

Accurate Runs-Scored Records for Players of the Deadball Era: The Players on the 1909 Detroit Tigers

by Herm Krabbenhoft

APPENDIX

RESEARCH PROCEDURE

For each of the 666 runs scored by the Tigers in 1909 I sought to obtain three critical components: (a) the identity of the player who scored the run; (b) the details of the run-scoring event [e.g., a 2-RBI double, a balk, a 1-RBI grounder (batter safe on a fielding error), a 0-RBI grounder (batter safe on a fielding error), a 1-RBI bases-loaded walk, etc.]; and (c) the identity of the player who completed his plate appearance during the run-scoring event (i.e., the player who could be credited with batting in the run). And, because runs batted in were not recorded officially until 1920, and were not even defined officially until 1931, I followed the 1931 official scoring rules [Rule 70, Section 13] to credit or to not credit a player with an RBI — “*Runs Batted In are runs scored on safe hits (including home runs), sacrifice hits, outfield put-outs, infield put-outs, and when the run is forced over by reason of the batsman becoming a base-runner. With less than two outs, if an error is made on a play on which a runner from third would ordinarily score, credit the batsman with a Run Batted In.*” I then provided the complete documentation that I assembled to Retrosheet’s Tom Ruane and Dave Smith for their independent review, upon which we achieved 100% agreement and Retrosheet incorporated all of the runs-scored numbers in its Box Score file (and derived Player Daily files).

NEWSPAPER ACCOUNTS of SELECTED GAMES

August 21, 1909 — Detroit vs. Washington — Detroit scored 9 runs

First Inning — Detroit scored 4 runs

Detroit Free Press (DFP) — Unknown; the Sports section in the August 22, 1909, DFP was not included in the microfilm available at the Detroit Public Library, the State of Michigan Library, and the Library of Congress.

Detroit News (DN) — “Reisling was wild when he pitched to Jones, and Jones finally knocked a pop foul which Conroy caught. Bush hit one in front of the plate that bounded over Reisling’s head and went for a one-base hit. Cobb singled to left, and Bush was held at second. Crawford drew a base on balls, which made three on and Delahanty up. Delahanty made good with a short fly behind first base. It was too far for Unglaub and too far over for Browne, and the result was that it hit somewhere near the foul line and bounded away. When the ball was returned to the infield, Delahanty was on second, Crawford on third, and Bush and Cobb had scored. Moriarty smashed one to deep short that McBride knocked down with difficulty, and Crawford scored. Mullin singled to right, a pretty drive over Schaefer’s head. It scored Delahanty and put Moriarty on third. Here Schaefer became a nemesis for the Tigers. Schaefer scooped up Schmidt’s scorching grounder near second base, touched the bag and whipped the ball to Unglaub in time to complete a double play and retire the Tigers.”

Washington Evening Star (WES) — “With Jones gone in the opener, Bush hit a high bouncer to second base and beat it out. Cobb lifted a short fly into left and Milan, who was playing out, could not get to the ball. Crawford was handed four wide ones, filling the sacks. Delahanty reversed the order of Cobb’s procedure, hitting a high short fly into the other field so far in that Browne had no chance to make a catch. Two runs scored and Delahanty made second. Moriarty’s single by McBride scored Crawford, and Mullin’s clean hit, the one solid smash of the round, drove Delahanty home. Schmidt lined to Schaefer, who doubled Mullin off first base.”

Washington Herald (WHL) — “With one out, Bush singled through the box and Cobb dumped a Texas leaguer into right. Crawford was passed and the bases were full for Delahanty, who raised a silly looking fly that fell safe between Browne and Unglaub. Browne tried to trap it, but was traveling at a ten second gait and the ball got away, scoring for its propeller a two-bagger and bringing in two runs. Moriarty singled past McBride, who knocked

the ball down, but couldn't recover it, and Crawford scored. Mullin then peeled off a slash into right, on which Delahanty scored the fourth run of the inning."

Washington Times (WT) — Nothing at all.

Second Inning — Detroit scored 1 run

DFP — Unknown; the Sports section in the August 22, 1909, DFP was not included in the microfilm available at the Detroit Public Library, the State of Michigan Library, and the Library of Congress.

DN — "After Reisling took in Killian's liner in the second inning, he walked Jones. Bush singled through the short field and Jones was held on second. Jones and Bush tried to put through a double steal, but Street's throw caught Jones off third. Cobb singled to left and Bush scored from second when Milan halted a second before returning the ball. Cobb stole second, but was caught in an attempt to annex third as Crawford received the fourth wide ball."

WES — "Jones walked with one man gone and Bush singled. Jones was nabbed trying to steal third, Bush taking second and scoring on Cobb's single. Cobb also died trying to steal third, after successfully pilfering second."

WHLD — "Passes to Jones and Crawford, with hits by Bush and Cobb in between, netted Detroit one run in the second, due to the ambition of the Tiger runners to steal third on Street, a feat which he nipped twice coming.

WT — Nothing at all.

Third Inning — Detroit scored 2 runs

DFP — Unknown; the Sports section in the August 22, 1909, DFP was not included in the microfilm available at the Detroit Public Library, the State of Michigan Library, and the Library of Congress.

DN — "Reisling concluded he would be taking no chances by passing Delahanty. Moriarty popped to Conroy, but before this happened Delahanty had stolen second. Mullin walked. Schmidt popped to Conroy. Killian sent a hot liner to short which McBride took in, but Mullin beat him to second. With the bases full Jones lined the ball over Reisling's head into center, scoring Delahanty and Mullin."

WES — "Delahanty walked and stole. Conroy got Moriarty's fly. Mullin walked. Schmidt died as Moriarty had. Killian hit back of second, and Mullin beat the play there, filling the sacks. Jones singled to center, scoring two tallies and Bush was thrown out by Reisling."

WHLD — "Reisling was still wild in the third, passing Delahanty and Mullin. Killian singled back of second, and McBride crossed his feet and failed to beat Mullin to the base. Jones spanked into center and two more runs came home."

WT — Nothing at all.

Fifth Inning — Detroit scored 1 run

DFP — Unknown; the Sports section in the August 22, 1909, DFP was not included in the microfilm available at the Detroit Public Library, the State of Michigan Library, and the Library of Congress.

DN — "Schmidt hit clean to center and scored when Conroy threw Killian's grounder past Unglaub."

WES — "Back came the Tigers with a tally, Conroy making a throw into right field on Killian's scratch hit, after Schmidt had singled, Schmidt going all the way home."

WHLD — "Detroit added to its margin in the fifth, when Schmidt smashed fiercely through the box, and came all the way home from first on Conroy's low throw of Killian's little roller."

WT — Nothing at all.

Seventh Inning — Detroit scored 1 run

DFP — Unknown; the Sports section in the August 22, 1909, DFP was not included in the microfilm available at the Detroit Public Library, the State of Michigan Library, and the Library of Congress.

DN — “The Tigers clinched it in the seventh, when Delahanty doubled to left, a ripping drive over third. Moriarty sacrificed and Mullin singled to center, scoring Delahanty.”

WES — “Delahanty doubled in Detroit’s seventh and Moriarty sacrificed. Mullin singled, scoring the run. Schmidt again lined to Schaefer, for the same double play, on the same pair, being pulled off that marked the opening round.”

WHLD — “Detroit scored in the seventh on Delahanty’s second double and Mullin’s second hit.”

WT — Nothing at all.

SUMMARY of the 9 runs scored by the Tigers according to newspaper text descriptions

1 (First Inning) — Bush scored on a 2-RBI double by Delahanty.

2 (First Inning) — Cobb scored on a 2-RBI double by Delahanty.

3 (First Inning) — Crawford scored on a 1-RBI single by Moriarty.

4 (First Inning) — Delahanty scored on a 1-RBI single by Mullin.

5 (Second Inning) — Bush scored on a 1-RBI single by Cobb.

6 (Third Inning) — Delahanty scored on a 2-RBI single by D. Jpnes.

7 (Third Inning) — Mullin scored on a 2-RBI single by D. Jones.

8 (Fifth Inning) — Schmidt scored (from first base) on a single by Killian coupled with a fielding error (wild throw to first base) by the third baseman Conroy.

9 (Seventh Inning) — Delahanty scored on a 1-RBI single by Mullin.

RUNS SCORED according to newspaper box scores

DN — Bush 2, Cobb 1, Crawford 1, Delahanty 3, Mullin 1, Schmidt 1.

WES — Bush 2, Cobb 1, Crawford 1, Delahanty 3, Mullin 1, Schmidt 1.

WHLD — Bush 2, Cobb 1, Crawford 1, Delahanty 3, Mullin 1, Schmidt 1.

WT — Bush 2, Cobb 1, Crawford 1, Delahanty 3, Mullin 1, Schmidt 1.

RUNS SCORED according to official DBD records: Bush 2, Cobb 1, Crawford 1, Delahanty 3, Schmidt 1.

CONCLUSION:

- **Mullin scored 1 run in the game (not 0 runs as indicated in the official DBD records).**

August 27, 1909 — Detroit vs. New York — Detroit scored 17 runs

First Inning — Detroit scored 3 runs

DFP — “D. Jones got an infield single right off the reel. Bush laid one down and beat it. Wilson, who fielded, threw wide to first, and Jones went to third on the error. Cobb singled to left, and Jones scored, Bush being held at

second base. Crawford bunted a sacrifice in front of the plate. Sweeney was in so much of a hurry to make a play that he kicked the ball around and failed to get anybody. This filled the bases. Delahanty tried to murder the ball, but hit a slow grounder to LaPorte. LaPorte got Crawford on the base line and Bush scored on the play. After tagging Crawford, LaPorte threw to Chase for a double play. He was a trifle late. Cobb kept steaming for the plate, and was across before Sweeney could put Chase's throw on him. Moriarty singled, but was caught off first base. T. Jones flied."

DJ — "In Detroit's first appearance at bat D. Jones spilled one in front of the base, which Wilson could not field. Bush laid it on the third base line and had it beaten when Wilson threw. The heave was high and Jones went to third. Cobb slapped a hit to left and Jones was in. Crawford bunted and Sweeney, in his anxiety to to get a force at third, juggled the ball and the bases were filled. Delahanty hit to LaPorte, who touched Crawford out on the line. He pegged to first for a double [play, but not getting it] and Cobb kept right on home, beating Chase's throw to Sweeney. Moriarty singled to right, Delahanty going to second, but T. Jones flied to Demmitt and Moriarty was caught off first."

DN — Nothing at all.

DT — "The Tigers went at Wilson right from the start and scored three runs in the opening inning on four hits, a sacrifice, and an error."

New York Herald (NYHLD) — Nothing at all.

New York Press (NYPRS) — Nothing at all.

New York Sun (NYSUN) — Nothing at all.

New York Tribune (NYTRB) — Nothing at all.

Third Inning — Detroit scored 2 runs

DFP — "Bush walked and stole, and Cobb died, knight to Chase. Crawford singled Bush home and stole second. Delahanty's single sent Crawford across the plate. It also ended Wilson, Chesbro coming in. Moriarty hit to Chase. T. Jones was safe on Knight's error, and stole second, but Stanage lined to LaPorte."

DJ — "Bush walked and stole and went to third on Cobb's infield out. Crawford hit, scoring Bush, and stole himself, coming home on Delahanty's single. Wilson was jerked and Chesbro went in. Delahanty made second when Moriarty went out, Chase unassisted, and T. Jones beat a hit to Knight. T. Jones stole, but Stanage lined to LaPorte."

DN — Nothing at all.

DT — The Tigers grabbed two more [runs] from Wilson in the third and had only one out when Chesbro ascended the slab and retired the side without further catastrophe."

NYHLD — Nothing at all.

NYPRS — Nothing at all.

NYSUN — Nothing at all.

NYTRB — Nothing at all.

Fourth Inning — Detroit scored 10 runs

DFP — "Seven men hit safely and four were passed. Cobb and Crawford each came up twice and each hit for a home run and a single. Willett led away with a triple to the score board. Austin threw out D. Jones. Bush walked.

Cobb hit to the right field bleachers, scoring both men, and turned third before the ball reached the infield. He kept on for the plate, and any possible chance to prevent a home run was lost through Knight's wide peg to Sweeney. Crawford duplicated Cobb's feat, hitting the first ball pitched [to] him, and driving it down towards the flag pole, so far out that making the circuit was no wise difficult. Delahanty walked and stole. Moriarty also waited out four. T. Jones got an infield hit, filling the bases. Stanage hit to LaPorte, whose error let Delahanty score and kept the bases full. Willett flied to LaPorte. D. Jones singled, and Moriarty and T. Jones scored. Stanage and D. Jones pulled off a double steal. Bush walked, filling them up. Cobb singled, scoring Stanage and D. Jones, Bush taking third. Crawford's single put Bush across, and sent Cobb to third. Cobb led off the base recklessly, and was put out."

DJ — "Willett opened the can by sticking it out to the scoreboard for three bases. D. Jones was an infield out, Willett being held on third. Bush drew his second pass. This brought up Cobb, and he swung on the first ball pitched. It lit out near the outfield stand and bounded up against the wall. Demmitt had played deep and was right on top of the ball, but Knight threw badly to the plate on the relay and there was no chance to stop Cobb. Chesbro stuck one straight over to Crawford and he slammed it to the flagpole, making the circuit easily. Delahanty walked and stole and Moriarty got an unearned passage. T. Jones singled to Chase, filling up the corners. Stanage poked it to LaPorte, but Knight dropped the toss for a force and Delahanty scored, the bases remaining full. Willett had been tipped to end the slaughter and he merely pushed his bat out at the ball. LaPorte managed to get under the fly that resulted, but it required a nifty catch. D. Jones singled, scoring Moriarty and T. Jones. Stanage and D. Jones worked a double steal. Bush walked for the second time in the inning and Cobb followed with a single, on which Stanage and D. Jones scored. Bush went to third and Cobb to second on the throw-in. Crawford beat a hit to LaPorte, scoring Bush, and took second when Chase threw to third to catch Cobb. It looked as if they would never stop scoring, but [manager] Jennings wig-wagged to Cobb to end it, and Cobb allowed himself to be caught off third."

DN — "Willett started it [the fourth inning] with a triple to the scoreboard that a man with any amount of speed would have converted into a home run. Austin threw out D. Jones and Bush walked. Cobb smashed the ball to the right field bleachers, making it a home run aided by a bad throw. Willett and Bush trotted home ahead of Cobb. Crawford picked the first ball Chesbro pitched to him and knocked it over Demmitt's head to the pennant pole. It was an easy four-base hit and one of the longes ever made on the lot. Delahanty walked and stole and Moriarty walked. T. Jones got an infield hit, filling the bases. Knight booted Stanage's grounder and Delahanty scored. Willett held the bat in one hand, pushed it against the ball, and LaPorte made a one-handed catch of his floater. D. Jones singled to right, scoring T. Jones and Stanage. D. Jones singled to right, scoring T. Jones and Stanage. D. Jones stole second. Bush walked. D. Jones scored on Cobb's single and Bush went to third. Crawford got a single to second and Bush scored, Cobb reaching third. While Chesbro was holding the ball and talking to Chase, Crawford stole second. Cobb then walked to the plate and was tagged out."

DT — "Fourteen men fa ed Chesbro in that [fourth] period, of whom four hit singles, one contributed a triple, two hit home runs, four were passed to first on balls, on got on on an infield error, and 10 scored. In that inning Bush walked twice and scored twice; Crawford and Cobb each got a single and a home run, the homers coming on consecutive pitched balls. Willett's triple started things. Cobb's home run came with two on base. Crawford's [homer] followed immediately."

NYHLD — Nothing at all.

NYPRS — Nothing at all.

NYSUN — Nothing at all.

NYTRB — Nothing at all.

Seventh Inning — Detroit scored 2 runs

DFP — "Cobb was hit, and stole second. Crawford lifted. Delahanty singled and Cobb scored easily on Demmitt's bad throw. Delahanty took second, and scored on Moriarty's hit. Moriarty was caught off first, and T. Jones struck out."

DJ — “Cobb was hit by a pitched ball and stole second after Crawford flied out. Delahanty’s single sent Cobb home and Delahanty took third when the throw to get Cobb at the plate bounded badly to the stand. He scored on Moriarty’s single.”

DN — “The Tigers got another pair [of runs] in the seventh, when Cobb was hit by a pitched ball, stole, and scored on Delahanty’s single. Delahanty scored on Moriarty’s single to center.”

DT — Nothing at all.

NYHLD — Nothing at all.

NYPRS — Nothing at all.

NYSUN — Nothing at all.

NYTRB — Nothing at all.

SUMMARY of the 17 runs scored by the Tigers according to newspaper text descriptions

1 (first inning) — D. Jones scored on a 1-RBI single by Cobb.

2 (first inning) — Bush scored on a 2-RBI fielder’s choice by Delahanty.

3 (first inning) — Cobb scored on a 2-RBI fielder’s choice by Delahanty.

4 (third inning) — Bush scored on a 1-RBI single by Crawford.

5 (third inning) — Crawford scored on a 1-RBI single by Delahanty.

6 (fourth inning) — Willett scored on a 3-RBI homer by Cobb.

7 (fourth inning) — Bush scored on a 3-RBI homer by Cobb.

8 (fourth inning) — Cobb scored on a 3-RBI homer by Cobb.

9 (fourth inning) — Crawford scored on a 1-RBI homer by Crawford.

10 (fourth inning) — Delahanty scored (from third base) on a 1-RBI grounder by Stanage, who was safe on a fielding error (fumbled grounder) by the second baseman LaPorte.

11 (fourth inning) — Moriarty scored on a 2-RBI single by D. Jones.

12 (fourth inning) — T. Jones scored on a 2-RBI single by D. Jones.

13 (fourth inning) — Stanage scored on a 2-RBI single by Cobb.

14 (fourth inning) — D. Jones scored on a 2-RBI single by Cobb.

15 (fourth inning) — Bush scored on a 1-RBI single by Crawford.

16 (seventh inning) — Cobb scored on a 1-RBI single by Delahanty.

17 (seventh inning) — Delahanty scored on a 1-RBI single by Moriarty.

RUNS SCORED according to newspaper box scores

DFP — D. Jones 2, Bush 3, O’Leary 1, Cobb 3, Crawford 2, Delahanty 2, Moriarty 1, T. Jones 1, Stanage 1, Willett 1.

DJ — D. Jones 2, Bush 4, Cobb 3, Crawford 2, Delahanty 2, Moriarty 1, T. Jones 1, Stanage 1, Willett 1.

DN — D. Jones 2, Bush 3, O’Leary 1, Cobb 3, Crawford 2, Delahanty 2, Moriarty 1, T. Jones 1, Stanage 1, Willett 1.

DT — D. Jones 2, Bush 3, O’Leary 1, Cobb 3, Crawford 2, Delahanty 2, Moriarty 1, T. Jones 1, Stanage 1, Willett 1.

NYHLD — D. Jones 2, Bush 3, O’Leary 1, Cobb 3, Crawford 2, Delahanty 2, Moriarty 1, T. Jones 1, Stanage 1, Willett 1.

NYPRS — D. Jones 2, Bush 3, O’Leary 1, Cobb 3, Crawford 2, Delahanty 2, Moriarty 1, T. Jones 1, Stanage 1, Willett 1.

NYSUN — D. Jones 2, Bush 3, O’Leary 1, Cobb 3, Crawford 2, Delahanty 2, Moriarty 1, T. Jones 1, Stanage 1, Willett 1.

NYTRB — D. Jones 2, Bush 3, O’Leary 1, Cobb 3, Crawford 2, Delahanty 2, Moriarty 1, T. Jones 1, Stanage 1, Willett 1.

RUNS SCORED according to official DBD records: Bush 3, Cobb 3, Crawford 2, Delahanty 2, D. Jones 2, T. Jones 1, Moriarty 1, O’Leary 1, Stanage 1, Willett 1.

CONCLUSIONS:

- **Bush scored 4 runs in the game (not 3 runs as shown in the official DBD records).**
- **O’Leary scored 0 runs in the game (not 1 run as shown in the official DBD records).**

It is emphasized that only one newspaper box score correctly shows Bush with 4 runs scored and O’Leary with 0 runs scored — the box score in the *Detroit Journal* game account.

Additional Information in Support of Runs-Scored Conclusions

[A] Batter-By-Batter (BBB) Play-By-Play (PBP)

First Inning (from newspaper accounts) — D. Jones got an infield hit. Bush beat out a bunt, Wilson throwing wide to first, Jones going to third on the error. Cobb singled to left, scoring Jones, Bush being held at second. Crawford bunted in front of the plate and Sweeney booted the ball, Crawford being safe at first and Bush going to third and Cobb to second. Delahanty hit a slow grounder to LaPorte who tagged Crawford on the base line, Bush scoring on the play. After tagging Crawford, LaPorte threw to Chase attempting to double up Delahanty, but the throw was a trifle late. While the play was going on Cobb kept running hard from second to third and without hesitating from third to home and was across the plate before Sweeney could tag him after receiving Chase’s return throw. Moriarty singled, but was caught off first base. T. Jones flied out, leaving Delahanty on base.

Second Inning (deduced) — *Stanage was retired on an unknown play. Willett was retired on an unknown play. D. Jones was retired on an unknown play.*

Third Inning (from newspaper accounts) — Bush walked and stole second base. Cobb grounded out, Knight to Chase, Bush advancing to third on the play. Crawford singled, scoring Bush. Crawford stole second base. Delahanty singled, scoring Crawford. Wilson was replaced by Chesbro on the mound. Moriarty grounded out, Chase unassisted, Delahanty advancing to second base on the play. T. Jones was safe on... , Delahanty advancing to third. T. Jones stole second base. Stanage lined to LaPorte, leaving Delahanty and T. Jones on base.

Fourth Inning (from newspaper accounts) — Willett tripled to the scoreboard. D. Jones grounded out, Austin to Chase, Willett holding third. Bush walked. Cobb hit to the the right field bleachers for an inside-the-park home run, scoring Willett and Bush ahead of him. Crawford hit to the flagpole for an inside-the-park home run. Delahanty walked and stole second base. Moriarty walked. T. Jones got an infield hit, filling the bases. Stanage was safe on a fielding error by either LaPorte or Knight (see DFP, DJ, and DN descriptions), Delahanty scoring on the play. Willett flied out to LaPorte. D. Jones singled, scoring Moriarty and T. Jones. Stanage and D. Jones, advancing to third and second, respectively. Bush walked, filling the bases. Cobb singled, scoring Stanage and D. Jones, Bush taking third and Cobb taking second on the throw-in. Crawford beat out a infield hit to LaPorte, scoring Bush and advancing Cobb to third. Crawford stole second base. Cobb was caught off third base.

Fifth Inning (deduced) — *Delahanty was retired on an unknown play. Moriarty was retired on an unknown play. T. Jones was retired on an unknown play.*

Sixth Inning (deduced) — *Stanage was retired on an unknown play. Willett was retired on an unknown play. D. Jones singled. Bush struck out.*

Seventh Inning (from newspaper accounts) — Cobb was hit by a pitched ball. Crawford flied out. Cobb stole second base. Delahanty singled, scoring Cobb. Delahanty took third when the throw to the plate bounded badly to the stand. Moriarty singled, scoring Delahanty. T. Jones was retired on an unknown play. Beckendorf was retired on an unknown play.

Eighth Inning (deduced) — Lelivelt singled. D. Jones was retired on an unknown play. O’Leary was retired on an unknown play. Cobb was retired on an unknown play. Crawford was retired on an unknown play.

Scorecard Summary — The following scorecard summarizes the Batter-By-Batter Play-By-Play given above. Italicized entries indicates that they are deduced events. See also the EXPLANATIONS given beneath the scorecard.

Player	1 (3R)	2	3 (2R)	4 (10R)	5	6	7 (2R)	8
D. Jones	R _S	<i>OUT</i>		GO R _S ²		<i>OUT</i>		<i>OUT</i>
Bush	R _S	XXX	R _W , SB	R _W R _W		K		
O’Leary								<i>OUT</i>
Cobb	R _S ¹		<u>GO</u>	R _{HR} ³ POX _S ²		XXX	R _{HBP} , SB	<i>S</i>
Crawford	SH, X _{SOE-2}		R _S ¹ , SB	R _{HR} ¹ S ¹ , SB			FO	<i>OUT</i>
Delahanty	SOFC ²		S	R _W , SB XXX	<i>OUT</i>		R _S ¹ , TH	XXX
Moriarty	POX _S		<u>GO</u>	R _W	<i>S</i>		S ¹	
T. Jones	FO		S, SB	R _S	<i>OUT</i>		<i>OUT</i>	
Stanage	XXX	<i>OUT</i>	LO	R _{SOE-?} ¹	<i>OUT</i>			
Beckendorf							<i>OUT</i>	
Willett		<i>OUT</i>	XXX	R _T FO	XXX	<i>OUT</i>		
Lelivelt							XXX	<i>S</i>

EXPLANATIONS for scorecard — (a) For the headings of the Inning columns, the parenthetical terms give the number of runs scored in the inning. (b) For D. Jones: In the first inning, the “S” indicates that he singled and the superscript “R” indicates that he scored a run. In the second inning, the italicized “OUT” indicates that it was deduced that he was retired on an unknown play. In the fourth inning, the “GO” indicates that he grounded out; the “||” indicates that he batted twice in the inning, the “S” indicating that he singled (in his second at bat), the superscript “2” indicating that he batted in two runs, and the superscript “R” indicating that he scored a run. (c) For Cobb: In the third inning, the underlined GO indicates that a runner advanced a base on the groundout. In the fourth inning, for Cobb’s second at bat, the superscript “POX” indicates that he was retired on the basepath via a pickoff. In the seventh inning, the “HBP” indicates that he was hit by a pitched ball; the “SB” indicates that he stole a base. In the eighth inning, the italicized “S” indicates that the single was deduced. (d) For Crawford: In the first inning, the “SH” indicates that he had a sacrifice hit; the “SOE-2” indicates that he was safe on a fielding error by the catcher; the “X” indicates that he was retired on the base path. (e) The emboldened line between Delahanty and Moriarty in the third inning indicates that a pitching change occurred at that juncture, i.e., Wilson was replaced after Delahanty singled, Chesbro taking Wilson’s place to face Moriarty.

With regard to the deduced entries, the following comments are appropriate:

Second Inning — Based on the BBB-PBP information provided in the newspaper accounts for the first and third innings, it is known that only three players batted in the second inning — Stanage, Willett, and D. Jones. Since T. Jones made the third out in the first inning, Stanage must have led off in the second inning. And because Bush led off in the third inning, D. Jones must have been the last player to bat in the second inning. Since the official records show that Stanage had zero hits, he must have been retired in the second inning. Similarly, since the official records show that Willett had only one hit (which, according to the newspaper descriptions, was a triple in the third inning), he must have been retired in the second inning. And likewise, since the official records show that D. Jones had two hits (which, according to the newspaper descriptions were singles in the first and fourth innings), he must have been retired in the second inning.

Fifth and Sixth Innings — Based on the BBB-PBP information provided in the newspaper accounts for the fourth and seventh innings, it is known that seven players batted in the fifth and sixth innings — Delahanty, Moriarty, T. Jones, Stanage, Willett, D. Jones, and Bush. Since Crawford was the final batter in the fourth inning, Delahanty must have led off in the fifth inning. And because Cobb was the first batter in the seventh inning, Bush must have been the last player to bat in the sixth inning. Here is the pertinent information for each of the players who batted in the fifth and sixth innings:

[a] For Delahanty, according to the official records he had 4 at-bats, 2 hits (both singles), and 1 walk; from the BBB-PBP newspaper descriptions it is known precisely when he had 3 of his at-bats (1st, 3rd, and 7th), both of his hits (3rd and 7th), and his walk (4th); thus, it is deduced with 100% confidence that he was retired (by an unknown play) leading off the fifth inning.

[b] For Moriarty, according to the official records he had 4 at-bats, 3 hits (all singles), and 1 walk; from the BBB-PBP newspaper descriptions it is known precisely when he had 3 of his at-bats (1st, 3rd, and 7th), 2 of his hits (1st and 7th), and his walk (4th); thus, it is deduced with 100% confidence that he hit his (second) single in the fifth inning.

[c] For T. Jones, according to the official records he had 5 at-bats and 2 hits (both singles); from the BBB-PBP newspaper descriptions it is known precisely when he had 3 of his at-bats (1st, 3rd, and 4th) and both of his hits (3rd and 4th); thus, it is deduced with 100% confidence that he was retired (by an unknown play) in the fifth inning.

[d] For Stanage, following up on the second inning comments, it is deduced with 100% confidence that he was retired (by an unknown play) in the fifth inning.

Therefore, at this point, we know with 100% confidence that in the fifth inning Delahanty led off and was retired (by an unknown play), Moriarty singled, T. Jones was retired (by an unknown play), and Stanage was retired (by an unknown play) for the third out of the inning. And, therefore, we know with 100% confidence that Willett led off the sixth inning.

[e] For Willett, following up on the second inning comments, it is deduced with 100% confidence that he was retired leading off the sixth inning.

[f] For D. Jones, following up on the second inning comments, it is deduced with 100% confidence that he was retired (by an unknown play) in the sixth inning.

[g] For Bush, according to the official records he had 2 at-bats, 1 hit (a single), and 3 walks; from the BBB-PBP newspaper descriptions it is known precisely when he had 1 of hit at-bats (1st), his hit (1st), and all 3 of his walks (3rd, 4th, 4th); thus, it is deduced with 100% confidence that he was retired in the sixth inning. Moreover, since the official records show that he was struck out one time, he must have struck out in the sixth inning.

Therefore, at this point, we know with 100% confidence that in the sixth inning Willett led off and was retired (by an unknown play), D. Jones was retired (by and unknown play), and Bush struck out for the third out of the inning.

Seventh and Eighth Innings — Based on the BBB-PBP newspaper descriptions we know what each of the first four batters did: Cobb was hit by a pitched ball; Crawford flied out; Delahanty singled; and Moriarty singled. From the total plate appearances of each Detroit player, we know for certain that the last player to bat in the game for the Tigers was Crawford (who occupied the fourth slot in the batting order) — because he (as well as the three players who occupied the first three slots in the batting order [D. Jones (first), Bush+O’Leary (second), and Cobb(third)] had 6 plate appearances, while the players who occupied the other five positions in the batting lineup had 5 plate appearances — Delahanty, Moriarty, T. Jones, Stanage+Beckendorf, and Willett+Lelivelt. Thus, it is known for certain that at least Crawford, Cobb, and O’Leary batted in the eighth inning. Upon consideration of various BBB-PBP scenarios for the seventh and eighth innings, the BBB-PBP shown given above (and summarized in the scorecard) works the best. Here is the pertinent information for the players who batted in the eighth inning (working backwards from Crawford):

[a] For Crawford, according to the official records he had 5 at-bats, 3 hits (2 singles and 1 homer), and 1 sacrifice hit; from the BBB-PBP newspaper descriptions it is known precisely when he had 4 at-bats (3rd, 4th, 4th, and 7th), all three of his hits (3rd, 4th, 4th), and his sacrifice hit (1st); thus, it is deduced with 100% confidence that he was retired (by an unknown play) for the third out of the eighth inning (and the last out for the Tigers in the game).

[b] For Cobb, according to the official records he had 5 at-bats, 4 hits (3 singles and 1 homer), and one hit-by-pitch; from the BBB-PBP newspaper descriptions it is known precisely when he had 4 at-bats (1st, 3rd, 4th, 4th), 3 of his hits (1st, 4th, 4th), and his hit-by-pitch (7th); thus, it is deduced with 100% confidence that he collected his fourth hit (a single) in the eighth inning.

Therefore, because there must be three outs in the eighth inning — and the official records show that New York did not execute any double plays — at least two batters in addition to Crawford and Cobb must have batted in the eighth inning, i.e., O’Leary and D. Jones.

[c] For O’Leary, according to the official records he had 1 at-bat and 0 hits and 0 walks, hit-by-pitches, and sacrifice hits; thus, it is deduced with 100% confidence that he was retired (by an unknown play) in the eighth inning.

[d] For D. Jones, following up on the second inning comments and the sixth inning deduction, it is deduced with 100% confidence that he was retired (by an unknown play) in the eighth inning.

Therefore, at this point, we know with 100% confidence that at least four players batted in the eighth inning.

[e] For Lelivelt, according to the official records he had 1 at-bat and 1 hit (a single) and no walks, hit-by-pitches, and sacrifice hits; thus, it is deduced with 100% confidence that he singled. There are two possibilities for when he singled — in the seventh [in which case he (or some other player already on base) would have to have been retired on the base path after hitting his single) or in the eighth. For simplicity, I have chosen the eighth inning for Lelivelt hitting his single.

Therefore, at this point, we are left with two players to bat in the seventh inning after Moriarty singled — T. Jones and Beckendorf.

[f] For T. Jones, following up on the fifth and sixth inning comments and the fifth inning deduction, it is deduced with 100% confidence that he was retired (by an unknown play) in the seventh inning.

[g] For Beckendorf, according to the official records he had 1 at-bat and 0 hits and 0 walks, hit-by-pitches, and sacrifice hits; thus, it is deduced with 100% confidence that he was retired (by an unknown play) in the seventh inning.

Therefore, the above BBB-PBP (and summary scorecard) are entirely reasonable. However, it is emphatically asserted that this BBB-PBP is not the only reasonable scenario. For example, in the seventh inning, it’s possible that Beckendorf could have been safe on an error and that Lelivelt singled, but Moriarty was put out on the base

path. This scenario would then have D. Jones leading off the eighth inning and being retired (by an unknown play).

As indicated in the chart below, the above Batter-By-Batter Play-By-Play (including the scorecard summary) is in complete agreement with Official DBD records in terms of each players total plate appearances, at bats, runs (except for Bush and O’Leary), hits, and other plate appearances — walks, hit-by-pitched balls, and sacrifice hits.

Player	AB	R	H	Other PAs
D. Jones	1st-2nd-4th-4th-7th-8th	1st-4th	1st-4th	---
Bush O’Leary	1st-6th 8th	1st-3rd-4th-4th ---	1st ---	W (3rd), W (4th), W (4th) ---
Cobb	1st-3rd-4th-4th-8th	1st-4th-7th	1st-4th-4th-8th	HBP (7th)
Crawford	3rd-4th-4th-7th-8th	3rd-4th	3rd-4th-4th	SH (1st)
Delahanty	1st-3rd-5th-7th	4th-7th	3rd-7th	W (4th)
Moriarty	1st-3rd-5th-7th	4th	1st-5th-7th	W (4th)
T. Jones	1st-3rd-4th-5th-7th	4th	3rd-4th	---
Stanage Beckendorf	2nd-3rd-4th-5th 7th	4th ---	--- ---	--- ---
Willett Lelivelt	2nd-4th-4th-6th 8th	4th ---	4th 8th	--- ---

Thus, the Batter-By-Batter Play-By-Play irrefutably shows that O’Leary did not score — indeed, could not have scored — a run in the game. Similarly, the Batter-By-Batter Play-By-Play irrefutably shows that Bush did, in fact, score four runs in the game.

[B] Newspaper Texts

The *Detroit Free Press* sidebar “Told About The Tigers” includes the following:

“O’Leary went to short field in the eighth inning, replacing Bush. He was given a great hand when he came to bat. He is doing most of his work right now on the coaching lines, where his good head and thorough knowledge of the game makes him a valuable man. He is deservedly popular with the fans.” Since Detroit scored each of its 17 runs in the first seven innings and O’Leary did not enter the game until the top of the eighth inning, it was impossible for O’Leary to have scored a run.

The *Detroit Times* game account includes a number of miscellaneous items, two of which are germane to the Bush-O’Leary runs-scored issue:

“Charley O’Leary got a chance to keep his hand in by shortstopping in the last two innings.” That is, O’Leary played shortstop in the eighth and ninth innings. And, as shown in the Batter-By-Batter Play-By-Play, his only plate appearance was in the bottom of the eighth inning.

“Bush’s record was remarkable yesterday. Passed three ties, he scored four runs and got a hit.” Thus, it is clearly stated that Bush scored four runs (even though the box score shows him with three runs and O’Leary with one run).

October 3, 1909 — Detroit at Chicago — Detroit scored 3 runs

Sixth Inning — Detroit scored 1 run

DFP — “After Beckendorf had whiffed at the opening of the sixth, Lelivelt singled through Burnes and Parent and scored when McIntyre doubled to right. Cole made a long running catch of O’Leary’s liner, and McIntyre was caught stealing third, Payne to Tannehill.”

DN — Nothing at all.

Chicago Examiner (CHEX) — “Detroit evened up at once, mainly because Burnes neglected to take hold of Lelivelt’s hard bouncer, which he might have stopped. McIntyre doubled and scored Lelivelt, who was so weary after his race around the bases he retired. McIntyre tried to steal third and was nailed, leaving the score tied.”

Chicago Inter Ocean (CHIO) — “The Tigers’ portion of the sixth round opened with Burnes landing a strike-out on Beckendorf. Lelivelt hit one which was too high for Burnes to hold cleanly, but which he knocked down. The ball was deflected in such a way that Parent could not get to it in time to get the runner at first. McIntyre followed with a drive to the outside far corner of right field for two bases, Lelivelt coming all the way home. Altizer recovered the ball in good time and pegged to Isbell. Isbell held the ball just a second too long while he set himself to make a throw to the plate, and Lelivelt was safe by a yard.”

Chicago Record Herald (CHRECHLD) — “Beckendorf fanned and Lelivelt scratched a single by Burnes. McIntyre doubled to right and the Tiger slabman jogged home. O’Leary skied to Cole and McIntyre, trying to steal, was caught, Payne to Tannehill.”

Seventh Inning — Detroit scored 2 runs

DFP — “Schmidt started the seventh by bingling cleanly to center. Crawford laid down a perfect sacrifice bunt to Burnes, who tried to catch the runner at second with no success. Moriarty walked, filling the bases. Hereupon Delahanty grounded to Tannehill, and was out at first, Schmidt tallying. Gainer singled to right, counting Crawford, and Moriarty died trying to steal home.”

DN — Nothing at all.

CHEX — “Schmidt started off with a single and when Crawford dropped a bunt in front of the plate Payne threw to second. The decision was closed, but Detroit got it and Burnes made a bade matter worse by passing Moriarty and filling the bases. Delahanty pushed a slow roller to Tannehill, who failed to get the ball fairly in his hands. He decided not to throw home, allowing Schmidt to score, and tossed Delahanty out at first. Gainer poked a single to right, scoring Crawford.”

CHIO — “Schmidt opened with a single to center. Crawford bunted to Burnes, who threw to second to get Schmidt. The latter beat the ball, however, and all hands were safe. Moriarty made it three on the corners by working Burnes for four wide ones. Delahanty hit a sharp one to Tannehill. Tannehill fumbled the sphere for an instant, and then it was too late to try for Schmidt at the plate, and he had to hustle to get Delahanty at first. Gainer followed with a clean hit, Crawford scoring and Moriarty going to third. Moriarty tried to steal home while Burnes was winding up to pitch to Beckendorf, but Burnes managed to get the sphere into Payne’s hands in time to nip the attempted pilfer. Gainer moved over to second on this play. Beckendorf worked Burnes for a pass, and then Burnes let fly with a wild one which Payne could not handle. Gainer moved over to third, and tried to come home, but Payne went back to the grand stand and recovered the ball in time to toss to Burnes for the out.”

CHRECHLD — “Schmidt singled to left and took second when Crawford bunted and reached first as Payne clung to the ball in befuddled manner. Moriarty walked, filling the sacks, and Delahanty’s shot to Tannehill enabled Schmidt to register at the pan. Gainer batted one to right and Crawford sped home.”

RUNS SCORED according to newspaper box scores

DFP — Schmidt 1, Crawford 1, Lelivelt 1.

DN — Schmidt 1, Crawford 1, Lelivelt 1.

CHEX — Schmidt 1, Crawford 1, Lelivelt 1.

CHIO — Schmidt 1, Crawford 1, Lelivelt 1.

CHRECHLD — Schmidt 1, Crawford 1, Lelivelt 1.

RUNS SCORED according to official DBD records: Crawford 1, Lelivelt 1, Schmidt 1.

CONCLUSION:

- **Lelivelt scored 1 run in the game (in agreement with the official DBD records).**