcing in Stanage; subsequently scored (earned run) on triple by Crawford.
Crawford — tripled, batting in Cavet, Vitt, and Cobb; subsequently scored on error by Pratt
Veach — OUT-3

FIFTH INNING [Sequence-5a → Sequence-5e]

Burns — singled; subsequently scored (**earned run**) on a single by Vitt.
Moriarty — singled, advancing Burns to third; stole second; LOB
Stanage — **OUT-1**
Cavet — OUT-2
Bush — walked; LOB
Vitt — **singled, batting in Burns; subsequently caught napping — OUT-3.**

SIXTH INNING [exactly the same as in PBPs (B, C, and D)]

Cobb — singled; LOB
Crawford — walked, moving Cobb to second; LOB
Veach — singled, filling bases; LOB
Burns — OUT-1
Moriarty — OUT-2
Stanage — OUT-3

SEVENTH INNING [Sequence-7g → Sequence-7h]

Cavet — OUT-1
Bush — safe on fielding error by Wallace; subsequently scored (unearned run) on single by **Cobb.**

Vitt — **safe on fielding error by Wallace**; subsequently scored (unearned run) on out by Crawford.
 Cobb — singled, **batting in Bush**; subsequently caught napping — OUT-3
 Crawford — OUT-2, batting in Vitt.

EIGHTH INNING [exactly the same as in PBP's (A, B, C, D, and E-1 and E-2)]

Veach — OUT-1
 Burns — OUT-2
 Moriarty — OUT-3

Mini-SUMMARY:

Fifth-Inning RBI — Vitt (single)
 Seventh-Inning RBIs — Cobb (single) and Crawford (out)

Caught Napping (1 of 1) — 5th (Vitt, on first base with two outs, thereby ending the inning).
 Caught Napping (2 of 2) — 7th (Cobb, on first or second with two outs, thereby ending the inning).

Caught Stealing (1) — 1st (Veach, on first base with two outs, thereby ending the inning).

Just to be sure that PBP (F) is in agreement with the official DBD records, here's a detailed summary:

DETROIT BATTING and BASE RUNNING

Player	AB-R-H-W	Mes h (Y/N)	Details — outcome (inning)
Bush	4-1-1-1	Y	out (1st); single+DP (3rd); out (4th); walk& LOB (5th); SOE-6 &RUN (7th)
Vitt	4-3-2-1	Y	single &RUN (1st); out (3rd); walk &RUN (4th); single& CN (5th); SOE-6 &RUN (7th)
Cobb	4-2-3-1	Y	double &RUN (1st); out (3rd); walk &RUN (4th); single& LOB (6th); single (7th)& CN
Crawford	4-2-2-1	Y	out (1st); single &RUN (4th); triple &RUN (4th); walk& LOB (6th); out (7th)
High	0-0-0-0	Y	DEFENSIVE REPLACEMENT in top of 9th — NO PLATE APPEARANCES
Veach	5-0-2-0	Y	single & LOB (1st); out (4th); out (4th); single & LOB (6th); out (8th)
Heilmann	0-0-0-0	Y	DEFENSIVE REPLACEMENT in top of 9th — NO PLATE APPEARANCES
Burns	4-2-2-0	Y	out (1st); single &RUN (4th); single &RUN (5th); out (6th); out (8th)
Moriarty	5-1-2-0	Y	out (2nd); triple &RUN (4th); single & stolen base& LOB (5th); out (6th); out (8th)
Stanage	4-1-1-0	Y	out (2nd); single &RUN (4th); out (5th); out (6th)
Baker	0-0-0-0	Y	DEFENSIVE REPLACEMENT in top of 9th — NO PLATE APPEARANCES
Cavet	4-1-1-0	Y	out (2nd); single &RUN (4th); out (5th); out (7th)

Doubles (1) ==> Cobb (1st inning)
 Triples (2) ==> Moriarty (4th inning); Crawford (4th inning)

Left on Base (6) ==> Veach (1st); Moriarty (5th); Bush (5th); Cobb (6th); Crawford (6th); Veach (6th).

Stolen Bases (1) ==> Moriarty (5th)

ST. LOUIS PITCHING and FIELDING

Weilman's Pitching Numbers

Statistic	Quantity	Month (Y/N)	Details — Inning (Players)
H	10	Y	1st (Vitt, Cobb, Veach); 3rd (Bush); 4th (Crawford 2, Burns, Moriarty, Stange, Cavet)
ER	9	Y	1st (Vitt, Cobb); 4th (Crawford, Burns, Moriarty, Stange, Cavet, Vitt, Cobb)
UER	1	Y	4th (Crawford)
W	2	Y	4th (Vitt, Cobb)
SO	0	Y	NONE

Leverenz's Pitching Numbers

Statistic	Quantity	Month (Y/N)	Details — Inning (Players)
H	6	Y	5th (Burns, Moriarty, Vitt); 6th (Cobb, Veach); 7th (Cobb)
ER	1	Y	5th (Burns)
UER	2	Y	7th (Bush, Vitt)
W	2	Y	5th (Bush); 6th (Crawford)
SO	2	Y	5th (Cavet); 7th (Cavet)

Double Plays (1) ==> Cobb (3rd)

Errors (3)

Pratt (1) ==> 4th (Crawford scored)

Wallace (2) ==> 7th (Bush safe at first); 7th (Vitt safe at first)

As can be seen, there is complete agreement for PBP (F) and the official DBD records.

- So, with PBP (F) in place, we are able to state that Burns could have been batted in by Vitt, or, as already determined, by Bush or by Stange or by Moriarty — i.e., each of the players identified as possible RBI men from the *a priori* logistics.

Let's now summarize, via Chart A, all of the RBI possibilities presented in PBPs (A, B, C, D, E-1, E-2, and F) for the fifth-inning run scored by Burns and the seventh-inning runs scored by Bush and Vitt:

Chart A. RBI Details for Runs Scored in Fifth Inning by Burns and in Sixth Inning by Bush and Vitt

BURNS batted in by ...	Moriarty	Stange	Bush	Vitt
PBP (A)	—	OUT or ==>	<== or Single	—
PBP (B)	—	OUT or ==>	<== or Single	—
PBP (C)	—	OUT or ==>	<== or Single	—
PBP (D)	—	OUT	—	—
PBP (E-1 or E-2)	Single	—	—	—
PBP (F)	—	—	—	Single
BUSH batted in by ...	Vitt	Cobb	Crawford	

PBP (A)	—	Single	—	
PBP (B)	—	Single	—	
PBP (C)	—	—	OUT	
PBP (D)	Single	—	—	
PBP (E-1 or E-2)	—	Single	—	
PBP (F)	—	Single	—	
VITT batted in by ...	Cobb	Crawford		
PBP (A)	Single	—		
PBP (B)	—	OUT		
PBP (C)	—	—		
PBP (D)	Single ==> or	<== or OUT		
PBP (E-1 or E-2)	—	—		
PBP (F)	Single ==> or	<== or OUT		

So, for the runs scored by the Tigers in the fifth and seventh innings, we can state the following:

- Burns scored in the fifth inning on a 1-RBI single by Moriarty ... OR ... on a 1-RBI out by Stanage ... OR ... on a 1-RBI single by Bush ... OR ... on a 1-RBI single by Vitt ... OR ...
- Bush scored in the seventh inning on a 1-RBI single by Vitt ... OR ... on a 1-RBI or 2-RBI single by Cobb ... OR ... on a 1-RBI out by Crawford ... OR ...
- Vitt scored in the seventh inning on a 1-RBI or 2-RBI single by Cobb ... OR ... on a 1-RBI out by Crawford ... OR ...

It is also very important to point out that for the seventh inning, while Cobb could have batted in either Bush or Vitt or both Bush and Vitt, Crawford could have batted in *only* Bush *OR only* Vitt, but *NOT BOTH* Bush and Vitt. Thus, for the seventh inning, Cobb could have had 0 or 1 or 2 RBIs, Crawford could have had 0 or 1 RBI (but not 2 RBIs), and Vitt could have had 0 or 1 RBI — with the maximum number of RBIs for the team being two.

Thus, for the entire game, here are the “either-or” RBI numbers on an inning-by-inning basis:

First Inning — Cobb 0 or 1; Crawford 0 or 1; Veach 0 or 1 or 2; Burns 0 or 1.

Fourth Inning — Moriarty 2, Stanage 1, Cobb 1, Crawford 3.

Fifth Inning — Moriarty 0 or 1; Stanage 0 or 1; Bush 0 or 1; Vitt 0 or 1.

Seventh Inning — Vitt 0 or 1; Cobb 0 or 1 or 2; Crawford 0 or 1.

It is pointed out that while Vitt could have had zero or one RBI in the fifth inning and zero or one RBI in the seventh inning, he could have had only zero or one RBI for the entire game. That’s because, as described in the Appendix, Veach could have achieved a fifth-inning RBI only with a single (not with a walk or an out); similarly, Vitt could have achieved a seventh-inning RBI only with a single (not with a walk or an out). But, since the official DBD records show that Vitt had two hits (both singles) in the entire game, and since the *DFP* description for the first inning states that Vitt singled in the first inning, he could not have collected his only other single in both the fifth inning and the seventh inning.

We also know for certain that the three players who were late-inning (i.e., top-of-the-ninth) defensive substitutes had zero RBIs because they each had zero plate appearances — High (who took over for Crawford in right field), Heilmann (who replaced Veach in left field), and Baker (who went behind the plate in Stanage's stead).

It is also emphasized that Cavet had absolutely zero RBIs in the game — because he had zero RBIs in each of the four innings that Detroit scored — (A) In the first inning, Detroit scored two runs; therefore, since Cavet batted in the ninth slot of the batting order, logistically he could not have had a plate appearance in the first inning. (B) In the fourth inning, when the Tigers scored eight (8) runs Cavet singled with Stanage on first base, sending him to second base, according to the descriptions given in the various newspaper accounts. (C) In the fifth inning, when the Tigers tallied one run, Cavet struck out (batting left-handed). (D) In the seventh inning, when the Tigers plated two runs, Cavet struck out (batting right-handed).

Finally, to wrap up the analysis, here's the updated summary of the details for the 13 runs that Detroit scored:

SUMMARY of the 13 runs scored by the Tigers

1 (First Inning) — Vitt scored on a 1-RBI double by Cobb ... OR ... on a 1-RBI out by Crawford ... OR ... on a 2-RBI single by Veach ... OR ...

2 (First Inning) — Cobb scored on a 1-RBI out by Crawford ... OR ... on a 1-RBI or 2-RBI single by Veach ... OR ... on a 1-RBI single by Burns ... OR ...

3 (Fourth Inning) — Crawford scored on a 2-RBI triple by Moriarty.

4 (Fourth Inning) — Burns scored on a 2-RBI triple by Moriarty.

5 (Fourth Inning) — Moriarty scored on a 1-RBI single by Stanage.

6 (Fourth Inning) — Stanage scored on a 1-RBI bases-loaded walk to Cobb.

7 (Fourth Inning) — Cavet scored on a 3-RBI triple by Crawford.

8 (Fourth Inning) — Vitt scored on a 3-RBI triple by Crawford.

9 (Fourth Inning) — Cobb scored on a 3-RBI triple by Crawford.

10 (Fourth Inning) — Crawford scored on his triple coupled with a fielding error (wild throw to third) by the second baseman Pratt.

11 (Fifth Inning) — Burns scored in the fifth inning on a 1-RBI single by Moriarty ... OR ... on a 1-RBI out by Stanage ... OR ... on a 1-RBI single by Bush ... OR ... on a 1-RBI single by Vitt ... OR ...

12 (Seventh Inning) — Bush scored in the seventh inning on a 1-RBI single by Vitt ... OR ... on a 1-RBI or 2-RBI single by Cobb ... OR ... on a 1-RBI out by Crawford ... OR ...

13 (Seventh Inning) — Vitt scored in the seventh inning on a 1-RBI single by Cobb ... OR ... on a 1-RBI out by Crawford ... OR ...

UNOFFICIAL Runs Batted In (This Work): Cobb (1-4), Crawford (3-5), Veach (0-2), Burns (0 or 1), Moriarty (2 or 3), Stanage (1 or 2), Bush (0 or 1), Vitt (0 or 1), Cavet (0), Baker (0), Heilmann (0), High (0).

Appendix 2B: Analysis of “Either-Or” RBI Game on October 4, 1914

October 4, 1914 — Detroit vs. Cleveland — Detroit scored 11 runs

Third Inning — Detroit scored 1 run

DFP — Nothing at all.

DJ — Nothing at all.

DN — Nothing at all.

DT — Nothing at all.

Cleveland Plane Dealer (CLPD) — Nothing at all.

Fourth Inning — Detroit scored 1 run

DFP — Nothing at all.

DJ — Nothing at all.

DN — Nothing at all.

DT — Nothing at all.

CLPD — Nothing at all.

Sixth Inning — Detroit scored 1 run

DFP — Nothing at all, although it was mentioned that in five trips to the plate Cobb “got a single, a homer, and a pass. ... The home run, which was Cobb’s second of the year, was a roaring line drive to the flagpole. It rolled so far that Cobb merely loped home from third, reaching the semi-final bag before Leibold got hold of the marble.”

DJ — Nothing at all.

DN — “When Cobb drove the ball past Leibold in center in the sixth, it was the second time this year that he hit for four bases. It was a clean home run, the ball rolling to the flag staff and Cobb walked home from third.”

DT — “Cobb pulled his second circuit drive of the year, a single, and a pass, stole second, and scored from the keystone on an attempted double play.”

CLPD — “... including a home run by Cobb, who, up to this time, had manufactured by one four-bagger all season.”

Seventh Inning — Detroit scored 8 runs

DFP — “Five hits, including a double and a triple, four bases on balls, and two ghastly errors produced the octet of runs. Many more might have been taken if Stanage had not tried to steal third base. Twelve men batted in this inning, Moriarty getting a pass and a triple, Stanage a walk and a single, and Dubuc a double and an ace. Four of Detroit’s runs were ferried home by men who walked, and another was forced in on a complimentary ticket. Mitchell contributed one heave that let in two tallies and helped along another and he also donated some wild pitches that were most welcome. Cobb scored from second on an attempted double play, the ball going from Wambsganss to Egan to Johnston and back to Egan.”

DJ — “Moriarty and Stanage walked to start this [seventh] period and Dubuc singled [should be ‘doubled’] to right, Moriarty scoring. Bush struck out, but Vitt walked, filling the bases. Cobb also waited out Mitchell, forcing in Stanage. Wambsganss mused Crawford’s grounder and Dubuc scored. Veach’s grounder to Wambsganss resulted in an out on Vitt at the plate, but when Egan tried for a double play by shooting the ball down to first base, Cobb scored. Then followed a cluster of hits. Singles by Kavanagh, Stanage, and Dubuc, and a triple by Moriarty rushed the total to eight runs for the inning, and the Tigers might not have stopped there had Stanage held second instead of trying the impossible, to steal third.”

DN — “But in the seventh Mitchell passed four men, gave five hits, and made a wild throw that scored two men. Eight runs is all Detroit got in the inning.”

DT — “... an even dozen took turns at the plate in the seventh, two thirds of them scoring. Five hits, including a double and a triple, four strolls, and a pair of generous errors tell the story of the big round.”

CLPD — “Mitchell started the seventh by walking Moriarty and Stanage. Jackson was unable to get up to a fly that Dubuc hit near the foul line and a man was in, with runners on third and first [should be second]. Bush struck out on a bad ball and thus missed the pass that Mitchell would have given him on the pitch. Vitt walked, filling the bases, and Cobb strolled, forcing Stanage home. Wambsganss booted Crawford’s grounder and Dubuc ferried over the tally that tied, with [the] cushions still jammed. Veach grounded to Wambsganss, who got Vitt at home. Egan threw to first and Cobb scored on the play. Then singles by Kavanagh, Stanage, and Dubuc, and a triple by Moriarty, with a couple throws to wrong spots and a heave to center field by Mitchell, brought the total for the inning up to eight, before Stanage’s dash to death.”

SUMMARY of the 11 runs scored by the Tigers

1 (Third Inning) — ??? ... see below for possibilities.

2 (Fourth Inning) — ??? ... see below for possibilities.

3 (Sixth Inning) — Cobb scored on a 1-RBI homer by Cobb.

4 (Seventh Inning) — Moriarty scored on a 1-RBI double by Dubuc.

5 (Seventh Inning) — Stanage scored on a 1-RBI bases-loaded walk to Cobb.

6 (Seventh Inning) — Dubuc scored (from third base) on a one-out 1-RBI grounder by Crawford, who was safe on an error (fumbled grounder) by the second baseman Wambsganss.

7 (Seventh Inning) — Cobb scored (from second base) on a 4-2 1-RBI fielder’s-choice-force-out (Vitt being put out at home) by Veach (who was safe at first).

8 (Seventh Inning) — Crawford scored (from third base) on a fielding error (wild throw to second) by the pitcher Mitchell.
 9 (Seventh Inning) — Veach scored (from second base) on a fielding error (wild throw to second) by the pitcher Mitchell.
 10 (Seventh Inning) — Kavanagh scored (from third base) on a wild pitch ... OR ... on a 1-RBI triple by Moriarty.
 11 (Seventh Inning) — Moriarty scored on a wild pitch ... OR ... on a 1-RBI single by Stanage.

As indicated in this SUMMARY, the descriptions given in the game accounts presented in the various newspapers did not identify who scored the runs tallied in the third and fourth innings. [It is mentioned that the scorers of the last four seventh-inning runs, shown as having been scored by Crawford, Veach, Kavanagh, and Moriarty, were not specifically stated, although the descriptions leave absolutely no doubt that Crawford, Veach, Kavanagh, and Moriarty were indeed the run-scorers.] Let's see if we can fill in the missing details, especially for the third-inning and fourth-inning runs.

At first pass, here's what we know for certain: Cobb scored on his 1-RBI homer in the sixth inning and that these eight players scored in the seventh inning — Moriarty, Stanage, Dubuc, Cobb, Crawford, Veach, Kavanagh, and Moriarty (again). And from the official DBD records and the newspaper box scores, we know — (a) that six of the eleven runs scored by Detroit were earned (i.e., five runs were unearned); (b) the Tigers hit into one double play (although the official DBD records do not state which Tigers player hit into the double play); (c) Detroit had four stolen bases, one each by Bush, Cobb, Veach, and Moriarty; (d) the Tigers had four men left on base; and (e) the at bats, runs, hits, and walks in the game for each player were:

<u>Player</u>	<u>AB-R-H-W</u>
Bush —	4-1-0-1
Vitt —	4-0-0-1
Cobb —	4-2-2-1 ... 1 home run
Crawford —	3-1-0-1
Veach —	3-2-1-1
Kavanagh —	4-1-1-0
Moriarty —	3-2-2-1 ... 1 triple
Stanage —	3-1-2-1
Dubuc —	4-1-2-0 ... 1 double

In addition, we know from the plate appearance numbers that Cobb was the final batter for the Tigers in the game, i.e., in the bottom of the eighth inning (because Detroit did not bat in the ninth inning). It is further pointed out that Bush, Vitt, and Cobb must have batted in the eighth inning — because there must have been three outs in the inning — i.e., Bush, Vitt, and Cobb were either retired or left on base in the eighth inning. And, from the official DBD records (and newspaper box scores), we also know that (a) the Indians were charged with four errors in the game — second baseman Wambsganss (2), catcher Egan (1), and pitcher Mitchell (1); two of the errors (according to the newspaper descriptions) were made in the seventh inning — Wambsganss (1) and Mitchell (1); (b) Cleveland hurler, Mitchell, tossed two wild pitches (both in the seventh inning); and (c) Cleveland's catcher, Egan, had one assist and pitcher, Mitchell, had two assists.

Let's now try to put together everything that we know; let's begin with the seventh inning:

Moriarty — walked. ... Moriarty subsequently scored (an earned run) on Dubuc's 1-RBI double.

Stanage — walked. ... Stanage subsequently scored (an earned run) on a 1-RBI bases-loaded walk to Cobb.

Dubuc — doubled, batting in Moriarty. ... Dubuc subsequently scored on Crawford's 1-RBI grounder.

Bush — struck out (FIRST OUT).

Vitt — walked, filling the bases. ... Vitt subsequently was forced out at home by Veach's grounder to Wambsganss.

Cobb — walked, forcing Stanage home. ... Cobb subsequently scored [UNEARNED RUN-1] (from second base) on Veach's 1-RBI fielder's-choice-force-out of Vitt at home.

Crawford — was safe on a fielding error (fumbled grounder) by second baseman Wambsganss, Dubuc scoring on the play. (Had the play been made without the fielding error, the second out would have been made.) ... Crawford subsequently scored (from third base) [UNEARNED RUN-2] on a fielding error (wild throw to second) by the pitcher Mitchell.

Veach — forced Vitt out (SECOND OUT, but should have been the third out) at the plate (second baseman Wambsganss to catcher Egan); Cobb advanced to third on the play and then dashed home on Egan's throw to first, attempting to double up Veach, who was safe; Crawford advanced to second on the play. ... Veach subsequently scored (from second base) [UNEARNED RUN-3] on a fielding error (wild throw to second) by the pitcher Mitchell.

Kavanagh — singled, filling the bases. ... Kavanagh subsequently scored [UNEARNED RUN-4], perhaps on a wild pitch or perhaps on Moriarty's 1-RBI triple.

Moriarty — tripled, batting in Kavanagh, if he was on third base. ... Moriarty subsequently scored [UNEARNED RUN-5], perhaps on a wild pitch or perhaps on a 1-RBI single by Stanage.

Stanage — singled, batting in Moriarty, if he was on third base. ... Stanage subsequently was caught trying to steal third base (THIRD OUT).

Dubuc — singled, advancing Stanage to second base. ... Dubuc was left on base.

COMMENT #1: Cleveland pitcher, Mitchell, made a wild throw into center field (probably trying to pick off Veach at second); Crawford and Veach scored on the error and Kavanagh advanced to second (or third). The statements given in the newspaper descriptions, while not specifically stating that Crawford and Veach scored on Mitchell's error, do provide convincing circumstantial evidence: DFP — "Mitchell contributed one heave that let in two tallies and helped along another." DN — "Mitchell made a wild throw that scored two men." CLPD — "... and a heave to center field by Mitchell."

COMMENT #2: Cleveland pitcher, Mitchell, made a wild pitch, which would have allowed Kavanagh to score, if he was on third base, or advance to third base if he was on second base. NOTE: When Mitchell made his wild throw to second, which allowed Crawford to score (from third base) and Veach to score (from second base), Kavanagh, who was on first base, would certainly have advanced to second base and he could have also advanced to third base since Veach took two bases on the wild throw to center field. Mitchell actually made two wild pitches in the seventh inning, although none of the accounts state specifically when. The descriptions suggest that Mitchell did not throw any wild pitches prior to his wild throw to center field. So, here are the various possibilities:

1. With Kavanagh on third (following Mitchell's wild heave to center), Mitchell threw his first wild pitch, allowing Kavanagh to score.
2. With Kavanagh on second (following Mitchell's wild heave to center), Mitchell threw his first wild pitch, allowing Kavanagh to take third, from where he scored on Moriarty's triple.
3. With Kavanagh on second (following Mitchell's wild heave to center), Mitchell threw his first wild pitch, allowing Kavanagh to take third, from where he scored on Mitchell's second wild pitch.
4. With Moriarty on third (following his triple), Mitchell threw his second wild pitch, allowing Moriarty to score.
5. With Moriarty on third (following his triple), Stanage singled, scoring Moriarty. NOTE: For this possibility to have occurred, Mitchell must have already thrown his two wild pitches (such as in possibility #3) — because we know that Dubuc followed Stanage's single with a single and that then Stanage was caught trying to steal third base, ending the inning. Mitchell could not have thrown his second wild pitch with Stanage on first, because Stanage would have moved to second on the wild pitch and then to third on Dubuc's single, thereby precluding Stanage from being caught stealing third.

COMMENT #3: Because not enough information was provided in the descriptions to ascertain unequivocally exactly when Mitchell threw his wild pitches, it is not possible to determine if Kavanagh scored on a wild pitch (either the first or the second) or on Moriarty's triple. Likewise, it is not possible to discern if Moriarty scored on Mitchell's second wild pitch or on Stanage's single. It does seem, however, that if Kavanagh scored on Moriarty's triple, then Moriarty must have scored on Mitchell's second wild pitch (and not on Stanage's single). Thus, for Stanage to have singled in Moriarty, Mitchell must have thrown both of his wild pitches before Moriarty batted, which means that Kavanagh must have scored on a wild pitch. In other words, what we have here is the impossible challenge of coming up with a unique solution by fitting together all of these events —

- (a) Kavanagh on second or third and subsequently scoring.
- (b) Moriarty hitting a triple and subsequently scoring.
- (c) Stanage hitting a single and subsequently being caught trying to steal third.
- (d) Dubuc hitting a single and being left on base.
- (e) Mitchell throwing two wild pitches.

Thus, with respect to RBI credit for the runs scored by Kavanagh and Moriarty, if Moriarty batted in Kavanagh, then Stanage could not have batted in Moriarty and if Moriarty did not bat in Kavanagh, then Stanage could have batted in Moriarty. The bottom line is that for the seventh inning, Moriarty had zero or one RBI and Stanage had zero or one RBI, but Moriarty and Stanage could not each have had one RBI, although they could each have had zero RBIs.

Regardless of whether Kavanagh scored on a wild pitch or on Moriarty's triple and regardless of whether Moriarty scored on a wild pitch or on Stanage's single, the above account for the seventh inning — including the “either-or” RBIs — is in complete accord with the descriptions given in the DFP, DJ, DN, DT, and CLPD accounts. Moreover, five of the eight runs were unearned — because the runs scored by Cobb, Crawford, Veach, Kavanagh, and Moriarty were scored with two outs after the third out should have been made.

Moving on, we know for certain (from the official Day-By-Day records, as well as the box scores in the newspaper accounts) the number of runs each Detroit player scored in the entire game — Bush (1), Cobb (2), Crawford (1), Dubuc (1), Kavanagh (1), Moriarty (2), Stanage (1), Veach (2), and Vitt (0). And, from the text descriptions given in various newspaper accounts, it is known for certain who scored the one sixth-inning run — Cobb — and who scored the eight seventh-inning runs — Moriarty (2), Stanage (1), Dubuc (1), Cobb (1), Crawford (1), Veach (1), and Kavanagh (1). Thus, it can be deduced with 100% confidence that the one third-inning run and the one fourth-inning run were scored EITHER by Bush and Veach, respectively, ... OR ... by Veach and Bush, respectively. Let's see if we can ascertain which of these “either-or” pairs is consistent with the available information. To do this, let's first state (in Chart A) what each player did in the entire game (as given in the official DBD records), and what each player did in the seventh inning (according to the descriptions given in the various newspaper accounts), and, therefore, by difference, what each player did in his other (i.e., non-seventh-inning) plate appearances.

Chart A. What each player did in the Game, the Seventh Inning, and the Other Innings.

Player	AB-H-W (Game)	AB-H-W (7th inning)	AB-H-W (Other)	AB-H-W (Other)	Other
Bush	4-0-1	1-0-0	3-0-1		SB
Vitt	4-0-1	0-0-1	4-0-0		
Cobb	4-2-1	0-0-1	1-1-0 (6th inning)	3-1-0	SB
Crawford	3-0-1	1-0-0	2-0-1		
Veach	3-1-1	1-0-0	2-1-1		SB
Kavanagh	4-1-0	1-1-0	3-0-0		
Moriarty	3-2-1	1-1-1	2-1-0		SB
Stanage	3-2-1	1-1-1	2-1-0		
Dubuc	4-2-0	2-2-0	2-0-0		

After some trial-and-error experimentation with various sequences, here's a Play-By-Play — **PBP-A(1)** — which is consistent with the information that is provided in the various newspaper accounts and the official DBD records:

PBP-A(1)

FIRST INNING

Bush — out-1
 Vitt — out-2
 Cobb — out-3

SECOND INNING

Crawford — walked; LOB
 Veach — singled; LOB
 Kavanagh — out-1
 Moriarty — out-2
 Stanage — singled; LOB
 Dubuc — out-3

THIRD INNING

Bush — walked; stolen base; scored (earned run) on single by Cobb.
Vitt — out-1.
Cobb — singled, batting in Bush; stolen base; caught napping — out-2
Crawford — out-3

FOURTH INNING

Veach — walked; stolen base; subsequently scored (earned run) on single by Moriarty.
Kavanagh — out-1
Moriarty — singled, batting in Veach; subsequently retired on DP hit into by Stanage — out-2.
Stanage — hit into 6-3 DP — out-3.

FIFTH INNING

Dubuc — out-1
Bush — out-2
Vitt — out-3

SIXTH INNING

Cobb — homered, scoring (earned run).
Crawford — out-1
Veach — out-2
Kavanagh — out-3

SEVENTH INNING

Moriarty — walked; stolen base; subsequently scored (earned run) on double by Dubuc.
Stanage — walked; subsequently scored (earned run) on bases-loaded walk to Cobb.
Dubuc — doubled, batting in Moriarty; subsequently scored (earned run) on grounder by Crawford.
Bush — out-1
Vitt — walked; subsequently retired on FCFO hit into by Veach — out-2
Cobb — walked, "batting in" Stanage; subsequently scored (UNEARNED RUN-1) on FCFO by Veach.
Crawford — safe on error by Wambsganss, batting in Dubuc; subsequently scored (UNEARNED RUN-2) on wild throw by Mitchell.
Veach — safe on FCFO, batting in Cobb; subsequently scored (UNEARNED RUN-3) on wild throw by Mitchell.
Kavanagh — singled; subsequently scored (UNEARNED RUN-4) on wild pitch ... or ... on Moriarty's triple.
Moriarty — tripled; subsequently scored (UNEARNED RUN-5) on wild pitch ... or ... on Stanage's single.
Stanage — singled; subsequently caught stealing (2-5) — out-3.
Dubuc — singled; LOB

EIGHTH INNING

Bush — out-1
Vitt — out-2
Cobb — out-3

At this point, let's be emphatically clear that the intent of this analysis is not to assert that PBP-A(1) is what actually happened in the game. The sole purpose of generating PBP-A(1), as well as subsequent PBPs, is to devise reasonable scenarios that are consistent with the statistics given in the official DBD records and, therefore, allow one to assign possible RBI credit for each of the runs scored. Here's what can be said about PBP-A(1):

- PBP-A(1) is logistically tenable with Bush scoring the third-inning run and Veach scoring the fourth-inning run. Moreover, any alternative play-by-play — with Veach scoring the third-inning run and Bush scoring the fourth-inning run — is logistically untenable; here's the rationale:

For Veach to score in the third inning, it is necessary for the Tigers to be in their second time through the batting order. Because a total at least six players must have batted in the first and second innings (to accommodate the three outs per inning requirement), and since Veach occupied the fifth slot in the batting order, he must have batted in the first or second inning. For Veach to bat and score in the third inning, he would have to do so with two outs or less. This stipulation requires that Veach bat first or second or third in the third inning.

For Veach to lead off the third inning, 13 players would have completed their plate appearances in the first two innings — which, logistically, requires that at least seven players had completed plate appearances in either the first or second inning — which, logistically, requires that Detroit scored at least one run in that inning — which, of course, the Tigers did not. Therefore, for Veach to have scored the third-inning run, he could not have been the first batter in the third inning.

For Veach to be the second batter in the third inning, 12 players would have had to have completed plate appearances in the first and second innings and one player (Crawford) would have had to have batted in the third inning. Because Detroit did not score in either the first or second inning, logistics require that the first six players had completed plate appearances in the first inning and that the next six players had completed plate appearances in the second stanza and that Crawford led off the third inning and was ultimately put out (i.e., before or after Veach got on base and definitely before Veach scored).

For Veach to be the third batter in the third inning, logistics requires that 11 players had completed plate appearances in the first and second innings (distributed six-and-five or five-and-six — because Detroit did not score in either inning) and that Cobb and Crawford were the first two batters in the third inning and that they were ultimately put out (before or after Veach got on base and definitely before Veach scored).

However, having six players with completed plate appearances in an inning and scoring zero runs requires that three of the players were left on base. Similarly, having five players with completed plate appearances in an inning and scoring zero runs requires that two of the players were left on base.

Thus, for Veach to bat second in the third inning requires that the Tigers had six players left of base in the first two innings, and for Veach to bat third in the third inning requires that the Tigers had five players left on base in the first two innings. But, since we know from the official DBD records (and the newspaper box scores) that the Tigers had only four men left on base in the entire game, it is logistically impossible for Veach to have batted second or third in the third inning.

Therefore, it is logistically impossible for Veach to have scored in the third inning. Therefore, Veach must have scored in the fourth inning. And, therefore, Bush must have scored in the third inning.

- PBP-A(1) agrees with the official DBD records for:
 - all of the at bats, runs, hits, and walks for each Tigers player.
 - six runs being earned runs and five runs being unearned runs.
 - Detroit's four stolen bases — Bush (3rd inning); Cobb (3rd inning); Veach (4th inning); Moriarty (7th inning).
 - Detroit's four men left on base — Crawford (2nd); Veach (2nd); Stanage (2nd); Dubuc (7th).
 - Mitchell's two wild pitches (both in 7th inning).
 - Cleveland's one double play (hit into by Stanage in 4th inning).
 - one assist by Egan — Stanage caught stealing (2-5) in 7th inning.
 - one of the two assists by Mitchell — Cobb caught napping in 3rd inning.
- PBP-A(1) agrees with the newspaper descriptions for Cleveland's two errors in the 7th inning — by Wambsganss (1) and Mitchell (1).
- PBP-A(1) does not show Cleveland's other two errors — Wambsganss (1) and Engle (1). Perhaps these occurred such that the player was first safe, then subsequently put out. For instance, how about this hypothetical scenario — in the eighth inning, Bush is safe at first on an error by Wambsganss. But Mitchell picks him off first (with the second of his two assists in the game). Then Vitt is retired. Then Cobb is retired. For the error committed by Engle, how about this scenario — in the first inning, with Bush out, Vitt is safe at first on Engle's error (say a wild throw to first baseman Johnston), but is put out trying to also take second base (when second baseman Wambsganss backs up the play and throws to shortstop Chapman). Regardless of where these two errors were committed, the main point here is that these two errors had absolutely no impact on the scoring of any of the runs contrived in PBP-A(1).

PBP-A(1) presents a scenario for the run scored by Bush in the third inning — basically, Bush walked, stole second, and scored on Cobb's single. But, there may be other ways — also consistent with the official DBD records that describe how Bush may have scored. Let's take a close look at the different possibilities for the third-inning run scored by Bush:

Third-Inning Run Scored by Bush

For the third-inning run scored by Bush, *a priori* logistics give the five players who batted immediately after him as the only players who could have possibly batted him in — Vitt or Cobb or Crawford or Veach or Kavanagh. However, because Veach scored the fourth-inning run, neither he nor Kavanagh could have had a plate appearance in the third inning. Therefore, neither Veach nor Kavanagh could have batted in Bush. Furthermore, since we know for certain that Detroit's five unearned runs were all scored in the seventh inning, the run that Bush scored must have been earned. Therefore, Bush could not have gotten on base via an error; he must have gotten on base via either a hit or a walk or a hit-by-pitch or on a fielder's choice (for example, if Dubuc singled and then Bush hit into a fielder's-choice-force-out on which Dubuc was out at second and Bush was safe at first). Since the

official DBD records show that Bush had one walk and zero hits and that Cleveland's pitcher, Mitchell, had zero hit batters, Bush must have gotten on base either by walking or by being safe on a fielder's choice.

From the official DBD records we know that Vitt had no hits and one walk in his five plate appearances. And, from the descriptions given for the seventh-inning runs, we know that Vitt walked in the seventh inning. Therefore, if Vitt did bat in Bush, he must have done so on an out, which means that Bush must have been on third base — Cobb's seventh-inning run (scored from second base on an out) notwithstanding. Since Bush also had a stolen base, Bush could have pilfered second base after reaching first on a walk (or fielder's choice). However, the only straightforward way for Bush to have reached third base before Vitt batted would be on a fielding error — for instance, perhaps in stealing second base, second baseman Wambsganss committed one of his two errors by muffing the throw from catcher Engle such that Bush was able to advance to third, from where he could score on an out by Vitt. However, in reconstructing the inning without the error according to the Official Rules of Major League Baseball — i.e., “giving the benefit of the doubt always to the pitcher in determining which bases would have been reached had there been errorless play” — results in the run being unearned: Bush walks and steals second, but does not move to third (because there was no error); Vitt is retired, Bush remaining at second; Cobb singles, advancing Bush to third; Crawford and Cobb (or Cobb and Crawford) are retired, ending the inning, Bush remaining on third. [Alternatively, Bush could have scored (an earned run) from third base on an out by Crawford (before Cobb was put out on the basepath — but Crawford would get the RBI, not Vitt.)] Therefore, in the reconstruction of the errorless inning, Bush could not have been batted in by Vitt to score an earned run.

From the official DBD records we know that Cobb had two hits and one walk in his five plate appearances. From the descriptions given for the sixth and seventh innings we know that Cobb homered in the sixth and walked in the seventh. Therefore, in the third inning, Bush certainly could have been batted in by Cobb — by a 1-RBI single after Bush had walked and stolen second and after Vitt had been retired. Then Cobb and the next batter, Crawford, could have been retired to end the inning, Cobb by being caught napping, utilizing one of Mitchell's two assists, and Crawford by any “regular” out. PBP-A(1) employs that scenario. Alternatively, Cobb's single could have advanced Bush to third base, setting the stage for the next batter, Crawford:

From the official DBD records we know that Crawford had one walk and zero hits in his four plate appearances. Thus, it is possible that Bush could have been batted in by Crawford — by a 1-RBI out after Bush had walked, stolen second, and, after Vitt had been retired, and moved to third on Cobb's single. Crawford's out could also have advanced Cobb to second base, from where he could have been caught napping, utilizing one of Mitchell's two assists, to end the inning. Modifying PBP-A(1) to have Bush batted in by Crawford (instead of by Cobb) results in the generation of **PBP-A(2)**, which is exactly the same as PBP-A(1) except for the third inning:

PBP-A(2)

FIRST INNING [exactly the same as PBP-A(1)]

Bush — out-1
Vitt — out-2
Cobb — out-3

SECOND INNING [exactly the same as PBP-A(1)]

Crawford — walked; LOB
Veach — singled; LOB
Kavanagh — out-1
Moriarty — out-2
Stanage — singled; LOB
Dubuc — out-3

THIRD INNING

Bush — walked; stolen base; scored (earned run) on **out by Crawford**.
Vitt — out-1.
Cobb — singled, **advancing Bush to third**; stolen base; caught napping — out-3
Crawford — **out-2, batting in Bush**.

FOURTH INNING [exactly the same as PBP-A(1)]

Veach — walked; stolen base; subsequently scored (earned run) on single by Moriarty.
Kavanagh — out-1
Moriarty — singled, batting in Veach; subsequently retired on DP hit into by Stanage — out-2.
Stanage — hit into 6-3 DP — out-3.

FIFTH INNING [exactly the same as PBP-A(1)]

Dubuc — out-1
 Bush — out-2
 Vitt — out-3

SIXTH INNING [exactly the same as PBP-A(1)]

Cobb — homered, scoring (earned run).
 Crawford — out-1
 Veach — out-2
 Kavanagh — out-3

SEVENTH INNING [exactly the same as PBP-A(1)]

Moriarty — walked; stolen base; subsequently scored (earned run) on double by Dubuc.
 Stanage — walked; subsequently scored (earned run) on bases-loaded walk to Cobb.
 Dubuc — doubled, batting in Moriarty; subsequently scored (earned run) on grounder by Crawford.
 Bush — out-1
 Vitt — walked; subsequently retired on FCFO hit into by Veach — out-2
 Cobb — walked, “batting in” Stanage; subsequently scored (UNEARNED RUN-1) on FCFO by Veach.
 Crawford — safe on error by Wambsganss, batting in Dubuc; subsequently scored (UNEARNED RUN-2) on wild throw by Mitchell.
 Veach — safe on FCFO, batting in Cobb; subsequently scored (UNEARNED RUN-3) on wild throw by Mitchell.
 Kavanagh — singled; subsequently scored (UNEARNED RUN-4) on wild pitch.
 Moriarty — tripled; subsequently scored (UNEARNED RUN-5) on wild pitch.
 Stanage — singled; subsequently caught stealing (2-5) — out-3.
 Dubuc — singled; LOB

EIGHTH INNING [exactly the same as PBP-A(1)]

Bush — out-1
 Vitt — out-2
 Cobb — out-3

Mini-SUMMARY:

Third-Inning RBI — Crawford (out)
 Fourth-Inning RBI — Moriarty (single)

Caught Napping (1 of 1) — 3rd (Cobb, on second base with two outs, thereby ending the inning).

Caught Stealing (1 of 1) — 7th (Stanage on second with two outs, thereby ending the inning).

Here’s documentation to demonstrate that PBP-A(2) is in perfect agreement with the official DBD records.

DETROIT BATTING and BASE RUNNING

Player	AB-R-H-W	Mes h (Y/N)	Details — outcome (inning)
Bush	4-1-0-1	Y	out (1st); walk & SB &RUN (3rd); out (5th); out (7th); out (8th)
Vitt	4-0-0-1	Y	out (1st); out (3rd); out (5th); walk+FCFO (7th); out (8th)
Cobb	4-2-2-1	Y	out (1st); single & SB& CN (3rd); homer &RUN (6th); walk &RUN (7th); out (8th)
Crawford	3-1-0-1	Y	walk & LOB (2nd); out (3rd); out (6th); SOE-4 &RUN (7th)
Veach	3-2-1-1	Y	single& LOB (2nd); walk & SB &RUN (4th); out (6th); FCFO &RUN (7th)
Kavanagh	4-1-1-0	Y	out (2nd); out (4th); out (6th); single &RUN (7th)
Moriarty	3-2-2-1	Y	out (2nd); single+DP (4th); walk&SB &RUN (7th); triple &RUN (7th)
Stanage	3-1-2-1	Y	single & LOB (2nd); out (4th); walk &RUN (7th); single & CS (7th)

Dubuc	4-1-2-0	Y	out (3rd); out (5th); double&RUN (7th); single& LOB (7th)
-------	---------	---	---

Doubles (1) ==> Dubuc (7th inning)
 Triples (1) ==> Moriarty (7th inning)
 Home runs (1) ==> Cobb (6th inning)

Left on Base (4) ==> Crawford (2nd); Veach (2nd); Stanage (2nd); Dubuc (7th).

Stolen Bases (4) ==> Bush (3rd); Cobb (3rd); Veach (4th); Moriarty (7th).

CLEVELAND PITCHING and FIELDING

Mitchell's Pitching Numbers

Statistic	Quantity	Month (Y/N)	Details — Inning (Players)
H	10	Y	2nd (Veach, Stanage); 3rd (Cobb); 4th (Moriarty); 6th (Cobb); 7th (Dubuc, Kavanagh, Moriarty, Stanage, Dubuc)
ER	6	Y	3rd (Bush); 4th (Veach); 6th (Cobb); 7th (Moriarty, Stanage, Dubuc)
UER	5	Y	7th (Cobb, Crawford, Veach, Kavanagh, Moriarty)
W	7	Y	2nd (Crawford); 3rd (Bush); 4th (Veach); 7th (Moriarty, Stanage, Vitt, Cobb)
SO	1	Y	7th (Bush)

Wild Pitches (2) — 7th (Kavanagh scored); 7th (Moriarty scored)

Double Plays (1) ==> 4th (Stanage)

Errors (4)

Wambsganss (1 of 2) — 7th (Crawford safe at first)
 Wambsganss (2 of 2) — ??? — not needed/used in run-scored innings
 Engle (1) — ??? — not needed/used in run-scored innings
 Mitchell (1) — 7th (wild throw to second, allowing Crawford and Veach to score)

Assists —

Engle (1) — 7th (caught Stanage stealing)
 Mitchell (1 of 2) — 3rd (caught Cobb napping)
 Mitchell (2 of 2) — ??? — not needed/used in run-scored innings

Yet another play-by-play can be contrived for the third-inning run scored by Bush — instead of Bush being the first batter in the third inning, Dubuc is the first batter. This alternative play-by-play, which has Stanage being caught napping in the second inning instead of being left on base and Cobb being left on base in the third inning instead of being caught napping, is designated **PBP-B(1)**:

PBP-B(1)

FIRST INNING [exactly the same as PBP-A(1) and PBP-A(2)]

Bush — out-1
 Vitt — out-2
 Cobb — out-3

SECOND INNING

Crawford — walked; LOB
 Veach — singled; LOB
 Kavanagh — out-1

Moriarty — out-2
Stanage — **singled; caught napping — out-3**

THIRD INNING

Dubuc — **out-1**
Bush — walked; stolen base; subsequently scored (earned run) on single by Cobb.
Vitt — out-2
Cobb — singled, batting in Bush; stolen base; **LOB**
Crawford — out-3

FOURTH INNING [exactly the same as PBP-A(1) and PBP-A(2)]

Veach — walked; stolen base; subsequently scored (earned run) on single by Moriarty.
Kavanagh — out-1
Moriarty — singled, batting in Veach; subsequently retired on DP hit into by Stanage — out-2.
Stanage — hit into 6-3 DP — out-3.

FIFTH INNING [exactly the same as PBP-A(1) and PBP-A(2)]

Dubuc — out-1
Bush — out-2
Vitt — out-3

SIXTH INNING [exactly the same as PBP-A(1) and PBP-A(2)]

Cobb — homered, scoring (earned run).
Crawford — out-1
Veach — out-2
Kavanagh — out-3

SEVENTH INNING [exactly the same as PBP-A(1) and PBP-A(2)]

Moriarty — walked; stolen base; subsequently scored (earned run) on double by Dubuc.
Stanage — walked; subsequently scored (earned run) on bases-loaded walk to Cobb.
Dubuc — doubled, batting in Moriarty; subsequently scored (earned run) on grounder by Crawford.
Bush — out-1
Vitt — walked; subsequently retired on FCFO hit into by Veach — out-2
Cobb — walked, "batting in" Stanage; subsequently scored (UNEARNED RUN-1) on FCFO by Veach.
Crawford — safe on error by Wambsganss, batting in Dubuc; subsequently scored (UNEARNED RUN-2) on wild throw by Mitchell.
Veach — safe on FCFO, batting in Cobb; subsequently scored (UNEARNED RUN-3) on wild throw by Mitchell.
Kavanagh — singled; subsequently scored (UNEARNED RUN-4) on wild pitch.
Moriarty — tripled; subsequently scored (UNEARNED RUN-5) on wild pitch.
Stanage — singled; subsequently caught stealing (2-5) — out-3.
Dubuc — singled; LOB

EIGHTH INNING [exactly the same as PBP-A(1) and PBP-A(2)]

Bush — out-1
Vitt — out-2
Cobb — out-3

Mini-SUMMARY:

Third-Inning RBI — Cobb (single)
Fourth-Inning RBI — Moriarty (single)

Caught Napping (1 of 1) — 2nd (**Stanage**, on first base with two outs, thereby ending the inning).

Caught Stealing (1 of 1) — 7th (Stanage, on second base with two outs, thereby ending the inning).

Here's documentation to demonstrate that PBP-B(1) is in perfect agreement with the official DBD records.

DETROIT BATTING and BASE RUNNING

Player	AB-R-H-W	Mes h (Y/N)	Details — outcome (inning)
Bush	4-1-0-1	Y	out (1st); walk & SB &RUN (3rd); out (5th); out (7th); out (8th)
Vitt	4-0-0-1	Y	out (1st); out (3rd); out (5th); walk+FCFO (7th); out (8th)
Cobb	4-2-2-1	Y	out (1st); single & SB& LOB (3rd); homer &RUN (6th); walk &RUN (7th); out (8th)
Crawford	3-1-0-1	Y	walk & LOB (2nd); out (3rd); out (6th); SOE-4 &RUN (7th)
Veach	3-2-1-1	Y	single& LOB (2nd); walk & SB &RUN (4th); out (6th); FCFO &RUN (7th)
Kavanagh	4-1-1-0	Y	out (2nd); out (4th); out (6th); single &RUN (7th)
Moriarty	3-2-2-1	Y	out (2nd); single+DP (4th); walk&SB &RUN (7th); triple &RUN (7th)
Stanage	3-1-2-1	Y	single & CN (2nd); out (4th); walk &RUN (7th); single & CS (7th)
Dubuc	4-1-2-0	Y	out (3rd); out (5th); double &RUN (7th); single& LOB (7th)

Doubles (1) ==> Dubuc (7th inning)
 Triples (1) ==> Moriarty (7th inning)
 Home runs (1) ==> Cobb (6th inning)

Left on Base (4) ==> Crawford (2nd); Veach (2nd); Cobb (3rd); Dubuc (7th).

Stolen Bases (4) ==> Bush (3rd); Cobb (3rd); Veach (4th); Moriarty (7th).

CLEVELAND PITCHING and FIELDING

Mitchell's Pitching Numbers

Statistic	Quantity	Mes h (Y/N)	Details — Inning (Players)
H	10	Y	2nd (Veach, Stanage); 3rd (Cobb); 4th (Moriarty); 6th (Cobb); 7th (Dubuc , Kavanagh, Moriarty, Stanage, Dubuc)
ER	6	Y	3rd (Bush); 4th (Veach); 6th (Cobb); 7th (Moriarty, Stanage, Dubuc)
UER	5	Y	7th (Cobb, Crawford, Veach, Kavanagh, Moriarty)
W	7	Y	2nd (Crawford); 3rd (Bush); 4th (Veach); 7th (Moriarty, Stanage, Vitt, Cobb)
SO	1	Y	7th (Bush)

Wild Pitches (2) — 7th (Kavanagh scored); 7th (Moriarty scored)

Double Plays (1) ==> 4th (Stanage)

Errors (4)

Wambsganss (1 of 2) —	7th (Crawford safe at first)
Wambsganss (2 of 2) —	??? — not needed/used for run-scored innings.
Engle (1) —	??? — not needed/used for run-scored innings.
Mitchell (1) —	7th (wild throw to second, allowing Crawford and Veach to score)

Assists —

Engle (1) —	7th (caught Stanage stealing)
Mitchell (1 of 2) —	2nd (caught Stanage napping)
Mitchell (2 of 2) —	??? — not needed/used for run-scored innings.

So, for the earned run scored by Bush in the third inning, we have devised three reasonable (i.e., not far-fetched) scenarios in which Bush could have been batted in — by a 1-RBI single by Cobb [PBP-A(1) and PBP-B(1)] or by a 1-RBI out by Crawford [PBP-A(2)]. There may be other ways in which Bush could have scored the earned run in the third inning; but if he was batted in, then he must have been batted in by either Cobb or Crawford, *not by Vitt (or by Veach or by Kavanagh)*.

It is important to point out here that, while Bush could have scored in the third inning if he batted first [as shown with PBP-A(1) and PBP-A(2)] or second [as shown with PBP-B(1)], he could not have scored in the third inning if he batted third: If Bush was the third batter in the third inning, then Stanage and Dubuc would have batted first and second, respectively, and would have been effectively retired before Bush got on base. Then, as described above, Vitt must have been (a) retired (which would have ended the third inning before Bush could have scored) or (b) safe on an error (which would result in Bush's run being unearned). Therefore, for Bush to score an earned run in the third inning, he must have batted either first or second.

PBP-A(1), PBP-A(2), and PBP-B(1) each present the exact-same scenario for the run scored by Veach in the fourth inning — basically, Veach walked, stole second, and scored on Moriarty's single. But, there may be other ways — also consistent with the official DBD records that describe how Veach may have scored. Let's take a close look at the different possibilities for the fourth-inning run scored by Veach:

Fourth-inning Run Scored by Veach

For the fourth-inning run scored by Veach, *a priori* logistics give the five players who batted immediately after him as the only players who could have possibly batted him in — Kavanagh or Moriarty or Stanage or Dubuc or Bush.

Let's see if any of these five players can be eliminated as a possible RBI man for Veach. To find out, there are two starting points — (1) Bush batted first in the third inning; (2) Bush batted second, after Dubuc led off, in the third inning. And, there is one ending point — Kavanagh was the final batter in the sixth inning ... because, as given in the descriptions for the sixth inning in the various newspaper accounts, Moriarty was the first batter in the seventh inning. Let's consider starting point #1 first. Here are the 15 players who had plate appearances beginning with Bush in the third inning and ending with Kavanagh in the sixth inning:

Bush
Vitt
Cobb
Crawford
Veach
Kavanagh
Moriarty
Stanage
Dubuc
Bush
Vitt
Cobb
Crawford
Veach
Kavanagh

We know that three of these players each scored one run — Bush (in the third); Veach (in the fourth); and Cobb (in the sixth). Therefore, the remaining twelve players were each retired, either directly from the batter's box or subsequently on the basepath. Thus, we know for certain who batted in each inning from the third through the sixth:

Third Inning

Bush — scored a RUN.
Vitt — ultimately retired
Cobb — ultimately retired
Crawford — ultimately retired

Fourth Inning

Veach — scored a RUN
Kavanagh — ultimately retired
Moriarty — ultimately retired
Stanage — ultimately retired

Fifth Inning

Dubuc — ultimately retired
 Bush — ultimately retired
 Vitt — ultimately retired

Sixth Inning

Cobb — scored a RUN
 Crawford — ultimately retired
 Veach — ultimately retired
 Kavanagh — ultimately retired

So, if Bush led off the third inning, then Veach could have been batted in only by Kavanagh or by Moriarty or by Stanage, not by Dubuc or by Bush, in the fourth inning. It is important to note that this third-inning-through-sixth-inning scheme is embodied in the entire-game play-by-plays PBP-A(1) and PBP-A(2).

Now, let's consider starting point #2. Here are the 16 players who had plate appearances beginning with Dubuc in the third inning and ending with Kavanagh in the sixth inning:

Dubuc
 Bush
 Vitt
 Cobb
 Crawford
 Veach
 Kavanagh
 Moriarty
 Stanage
 Dubuc
 Bush
 Vitt
 Cobb
 Crawford
 Veach
 Kavanagh

We know that three of these players each scored one run — Bush (in the third); Veach (in the fourth); and Cobb (in the sixth). And, we know that twelve of these players were ultimately retired. That leaves one player — who must have been left on base. The LOB player could be from any of the four innings; Chart B presents the possible schemes for the various LOB results.

Chart B. Possible Schemes for Third-through-Sixth Innings When Dubuc Leads Off the Third.

Scheme-B (1)	Scheme-B (2)	Scheme-B (3)	Scheme-B (4)
LOB — 3rd inning	LOB — 4th inning	LOB — 5th inning	LOB — 6th inning
Third Inning	Third Inning	Third Inning	Third Inning
Dubuc — OUT	Dubuc — OUT	Dubuc — OUT	Dubuc — OUT
Bush — RUN	Bush — RUN	Bush — RUN	Bush — RUN
Vitt — OUT	Vitt — OUT	Vitt — OUT	Vitt — OUT
Cobb — LOB	Cobb — OUT	Cobb — OUT	Cobb — OUT
Crawford — OUT	Fourth Inning	Fourth Inning	Fourth Inning
Fourth Inning	Crawford — OUT	Crawford — OUT	Crawford — OUT
Veach — RUN	Veach — RUN	Veach — RUN	Veach — RUN
Kavanagh — OUT	Kavanagh — OUT	Kavanagh — OUT	Kavanagh — OUT

Moriarty — OUT	Moriarty — LOB	Moriarty — OUT	Moriarty — OUT
Stanage — OUT	Stanage — OUT	Fifth Inning	Fifth Inning
Fifth Inning	Fifth Inning	Stanage — LOB	Stanage — OUT
Dubuc — OUT	Dubuc — OUT	Dubuc — OUT	Dubuc — OUT
Bush — OUT	Bush — OUT	Bush — OUT	Bush — OUT
Vitt — OUT	Vitt — OUT	Vitt — OUT	Sixth Inning
Sixth Inning	Sixth Inning	Sixth Inning	Vitt — OUT
Cobb — RUN	Cobb — RUN	Cobb — RUN	Cobb — RUN
Crawford — OUT	Crawford — OUT	Crawford — OUT	Crawford — LOB
Veach — OUT	Veach — OUT	Veach — OUT	Veach — OUT
Kavanagh — OUT	Kavanagh — OUT	Kavanagh — OUT	Kavanagh — OUT

NOTE: When a player is shown with “OUT,” it is understood that the player was retired either directly from the batter’s box or subsequently on the basepath. The players who could have batted in Veach in the fourth inning are indicated with shaded cells.

So, if Dubuc led off the third inning and one man was left on base in either the third or fourth inning, then Veach could have been batted in only by Kavanagh, Moriarty, or Stanage in the fourth inning (and not by Dubuc or Bush). If, Dubuc led off the third inning and one man was left on base in either the fifth or sixth inning, then Veach could have been batted in only by Kavanagh or Moriarty in the fourth inning (and not by Stanage, Dubuc, or Bush).

OK, so now, because of the unanimity of Schemes-B(1, 2, 3, and 4), we know that neither Dubuc nor Bush could have batted in Veach in the fourth inning. Let’s now try to develop entire-game play-by-plays in which Veach could have been batted in by Kavanagh or by Moriarty or by Stanage. According to the official DBD records, Veach had one walk and one hit in his four plate appearances; he also was credited with one stolen base. Since we know that in the seventh inning Veach reached first base on a fielder’s-choice-force-out, he certainly could have gotten on base in the fourth inning via a hit or a walk and then advanced to second base via his stolen base. So, let’s make this the starting point for all the fourth innings in the various entire-game play-by-plays. It is important to note that Scheme-B(1) is already included in PBP-B(1). So, we already have a scenario in which Veach could have been batted in by Moriarty. What about scenarios for Veach having been batted in by Kavanagh or by Stanage? Here we go:

From the official DBD records, we know that Kavanagh had one hit in his four plate appearances. And, we know from the descriptions given for the seventh inning that Kavanagh collected his hit in the seventh session. Therefore, because Kavanagh did not make a hit in the fourth inning, he must have made an out. Thus, the discussion given above for the possibility of Bush being batted in by Vitt is directly applicable to the possibility of Veach being batted in by Kavanagh — with the exact-same conclusion: Veach could not have been batted in by Kavanagh to score an earned run.

From the official DBD records, we know that Moriarty had two hits (one triple and one single) and one base on balls in his four plate appearances. We know that in the seventh inning Moriarty walked and hit a triple. Therefore, he could have made his single in the fourth inning with Veach on second base. Moriarty’s single could have been a 1-RBI single that plated Veach; this is what is given in PBP-A(1), PBP-A(2), and PBP-B(1). Alternatively, Moriarty’s single could have been “just” a single that moved Veach into better scoring position (third base) for the next batter, Stanage:

From the official DBD records, we know that Stanage had two hits (both singles) and one walk in his four plate appearances. From the description for the seventh inning we know that Stanage had two plate appearances in that inning — he walked and he hit a single. Thus, Stanage could have made his other single in the fourth inning with Veach on third base, thereby driving him home. The situation gets a little complicated at this point, however, since Stanage must also be the final batter in the fourth inning. One can deal with this situation by having both Moriarty and Stanage retired on the basepath for the second and third outs of the inning, for example by either or both being put out trying to stretch his single into a double, or by either or both being caught stealing or napping,

or by some other not-so-obvious plays. However, according to the official DBD records, there were no assists credited to outfielders Graney (LF), Leibold (CF), or Jackson (LF); thus, having Moriarty and/or Stanage being put out “stretching” seems like an unlikely stretch of the imagination. Moreover, since catcher Egan had only one assist, which he used in the seventh inning when Stanage was caught stealing third, neither Moriarty nor Stanage could have been caught stealing in the fourth inning. On the other hand pitcher Mitchell had two assists, which could be “used” here to put out both Moriarty and Stanage — but that would mean that Cobb could not have been caught napping in the third inning, as invoked above [in PBPs A(1) and A(2)]; or, likewise for Stanage having been caught napping in the second inning [in PBP-B(1)].

In order to circumvent this caught-napping roadblock, adjustments must be made in PBP-A(1) PBP-(A2), and PBP-B(1). Here’s one such modified play-by-play [incorporating Scheme-B(1)] with changes in the first, second, fourth, and sixth innings, designated **PBP-C(1)**:

PBP-C(1)

FIRST INNING

Bush — out-1
Vitt — out-2
Cobb — **safe on error by Wambsganss; LOB**
Crawford — out-3

SECOND INNING

Veach — singled; LOB
Kavanagh — out-1
Moriarty — out-2
Stanage — **out-3**

THIRD INNING [exactly the same as PBP-B(1)]

Dubuc — out-1
Bush — walked; stolen base; subsequently scored (earned run) on single by Cobb.
Vitt — out-2
Cobb — singled, batting in Bush; stolen base; LOB
Crawford — out-3

FOURTH INNING

Veach — walked; stolen base; subsequently scored (earned run) **on single by Stanage.**
Kavanagh — out-1
Moriarty — **singled, advancing Veach to third; subsequently caught napping — out-2.**
Stanage — **singled, batting in Veach; subsequently caught napping — out-3.**

FIFTH INNING [exactly the same as PBP-A(1) PBP-(A2), and PBP-B(1)]

Dubuc — out-1
Bush — out-2
Vitt — out-3

SIXTH INNING

Cobb — homered, scoring (earned run).
Crawford — **walked; subsequently retired on DP hit into by Veach — out-1**
Veach — **hit into 6-3 DP — out-2**
Kavanagh — out-3

SEVENTH INNING [exactly the same as PBP-A(1) PBP-(A2), and PBP-B(1)]

Moriarty — walked; stolen base; subsequently scored (earned run) on double by Dubuc.
Stanage — walked; subsequently scored (earned run) on bases-loaded walk to Cobb.
Dubuc — doubled, batting in Moriarty; subsequently scored (earned run) on grounder by Crawford.
Bush — out-1
Vitt — walked; subsequently retired on FCFO hit into by Veach — out-2
Cobb — walked, “batting in” Stanage; subsequently scored (UNEARNED RUN-1) on FCFO by Veach.
Crawford — safe on error by Wambsganss, batting in Dubuc; subsequently scored (UNEARNED RUN-2) on wild throw by Mitchell.

Veach — safe on FCFO, batting in Cobb; subsequently scored (UNEARNED RUN-3) on wild throw by Mitchell.
 Kavanagh — singled; subsequently scored (UNEARNED RUN-4) on wild pitch.
 Moriarty — tripled; subsequently scored (UNEARNED RUN-5) on wild pitch.
 Stanage — singled; subsequently caught stealing (2-5) — out-3.
 Dubuc — singled; LOB

EIGHTH INNING [exactly the same as PBP-A(1) PBP-(A2), and PBP-B(1)]

Bush — out-1
 Vitt — out-2
 Cobb — out-3

Mini-SUMMARY:

Third-Inning RBI — Cobb (single)
 Fourth-Inning RBI — Stanage (single)

Caught Napping (1 of 2) — 4th (Moriarty, on second base with one out, for second out).
 Caught Napping (2 of 2) — 4th (Stanage, on first base with two outs, thereby ending the inning).

Caught Stealing (1 of 1) — 7th (Stanage, on second base with two outs, thereby ending the inning).

Here's documentation to demonstrate that PBP-C(1) is in perfect agreement with the official DBD records.

DETROIT BATTING and BASE RUNNING

Player	AB-R-H-W	Mes h (Y/N)	Details — outcome (inning)
Bush	4-1-0-1	Y	out (1st); walk & SB &RUN (3rd); out (5th); out (7th); out (8th)
Vitt	4-0-0-1	Y	out (1st); out (3rd); out (5th); walk+FCFO (7th); out (8th)
Cobb	4-2-2-1	Y	SOE-4& LOB (1st); single & SB& LOB (3rd); homer &RUN (6th); walk &RUN (7th); out (8th)
Crawford	3-1-0-1	Y	out (1st); out (3rd); walk+DP (6th); SOE-4 &RUN (7th)
Veach	3-2-1-1	Y	single& LOB (2nd); walk & SB &RUN (4th); out (6th); FCFO &RUN (7th)
Kavanagh	4-1-1-0	Y	out (2nd); out (4th); out (6th); single &RUN (7th)
Moriarty	3-2-2-1	Y	out (2nd); single & CN (4th); walk&SB &RUN (7th); triple &RUN (7th)
Stanage	3-1-2-1	Y	out (2nd); single & CN (4th); walk &RUN (7th); single & CS (7th)
Dubuc	4-1-2-0	Y	out (3rd); out (5th); double&RUN (7th); single& LOB (7th)

Doubles (1) ==> Dubuc (7th inning)
 Triples (1) ==> Moriarty (7th inning)
 Home runs (1) ==> Cobb (6th inning)

Left on Base (4) ==> Cobb (1st); Veach (2nd); Cobb (3rd); Dubuc (7th).

Stolen Bases (4) ==> Bush (3rd); Cobb (3rd); Veach (4th); Moriarty (7th).

CLEVELAND PITCHING and FIELDING

Mitchell's Pitching Numbers

Statistic	Quantity	Mesh (Y/N)	Details — Inning (Players)
H	10	Y	2nd (Veach); 3rd (Cobb); 4th (Moriarty, Stanage); 6th (Cobb); 7th (Dubuc, Kavanagh, Moriarty, Stanage, Dubuc)
ER	6	Y	3rd (Bush); 4th (Veach); 6th (Cobb); 7th (Moriarty, Stanage, Dubuc)
UER	5	Y	7th (Cobb, Crawford, Veach, Kavanagh, Moriarty)
W	7	Y	3rd (Bush); 4th (Veach); 6th (Crawford); 7th (Moriarty, Stanage, Vitt, Cobb)
SO	1	Y	7th (Bush)

Wild Pitches (2) — 7th (Kavanagh scored); 7th (Moriarty scored)

Double Plays (1) ==> 6th (Veach)

Errors (4)

Wambsganss (1 of 2) —	1st (Cobb safe at first)
Wambsganss (2 of 2) —	7th (Crawford safe at first)
Engle (1) —	??? — not needed/used for run-scored innings.
Mitchell (1) —	7th (wild throw to second, allowing Crawford and Veach to score)

Assists —

Engle (1) —	7th (caught Stanage stealing)
Mitchell (1 of 2) —	4th (caught Moriarty napping)
Mitchell (2 of 2) —	4th (caught Stanage napping)

And, here's another play-by-play, analogous to PBPs A(1) and A(2), in which Veach is batted in on a 1-RBI out by Stanage, designated **PBP-C(2)**:

PBP-C(2)

FIRST INNING

Bush —	out-1
Vitt —	safe on error by Wambsganss; subsequently retired on 6-3 DP hit into by Cobb — out-2.
Cobb —	hit into 6-3 DP — out-3

SECOND INNING [exactly the same as PBP-A(1) and PBP-A(2)]

Crawford —	walked; LOB
Veach —	singled; LOB
Kavanagh —	out-1
Moriarty —	out-2
Stanage —	singled; LOB
Dubuc —	out-3

THIRD INNING [exactly the same as PBP-A(2)]

Bush —	walked; stolen base; scored (earned run) on out by Crawford.
Vitt —	out-1.
Cobb —	singled, advancing Bush to third; stolen base; caught napping — out-3
Crawford —	out-2, batting in Bush.

FOURTH INNING

Veach —	walked; stolen base; subsequently scored (earned run) on out by Stanage.
Kavanagh —	out-1
Moriarty —	singled, advancing Veach to third; subsequently caught napping — out-3.
Stanage —	out-2, batting in Veach.

FIFTH INNING [exactly the same as PBP-A(1), PBP-A(2), PBP-B(1), and PBP-C(1)]

Dubuc — out-1
Bush — out-2
Vitt — out-3

SIXTH INNING [exactly the same as PBP-A(1), PBP-A(2), and PBP-B(1)]

Cobb — homered, scoring (earned run).
Crawford — out-1
Veach — out-2
Kavanagh — out-3

SEVENTH INNING [exactly the same as PBP-A(1), PBP-A(2), PBP-B(1), and PBP-C(1)]

Moriarty — walked; stolen base; subsequently scored (earned run) on double by Dubuc.
Stanage — walked; subsequently scored (earned run) on bases-loaded walk to Cobb.
Dubuc — doubled, batting in Moriarty; subsequently scored (earned run) on grounder by Crawford.
Bush — out-1
Vitt — walked; subsequently retired on FCFO hit into by Veach — out-2
Cobb — walked, "batting in" Stanage; subsequently scored (UNEARNED RUN-1) on FCFO by Veach.
Crawford — safe on error by Wambsganss, batting in Dubuc; subsequently scored (UNEARNED RUN-2) on wild throw by Mitchell.
Veach — safe on FCFO, batting in Cobb; subsequently scored (UNEARNED RUN-3) on wild throw by Mitchell.
Kavanagh — singled; subsequently scored (UNEARNED RUN-4) on wild pitch.
Moriarty — tripled; subsequently scored (UNEARNED RUN-5) on wild pitch.
Stanage — singled; subsequently caught stealing (2-5) — out-3.
Dubuc — singled; LOB

EIGHTH INNING [exactly the same as PBP-A(1), PBP-A(2), PBP-B(1), and PBP-C(1)]

Bush — out-1
Vitt — out-2
Cobb — out-3

Mini-SUMMARY:

Third-Inning RBI — Crawford (out)
Fourth-Inning RBI — Stanage (out)

Caught Napping (1 of 1) — 4th (Moriarty, on first or second with two outs, thereby ending the inning).

Caught Stealing (1) — 7th (Stanage, on second with two outs, thereby ending the inning).

Here's documentation to demonstrate that PBP-C(2) is in perfect agreement with the official DBD records.

DETROIT BATTING and BASE RUNNING

Player	AB-R-H-W	Mes h (Y/N)	Details — outcome (inning)
Bush	4-1-0-1	Y	out (1st); walk & SB &RUN (3rd); out (5th); out (7th); out (8th)
Vitt	4-0-0-1	Y	SOE+DP (1st); out (3rd); out (5th); walk+FCFO (7th); out (8th)
Cobb	4-2-2-1	Y	out (1st); single & SB& CN (3rd); homer &RUN (6th); walk &RUN (7th); out (8th)
Crawford	3-1-0-1	Y	walk & LOB (2nd); out (3rd); out (6th); SOE-4 &RUN (7th)
Veach	3-2-1-1	Y	single& LOB (2nd); walk & SB &RUN (4th); out (6th); safe on FCFO &RUN (7th)
Kavanagh	4-1-1-0	Y	out (2nd); out (4th); out (6th); single &RUN (7th)

Moriarty	3-2-2-1	Y	out (2nd); single & CN (4th); walk&SB &RUN (7th); triple &RUN (7th)
Stanage	3-1-2-1	Y	single & LOB (2nd); out (4th); walk &RUN (7th); single & CS (7th)
Dubuc	4-1-2-0	Y	out (2nd); out (5th); double&RUN (7th); single& LOB (7th)

Doubles (1) ==> Dubuc (7th inning)
 Triples (1) ==> Moriarty (7th inning)
 Home runs (1) ==> Cobb (6th inning)

Left on Base (4) ==> Crawford (2nd); Veach (2nd); Stanage (2nd); Dubuc (7th).

Stolen Bases (4) ==> Bush (3rd); Cobb (3rd); Veach (4th); Moriarty (7th).

CLEVELAND PITCHING and FIELDING

Mitchell's Pitching Numbers

Statistic	Quantity	Mesh (Y/N)	Details — Inning (Players)
H	10	Y	2nd (Veach, Stanage); 3rd (Cobb); 4th (Moriarty); 6th (Cobb); 7th (Dubuc, Kavanagh, Moriarty, Stanage, Dubuc)
ER	6	Y	3rd (Bush); 4th (Veach); 6th (Cobb); 7th (Moriarty, Stanage, Dubuc)
UER	5	Y	7th (Cobb, Crawford, Veach, Kavanagh, Moriarty)
W	7	Y	2nd (Crawford); 3rd (Bush); 4th (Veach); 7th (Moriarty, Stanage, Vitt, Cobb)
SO	1	Y	7th (Bush)

Wild Pitches (1 of 2) — 7th (advanced Kavanagh from 2nd to 3rd) OR (advanced Kavanagh from 3rd to home).
 Wild Pitches (2 of 2) — 7th (advanced Kavanagh from 3rd to home) OR (advanced Moriarty from 3rd to home).

Double Plays (1) ==> 1st (Cobb)

Errors (4)

Wambsganss (1 of 2) — 1st (Vitt safe at first)
 Wambsganss (2 of 2) — 7th (Crawford safe at first)
 Engle (1) — ??? — not needed/used for run-scored innings.
 Mitchell (1) — 7th (wild throw to second, allowing Crawford and Veach to score)

Assists —

Engle (1) — 7th (caught Stanage stealing)
 Mitchell (1 of 2) — 3rd (caught Cobb napping)
 Mitchell (2 of 2) — 4th (caught Moriarty napping)

So, for the fourth-inning run scored by Veach, we have devised three scenarios in which Veach could have been batted in — by a 1-RBI single by Moriarty [PBP-A(1), PBP-A(2), and PBP-B(1) — all exactly the same for the fourth inning] or by a 1-RBI single by Stanage [PBP-C(1)] or by a 1-RBI out by Stanage [PBP-C(2)]. There probably are other ways in which Veach could have scored the fourth-inning run, but if he was batted in, then he must have been batted in by either Moriarty or Stanage, *not by Kavanagh (or by Dubuc or by Bush)*.

OK, let's now do a final check to be absolutely certain that each and every event in PBP-A(1), PBP-A(2), PBP-B(1), PBP-C(1), and PBP-C(2) is consistent with the official DBD records. Chart C achieves this.

Chart C. Final Check of Events in PBP- A(1), A(2), B(1), C(1), and C(2) — Innings of Events.

Item (official DBD)	PBP-A(1)	PBP-A(2)	PBP-B(1)	PBP-C(1)	PBP-C(1)
Bush — AB (4)	1-5-7-8	1-5-7-8	1-5-7-8	1-5-7-8	1-5-7-8
Bush — W (1)	3	3	3	3	3
Bush — SB (1)	3	3	3	3	3
Bush — R (1)	3	3	3	3	3
Vitt — AB (4)	1-3-5-8	1-3-5-8	1-3-5-8	1-3-5-8	1-3-5-8
Vitt — W (1)	7	7	7	7	7
Cobb — AB (4)	1-3-6-8	1-3-6-8	1-3-6-8	1-3-6-8	1-3-6-8
Cobb — H (2)	3(S)-6(HR)	3(S)-6(HR)	3(S)-6(HR)	3(S)-6(HR)	3(S)-6(HR)
Cobb — W (1)	7	7	7	7	7
Cobb — SB (1)	3	3	3	3	3
Cobb — R (1)	6-7	6-7	6-7	6-7	6-7
Crawford — AB (3)	3-6-7	3-6-7	3-6-7	* 1-3-7 *	* 3-6-7 *
Crawford — W (1)	2	2	2	* 6 *	* 2 *
Crawford — R (1)	7	7	7	7	7
Veach — AB (3)	2-6-7	2-6-7	2-6-7	2-6-7	2-6-7
Veach — H (1)	2(S)	2(S)	2(S)	2(S)	2(S)
Veach — W (1)	4	4	4	4	4
Veach — SB (1)	4	4	4	4	4
Veach — R (2)	4-7	4-7	4-7	4-7	4-7
Kavanagh — AB (4)	2-4-6-7	2-4-6-7	2-4-6-7	2-4-6-7	2-4-6-7
Kavanagh — H (1)	7(S)	7(S)	7(S)	7(S)	7(S)
Kavanagh — R (1)	7	7	7	7	7
Moriarty — AB (3)	2-4-7	2-4-7	2-4-7	2-4-7	2-4-7
Moriarty — H (2)	4(S)-7(T)	4(S)-7(T)	4(S)-7(T)	4(S)-7(T)	4(S)-7(T)
Moriarty — W (1)	7	7	7	7	7
Moriarty — SB (1)	7	7	7	7	7
Moriarty — R (2)	7-7	7-7	7-7	7-7	7-7
Stanage — AB (3)	2-4-7	2-4-7	2-4-7	2-4-7	2-4-7

Stanage — H (2)	2(S)-7(S)	2(S)-7(S)	2(S)-7(S)	* 4(S)-7(S) *	* 2(S)-7(S) *
Stanage — W (1)	7	7	7	7	7
Stanage — R (1)	7	7	7	7	7
Dubuc — AB (4)	2-5-7-7	2-5-7-7	* 3-5-7-7 *	3-5-7-7	* 2-5-7-7 *
Dubuc — H (2)	7(D)-7(S)	7(D)-7(S)	7(D)-7(S)	7(D)-7(S)	7(D)-7(S)
Dubuc — R (1)	7	7	7	7	7
Wambsganss — E (2)	7-?	7-?	7-?	* 1-7 *	1-7
Engle — E (1)	?	?	?	?	?
Mitchell — E (1)	7	7	7	7	7
Mitchell — WP (2)	7-7	7-7	7-7	7-7	7-7
Engle — A (1)	7	7	7	7	7
Mitchell — A (2)	3-?	3-?	* 2-? *	* 4-4 *	* 3-4 *
Cleveland — DP (1)	4 (Stanage)	4 (Stanage)	4 (Stanage)	* 6 (Veach) *	* 1 (Cobb) *
Detroit — LOB (4)	2-2-2-7	2-2-2-7	2-2-3-7	* 1-2-3-7 *	* 2-2-2-7 *
LOB-1	2 (Crawford)	2 (Crawford)	2 (Crawford)	* 1 (Cobb) *	* 2 (Crawford) *
LOB-2	2 (Veach)	2 (Veach)	2 (Veach)	2 (Veach)	2 (Veach)
LOB-3	2 (Stanage)	2 (Stanage)	* 3 (Cobb) *	3 (Cobb)	* 2 (Stanage) *
LOB-4	7 (Dubuc)	7 (Dubuc)	7 (Dubuc)	7 (Dubuc)	7 Dubuc

NOTE: When a row entry is different from its preceding entry, the entry is shown in boldface and bracketed with asterisks.

As can be seen, upon scrutinizing PBP's A(1), A(2), B(1), C(1), and C(2) for Chart C, everything is in perfect alignment with the items in the official DBD statistics. Of course, since (many) other related sequences can also work, it is worth reiterating here that the intent of this analysis is not to identify the actual play-by-plays, but to come up with reasonable scenarios that support the possible RBI men identified by *a priori* logistics for each of the runs scored by the Tigers.

Let's now summarize how Bush was batted in in the third inning and how Veach was batted in in the fourth inning, as given in each play-by-play; Chart D achieves this.

Chart D. Details for Run Scored in Third Inning by Bush and Run Scored in Fourth Inning by Veach.

Bush batted in by ...	Vitt	Cobb	Crawford
PBP-A(1)	——	single	——
PBP-A(2)	——	——	out

PBP-B(1)	——	single	——
PBP-C(1)	——	single	——
PBP-C(2)	——	——	out
Veach batted in by ...	Kavanagh	Moriarty	Stanage
PBP-A(1)	——	single	——
PBP-A(2)	——	single	——
PBP-B(1)	——	single	——
PBP-C(1)	——	——	single
PBP-C(2)	——	——	out

With regard to who batted in whom (and how), Chart E provides the the pertinent information:

Chart E. Players Who Possibly Could Have Batted In the Runs.

Run #	Inning	Run Scorer	Possible RBI Players
1	3	Bush	[a] Cobb — 1-RBI single [b] Crawford — 1-RBI out
2	4	Veach	[a] Moriarty — 1-RBI single [b] Stanage — 1-RBI single [c] Stanage — 1-RBI out
3	6	Cobb	Cobb — 1-RBI homer
4	7	Moriarty	Dubuc — 1-RBI double
5	7	Stanage	Cobb — 1-RBI bases-loaded walk
6	7	Dubuc	Crawford — 1-RBI grounder (SOE-4)
7	7	Cobb	Veach — 1-RBI fielder's-choice-force-out
8	7	Crawford	NONE — scored (from third base) on fielding error (wild throw to second) by the pitcher Mitchell.
9	7	Veach	NONE — scored (from second base) on fielding error (wild throw to second) by the pitcher Mitchell.
10	7	Kavanagh	[a] NONE — scored on a wild pitch [b] Moriarty — 1-RBI triple
11	7	Moriarty	[a] NONE — scored on a wild pitch [b] Stanage — 1-RBI single

Thus, for the game, here are the unofficial RBI numbers for each player:

Bush (0), Cobb (2 or 3), Crawford (0 or 1), Dubuc (1), Kavanagh (0), Moriarty (0 or 1 or 2), Stanage (0 or 1 or 2), Veach (1), Vitt (0).

It is emphasized that Bush, Kavanagh, and Vitt each had absolutely zero RBIs in the game — because each player had zero RBIs in each of the four innings — third (1); fourth (1); sixth (1); seventh (8) — in which Detroit scored:

Bush — (A) scored Detroit's only run in the third inning and did not hit a homer; (B) did not have a plate appearance in the fourth inning; (C) Cobb homered for Detroit's only run in the sixth inning; (D) struck out in the seventh inning.

Kavanagh — (A) did not have a plate appearance in the third inning; (B) logistically could not have batted in Veach in the fourth inning, as previously discussed; (C) Cobb homered for Detroit's only run in the sixth inning; (D) singled in the seventh inning with Crawford on second and Veach on first, loading the bases, as given in the collective descriptions in the accounts presented in the various newspapers, Crawford and Veach subsequently scoring on Mitchell's wild throw into center field.

Vitt — (A) logistically could not have batted in Bush in the third inning, as previously discussed; (B) did not have a plate appearance in the fourth inning; (C) Cobb homered for Detroit's only run in the sixth inning; (D) walked in the seventh inning with Stanage on third and Dubuc on second, filling the bases, as given in the collective descriptions in the accounts presented in the various newspapers, Stanage subsequently scoring on Cobb's bases-loaded walk.

Similarly, it is irrefutable that Dubuc and Veach each had exactly one run batted in for the entire game:

Dubuc — (A) logistically impossible for Dubuc (occupying the ninth spot in the batting order) to bat in Bush (stationed in the leadoff slot of the batting order) in the third inning; (B) did not have a plate appearance in the fourth inning; (C) Cobb homered for Detroit's only run in the sixth inning; (D) doubled in his first plate appearance in the seventh inning with Moriarty on second base and Stanage on first base, batting in Moriarty and advancing Stanage to third, as given in the collective descriptions in the accounts presented in the various newspapers, Stanage subsequently scoring on Cobb's bases-loaded walk; singled in his second plate appearance in the seventh inning with Stanage on first base, advancing Stanage to second base, as given in the collective descriptions in the accounts presented in the various newspapers, Stanage subsequently being caught trying to steal third base.

Veach — (A) did not have a plate appearance in the third inning; (B) scored Detroit's only run in the fourth inning and did not hit a homer; (C) Cobb homered for Detroit's only run in the sixth inning; (D) hit into fielder's-choice-force-out in the seventh inning with the bases loaded, Vitt being forced out at home, but Cobb, with aggressive base running, scored from second base, while Crawford advanced to first base to second base.

Finally, here's the updated summary of the runs Detroit scored:

SUMMARY of the 11 runs the Tigers scored

- 1 (Third Inning) — Bush scored on a 1-RBI single by Cobb ... OR ... on a ... 1-RBI out by Crawford ... OR ...
- 2 (Fourth Inning) — Veach scored on a 1-RBI single by Moriarty ... OR ... on a ... 1-RBI single by Stanage ... OR ...
- 3 (Sixth Inning) — Cobb scored on a 1-RBI homer by Cobb.
- 4 (Seventh Inning) — Moriarty scored on a 1-RBI double by Dubuc.
- 5 (Seventh Inning) — Stanage scored on a 1-RBI bases-loaded walk to Cobb.
- 6 (Seventh Inning) — Dubuc scored (from third base) on a 1-out 1-RBI grounder by Crawford, who was safe on a fielding error (fumbled grounder) by the second baseman Wambsganss.
- 7 (Seventh Inning) — Cobb scored on a 1-RBI fielder's-choice-force-out by Veach.
- 8 (Seventh Inning) — Crawford scored (from third base) on a fielding error (wild throw to second) by the pitcher Mitchell ... OR ...
- 9 (Seventh Inning) — Veach scored (from second base) on a fielding error (wild throw to second base) by the pitcher Mitchell ... OR ...
- 10 (Seventh Inning) — Kavanagh scored on a wild pitch ... OR on a 1-RBI triple by Moriarty ... OR ...
- 11 (Seventh Inning) — Moriarty scored on a wild pitch ... OR ... on a 1-RBI single by Stanage ... OR ...

UNOFFICIAL Runs Batted In (This work): Cobb (2 or 3), Moriarty (0 or 1 or 2), Dubuc (1), Crawford (0 or 1), Veach (1), Stanage (0 or 1 or 2), Bush (0), Vitt (0), Kavanagh (0).

Appendix-3 — Table 3B — RBIs Collected by Selected Tigers Players During 1913-1919 Seasons.

Table 3B. RBIs Collected by Selected Tigers Players During the 1913-1919 Seasons.

Player	Years	RBIs (This Work)	RBIs (Neft)	
Ed Ainsmith	1919 *	35 or 36	32	3 or 5

Doc Ayers	1919 *	1	1	—
Bill Bailey	1918	0	0	—
Del Baker	1914-1916	24-26	22	2-4
Bernie Boland	1915-1919 *	17	11	6
George Burns	1914-1917	226 - 228	220	6-8
Joe Burns	1913	1	1	—
Al Clauss	1913	0	0	—
Joe Cobb	1918	0	0	—
Jack Coffey	1918	2	4	(2)
Ralph Comstock	1913	1	3	(2)
Johnny Couch	1917	0	0	—
Harry Coveleski	1914-1918	25	27	(2)
Player	Years	RBIs (This Work)	RBIs (Neft)	
George Cunningham	1916-1919 *	15	13	2
Jim Curry	1918	3	0	3
Jack Dalton	1916	0	0	—
Tony Defate	1917	0	0	—
Ray Demmitt	1914	0	0	—
Lee Dessen	1918	2	3	(1)
Snooks Dowd	1919	0	0	—
Ben Dyer	1916-1919	8	18	10
Howard Ehmke	1916-1917, 1919 *	8	8	—
Heinie Elder	1913	0	0	—
Babe Ellison	1916-1919 *	21	18	3
Eric Erickson	1916, 1918-1919	1	1	—
Happy Finneran	1918	0	2	(2)
Ira Flagstead	1917, 1919 *	47-48	41	6-7
Frank Fuller	1915-1916	2	3	(1)
Player	Years	RBIs (This Work)	RBIs (Neft)	
Frank Gibson	1913	2	2	—
Art Griggs	1918	19	16	3
Charlie Grover	1913	0	0	—
Charley Hall	1918	0	0	—
Herb Hall	1918	0	1	(1)
Marc Hall	1913-1914	2	3	(1)
Earl Hamilton	1916	0	2	(2)

George Harper	1916-1918	33	31	2
Charlie Harding	1913	0	0	—
Harry Heilmann	1914, 1916-1919 *	311-320	309	2-11
Les Hennessey	1913	0	0	—
Hugh High	1913-1914	33	33	—
Fred House	1913	0	1	(1)
Player	Years	RBIs (This Work)	RBIs (Neft)	
Baby Doll Jacobson	1915	5	4	1
Bill James	1915-1919	7	6	1
Bob Jones	1917-1919 *	74-76	80	(4-6)
Deacon Jones	1916-1918	4	3	1
Rudy Kallio	1918-1919	3	3	—
Marty Kavanagh	1914-1916, 1918	95-96	98	(2-3)
Al Klawitter	1913	0	0	—
Razor Ledbetter	1915	0	0	—
Dutch Leonard	1919 *	4	4	—
Lefty Lorenzen	1913	0 or 1	1	???
Slim Love	1919 *	0	0	—
Grover Lowdermilk	1915-1916	0	0	—
Alex Main	1914	0	0	—
George Maisel	1916	0	0	—
Ed McCreery	1914	0	0	—
Player	Years	RBIs (This Work)	RBIs (Neft)	
Red McKee	1913-1916	49 or 50	49	???
Fred McMullin	1914	0	0	—
Bill McTigue	1916	0	0	—
Willie Mitchell	1916-1919	7	8	(1)
Fred Nicholson	1917	2	1	1
Lou North	1913	0	0	—
Red Oldham	1914-1915	1	1	—
Steve Partenheimer	1913	0	0	—
Pepper Peploski	1913	0	0	—
John Peters	1915	0	0	—
Wally Pipp	1913	5	5	—
Al Platte	1913	1	0	1
Ray Powell	1913	0	0	—

Player	Years	RBIs (This Work)	RBIs (Neft)	
Billy Purtell	1914	4	3	1
Erwin Renfer	1913	0	0	—
Ross Reynolds	1914-1915	0	0	—
Henri Rondeau	1913	6	5	1
Chick Shorten	1919 *	26	22	4
Tubby Spencer	1916-1918	41	40	1
Bill Steen	1915	0	2	(2)
Billy Sullivan	1916	0	0	—
Frank Walker	1917-1918	20	20	—
Johnnie Williams	1914	0	0	—
Lefty Williams	1913-1914	0	0	—
Archie Yelle	1917-1919	8	7	1
Ralph Young	1915-1919 *	155-158	157	(2)-1
Carl Zamloch	1913	0	0	—
Player	Years	RBIs (This Work)	RBIs (Neft)	

NOTE: The | | column gives the absolute-value difference between my RBI number and Neft's RBI number; an entry enclosed in parentheses indicates that my RBI number is less than Neft's RBI number. An asterisk after the "Years" entry indicates that the player also played for the Tigers after 1919.