

Accurate Runs-Scored Records for Players of the Deadball Era: The Players on the 1916 Detroit Tigers

by Herm Krabbenhoft

Appendix

April 21, 1916 — Detroit vs. Chicago — Detroit scored 3 runs

Sixth Inning — Detroit scored 2 runs

Detroit Free Press (DFP) — “Vitt started the Tigers on the road to prosperity by getting a single to Terry as an opener for the local sixth. A balk was called on Danforth and Vitt made second. Kavanagh’s out put him on third and Veach’s hit scored him. Veach was caught off first, but escaped, and went to third when Terry threw the ball into the Chicago dugout while the run-down was in progress. Heilmann lifted a pop fly that Collins had to grab on the run with his back to the plate. Veach took a chance and scored after the catch, Collins being unable to stop and steady himself in time to make a throw. Burns fouled to Schalk.”

Detroit Journal (DJ) — “Vitt opened the sixth with a single to left. He fussed about first base until he drew Danforth into a balk and advanced to second. Kavanagh grounded to Terry and Vitt made third. With the infield drawn in Veach laced one past Terry for a single, scoring Vitt. Veach wandered off first and Danforth caught him flat-footed, but Terry, after taking a throw from Fournier, threw into the Sox dugout and Veach went to third. Heilmann raised a fly back of second base that E. Collins made a great catch on, but could not recover in time to catch Veach going home. Heilmann was thus given credit for one of the shortest sacrifice flies on record.”

Detroit News (DN) — “Singles by Vitt and Veach, with a balk sandwiched and a two-base wild throw following Veach’s blow and a sacrifice fly by Heilmann scored two runs in the sixth.”

Detroit Times (DT) — “Vitt singled through short. Vitt went to second on Danforth’s balk. Terry threw out Kavanagh. Veach scored Vitt with a single to left. Veach was caught off first, but in the attempt to run him down Weaver [should be Terry] threw the ball into the Sox dugout and Veach went to third. Heilmann lifted a sacrifice fly to E. Collins in right center and Veach scored. Burns fouled to Schalk.”

Chicago Examiner (CHEX) — “Vitt opened the Tiger sixth with a single to short. It was a scratch blow. Then Umpire Chill called a balk. Kavanagh was pegged out by Terry and Vitt went to third. He scored when Veach singled to left. An instant later Danforth trapped Veach off first, but Terry, in returning the peg to Fournier, heaved the ball into the Sox dugout, Veach hurrying to third. He scored on E. Collins’ catch of Heilmann’s pop in short right center. Collins couldn’t turn in time to make the throw. Burns fouled to Schalk, ending the inning.”

Chicago Tribune (CHT) — “Vitt opened the fatal spasm with a single and was helped to second when Danforth made a peg to first which [umpire] Chill construed to be a balk. Kavanagh’s out advanced Vitt to third, then Veach poked a hit through the close drawn infield [and Vitt scored]. It would have been an easy out with the infield back. Danforth caught Veach off first, but he broke for second, then turned back to first. Terry relayed Fournier’s toss in the Sox bench and Veach went to third, from where he scored on Heilmann’s sacrifice fly. Burns fouled out.”

Seventh Inning — Detroit scored 1 run

DFP — “Young opened the seventh with a hit and was forced on Stanage’s bunt, cleverly handled by Danforth. Dauss fanned. Bush dropped a Texas Leaguer in right, however, and Stanage made third. Then Scott was called to the relief of Danforth. Vitt greeted Scott with a tall fly that Jackson ought to have caught in his hip pocket, but he didn’t start for the ball until too late. He made a somersaulting catch but dropped the ball, so it went for a two-base hit, Stanage scoring what proved to be the winning run and Bush making third. Kavanagh grounded out.”

DJ — “Young opened the seventh with a single to right, but was forced when Stanage popped one in front of Danforth. Dauss struck out but Bush singled, putting Stanage on third. Scott then relieved Danforth and Vitt greeted him with a double to left, scoring Stanage. Kavanagh ended the inning by grounding to Weaver.”

DN — “Danforth went out after Young and Bush hit in the seventh. Scott followed. Vitt’s single scored a run and put Bush on third. Kavanagh grounded.” [NOTE: The DN account did not mention that Young had been forced out by Stanage, who then scored the run.]

DT — “Young singled to right. Stanage bunted and Young was forced, Danforth to Terry. Dauss fanned. Bush sent Stanage to third with a Texas Leaguer into right field. Danforth was jerked out. [Scott replaced Danforth. Heilmann’s sacrifice fly to E. Collins scored Stanage.] Weaver threw out Kavanagh.”

CHEX — “Young started the seventh with a single to right. Danforth picked up a bunt by Stanage and threw Young out at second. Then Dauss fanned, but Bush slammed a single into right and Stanage reached third. Danforth ceased firing right here and Scott took his place. Vitt lifted a fly that Jackson misjudged and then came near catching. Stanage scored on the hit, and Bush should have followed him home, but [coacher] Burke stopped him at third.”

CHT — “Young opened the seventh with a single. Stanage forced him at second and Dauss struck out, but Bush dropped a Texas League single safely into short right, putting Stanage on third. Here Scott took Danforth’s place. Vitt lifted a high fly to left. Jackson started back on it, then tore in at top speed. He managed to catch the ball, but turned a complete somersault and failed to hold it. That let Stanage score the winning run, besides giving Vitt an undeserved hit.”

Summary of 3 runs scored by the Tigers

1 (Sixth Inning) — Vitt scored on a 1-RBI single by Veach.

2 (Sixth Inning) — Veach scored on a 1-RBI sacrifice fly by Heilmann.

3 (Seventh Inning) — Stanage scored on a 1-RBI double by Vitt.

Newspaper Box Scores — 3 runs scored by the Tigers

DFP — Vitt 1, Veach 1, Stanage 1; all other players (Bush, Kavanagh, Heilmann, Burns, Young, and Dauss) 0.

DJ — Vitt 1, Veach 1, Stanage 1; all other players (Bush, Kavanagh, Heilmann, Burns, Young, and Dauss) 0.

DN — Vitt 1, Veach 1, Stanage 1; none of the other players (Bush, Kavanagh, Heilmann, Burns, Young, and Dauss) are included in the listing.

DT — Vitt 1, Veach 1, Stanage 1; all other players (Bush, Kavanagh, Heilmann, Burns, Young, and Dauss) 0.

CHEX — Vitt 1, Veach 1, Stanage 1; all other players (Bush, Kavanagh, Heilmann, Burns, Young, and Dauss) 0.

CHT — Vitt 1, Veach 1, Stanage 1; all other players (Bush, Kavanagh, Heilmann, Burns, Young, and Dauss) 0.

Official DBD sheets — 3 runs scored by the Tigers

Veach 1, Vitt 1; all other players (Burns, Bush, Dauss, Heilmann, Kavanagh, Stanage, and Young) have a blank in the run (R) column.

CONCLUSION: The originally-recorded official DBD record for Stanage is wrong — Stanage actually scored 1 (not 0) run in the game on April 21, 1916. Therefore, Stanage actually scored 17 (not 16) runs during the entire 1916 season. And, for his career, Stanage actually scored 249 (not 248) runs.

Comment: The official DBD sheets show only 2 runs scored by the individual players — one run each by Veach and Vitt. The official DBD sheets show that the Detroit Tigers team scored 3 runs. Thus, there was a transcription error somewhere along the line in generating the official DBD sheets, specifically Stanage erroneously being shown with “no” runs since the cell for the April 16 game in the run (R) column is blank. Moreover, Stanage is mistakenly shown with one (1) hit in the hit (H) column while the batter-by-batter play-by-play description given in the Detroit Times account shows that he had zero hits — Third Inning, “Stanage was called out on strikes.” Fifth Inning, “Stanage walked.” Seventh Inning, “Stanage bunted and Young was forced, Danforth to Terry.” Likewise, the box score in each of the various newspaper accounts shows Stanage with 2 at bats, 1 run scored, and 0 hits. Thus, Stanage actually had 2 (not 3) at bats, 1 (not 0) run, 0 (not 1) hit, and 0 (not 1) total bases in the game.

May 17, 1916 — Detroit at Washington — Detroit scored 4 runs

Eighth Inning — Detroit scored 3 runs

DFP — “Dubuc tripled with one gone in the eighth and scored while Bush was being retired. Vitt doubled. Cobb walked and so did Dalton, who batted for G. Harper. The Washington hurler handed Heilmann three successive bad ones and then gave way to Ayers, who, after getting one strike on Heilmann, completed the work of passing him, forcing in Vitt. Burns cracked a beauty to left, scoring Cobb, and Heilmann was out trying to make third an instant before Dalton reached the plate.”

DJ — “Stanage was thrown out to start the Tigers’ eighth, but Dubuc tripled between Rondeau and Milan. McBride threw out Bush, Dubuc scoring. Vitt doubled to right center and Cobb walked. Dalton batted for G. Harper, the latter having replaced Veach when Kavanagh was sent in to hit for him in the seventh, and walked. Three balls had been thrown to Heilmann by H. Harper when he was yanked and Ayers came in. Ayers finished the job, forcing in Vitt. Burns shot a single past Foster and into left field, scoring Cobb. Dalton followed Cobb to the plate, but Heilmann was caught running into third base on Shanks throw to Foster, so Dalton’s run did not count.”

DN — “Dubuc was on third base with two out, on a triple, when Vitt hit him home. Cobb and Dalton then walked, filling the bases. There were three called balls on Heilmann when H. Harper was removed, Ayers replacing him. Ayers walked Heilmann, forcing Vitt over. This brought Burns up. Burns singled into left field. Cobb scored easily and Dalton dashed home. But before he reached the plate Heilmann ran into the ball thrown by Shanks to Foster, and was out.”

DT — “McBride threw out Stanage. Dubuc tripled to right center. McBride threw out Bush, Dubuc scoring. Vitt doubled to right. Cobb walked. Dalton batted for G. Harper. Dalton walked, filling the bases. H. Harper was taken out after pitching three balls to Heilmann. Ayers replaced him. Heilmann walked, forcing in Vitt. Burns singled, scoring Cobb, but Heilmann was out at third before Dalton passed the plate, Shanks to McBride to Foster.”

DT — “After Stanage had grounded out, Dubuc tripled to right center. Bush grounded out, but sent Dubuc home with the first run. Vitt singled [should be doubled]. Cobb and Dalton walked, so did Heilmann, forcing in Vitt. Burns singled. Cobb scored and Dalton crossed the plate safely. But Heilmann tried to reach third from first. Heilmann reached third and was put out before Dalton could step across the plate and that run didn’t count.”

Washington Evening Star (WES) — “Dubuc hit for three bases in this [eighth] inning, with one out. Bush also was disposed of and then Vitt doubled, scoring Dubuc. [NOTE: See WP description and note.] H. Harper walked Cobb and Dalton, batting for G. Harper, and had given Heilmann three balls when Ayers came into the game. Ayers pitched another ball to Heilmann, walking him and forcing Vitt over with the second run, and Burns singled, scoring Cobb. Dalton also crossed the plate on Burns’ wallop, but Shanks picked up the ball and whipped it to Foster in time to retire Heilmann, so Dalton’s run did not count.”

Washington Herald (WHLD) — “McBride tossed out Stanage for a starter, but Dubuc tripled to center. While McBride and Judge were retiring Bush, Dubuc crossed the plate. Vitt doubled, but Cobb walked and the bases were full when G. Harper [should be Dalton, who batted for G. Harper] also strolled. There were three called balls and no strikes on Heilmann when [manager] Griffith yanked H. Harper and substituted Ayers. Heilmann was passed, forcing in Vitt. Burns singled to left and Cobb was over the plate followed closely by Harper [should be Dalton], but Harper’s [should be Dalton’s] run was not permitted to count, as Heilmann, dashing madly for third, was put out, Shanks to Foster, before Harper [should be Dalton] crossed the plate.”

Washington Post (WP) — “Ayers was favored by a bit of luck in this [eighth] round after going in and facing a batter whom H. Harper had pitched three balls to without a strike. Previous to this, Dubuc had tripled with one out and scored on Vitt’s double after Bush was retired. Cobb and Dalton were passed and with three and nothing on Heilmann, Ayers took to the task. His first pitch to Heilmann was a strike; his next a ball and the batter walked [with Vitt being forced over the plate]. This brought up Burns. He singled to left, scoring Cobb. Dalton rounded third and dashed for the plate as Shanks whipped the ball to Foster. Heilmann made the fatal mistake of trying to reach third. He perished just a fraction of a second before Dalton could get home.” [NOTE: with the exception of the WP and WES accounts, all of the other accounts — including the batter-by-batter play-by-play DFP description — state that Dubuc scored on Bush’s groundout, not on Vitt’s double.]

Washington Times (WT) — “With one gone in the eighth Dubuc swatted a triple to the scoreboard, scoring on Bush’s death. Vitt came to time with a triple [should be double] to right center. H. Harper passed Cobb. Dalton took a free ticket, filling the bases, and H. Harper proceeded to give Heilmann three balls without a strike. [Manager] Griffith tipped H. Harper the high sign and in came Ayers. Putting over the first one was merely kidding, for the next one was wild and Heilmann walked, forcing Vitt across. Burns singled to left, scoring Cobb. Dalton thought he could score, too, and hustled for the plate. Heilmann went insane and tried for third. Shanks’ peg cut him off at third before Dalton crossed the plate, and [umpire] Evans announced that three, not four, runs had been scored.”

Ninth Inning — Detroit scored 1 run

DFP — “Young fanned to open the ninth but Stanage singled and Baker ran for him. Crawford batted for James and hit to right, Baker stopping at second. Bush slammed one to left, filling the bases. Vitt flied to Shanks and Baker could have scored but [manager] Jennings wisely wouldn’t let him take a chance. Ty filled ‘em up again by bounding a safety off Ayers’ glove [scoring Baker]. Dalton looked over a ball and a strike and then waved vigorously at two, which concluded the performance.”

DJ — “Young struck out to open the Tigers’ ninth, but Stanage singled. Baker ran for Stanage, and Crawford, batting for James, singled to right. Bush followed with another hit that filled the bases. Vitt sent a short fly to Shanks and Cobb singled, scoring Baker. Everything was up to Dalton and he took three vicious swings at the ball and missed them all.”

DN — “They [the Tigers] got four hits off Ayers in the ninth, but scored only one run. The bases were filled when Dalton came to bat, with two out. He struck out, ending the Tigers’ chances. ... Crawford went to bat in the ninth, hitting for James, and came through with a clean single to right field.”

DT — “Baker and Crawford pinch hit and each singled. So did Bush, filling the bases. Vitt flied for the second out, but Cobb singled through the box and scored Baker. Then Dalton came up. Dalton fanned and the game was over.” [NOTE: According to descriptions in other newspaper accounts (*DFP*, *DJ*, *WHLD*, *WP*, and *WT*), Baker entered the game as a substitute runner for Stanage after Stanage had singled; Baker did not bat for Stanage and single.]

WES — “In the ninth singles by Stanage, Crawford, Bush, and Cobb netted the Tigers another run, but Ayers retired the side by striking out Dalton.”

WHLD — “Young, the first man up, fanned. Stanage singled to left and Baker was ordered to run for him. Crawford, pinch hitting for James, singled to right and on Bush’s safe blow to center the bases were full. Shanks camped under Vitt’s fly, nobody caring to take liberties with Shank’s throwing arm. Cobb shot a hot one off the pitcher’s glove. This hit scored Baker with the bases full. Dalton took three healthy swings and the game was over.”

WP — “Ayers fanned Young, the first batter to face him in this [ninth] round. Stanage singled and Baker was put on to run for him. Crawford batted for James. Crawford hit to right for a base and Bush followed suit, filling up the sacks. Vitt flied to Shanks, who held Baker on third. Cobb bounced a hit off Ayers’ glove, sending Baker across. Dalton whiffed, ending the game.”

WT — “Ayers started by fanning Young. Stanage singled, and so did Crawford, batting for James. Baker ran for Stanage and reached third on Burns’ single to left, the bases being filled. Shanks went over and brought down Vitt’s fly ball. Cobb almost broke Ayers’ hand, bumping a hot one off in the general direction of right field. By wild sprinting Baker managed to score and the bases were all crowded with Tigers as Ayers rose to the emergency and fanned Dalton.”

SUMMARY of the 4 runs scored by the Tigers

- 1 (Eighth Inning) — Dubuc scored on a 1-RBI groundout by Bush.
- 2 (Eighth Inning) — Vitt scored on a 1-RBI bases-loaded walk to Heilmann.
- 3 (Eighth Inning) — Cobb scored on a 1-RBI single by Burns.

- 4 (Ninth Inning) — Baker scored on a 1-RBI single by Cobb.

Newspaper Box Scores — 4 runs scored by the Tigers

DFP — Vitt 1, Cobb 1, Dubuc 1, Baker 1; all other players (Bush, Veach, Harper, Dalton, Heilmann, Burns, Young, Stanage, James, Kavanagh, and Crawford) 0.

DJ — Vitt 1, Cobb 1, Dubuc 1, Baker 1; all other players (Bush, Veach, Harper, Dalton, Heilmann, Burns, Young, Stanage, James, Kavanagh, and Crawford) 0.

DN — Vitt 1, Cobb 1, Dubuc 1, Baker 1; none of the other players (Bush, Veach, Harper, Dalton, Heilmann, Burns, Young, Stanage, James, Kavanagh, and Crawford) are included in the listing.

DT — Vitt 1, Cobb 1, Dubuc 1, Baker 1; all other players (Bush, Veach, Harper, Dalton, Heilmann, Burns, Young, Stanage, James, Kavanagh, and Crawford) 0.

WES — Vitt 1, Cobb 1, Dubuc 1, Baker 1; all other players (Bush, Veach, Harper, Dalton, Heilmann, Burns, Young, Stanage, James, Kavanagh, and Crawford) 0.

WHLD — Vitt 1, Cobb 1, Dubuc 1, Baker 1; all other players (Bush, Veach, Harper, Dalton, Heilmann, Burns, Young, Stanage, James, Kavanagh, and Crawford) 0.

WP — Vitt 1, Cobb 1, Dubuc 1, Baker 1; all other players (Bush, Veach, Harper, Dalton, Heilmann, Burns, Young, Stanage, James, Kavanagh, and Crawford) 0.

WT — Vitt 1, Cobb 1, Dubuc 1, Baker 1; all other players (Bush, Veach, Harper, Dalton, Heilmann, Burns, Young, Stanage, James, Kavanagh, and Crawford) 0.

Official DBD sheets — 4 runs scored by the Tigers

Cobb 1, Dubuc 1, Veach 1, Vitt 1; all other players (Baker, Burns, Bush, Crawford, Dalton, Harper, Heilmann, James, Kavanagh, Stanage, and Young) have a blank in the run (R) column.

CONCLUSION: The originally-recorded DBD records for Baker and Veach are wrong — Baker actually scored 1 (not 0) run and Veach actually scored 0 (not 1) runs in the game on May 17, 1916. Therefore, for the full 1916 season, Baker actually scored 8 (not 7) runs and Veach actually scored 91 (not 92) runs. And, for their careers, Baker actually scored 28 (not 27) runs and Veach actually scored 952 (not 953) runs.

Comment: Somehow a transcription error made its way into the originally-generated official DBD records such that Veach was mistakenly credited with the run that Baker actually scored in the game on May 17, 1916.

September 14, 1916 — Detroit vs. New York — Detroit scored 2 runs

Seventh Inning — Detroit scored 1 run

DFP — “The Jungaleers woke up to the extent of scoring one run immediately [in the last of the seventh inning] on a double by Veach and a single by Young. ... Veach cracked out a double to right to begin the Detroit half [of the seventh] and made third while Crawford was being disposed of by Mullen and Shocker. Heilmann fanned but Young whaled one back at Shocker so fast he couldn’t get hold of it and Veach scored. Peckinpaugh picked up the ball that had bounced off Shocker and, in trying to make an impossible play, threw it into the dugout, Young taking second. He died there when Harper, batting for Stanage, fled to Magee.”

DJ — “In the seventh Veach doubled and took second on Crawford’s out. Heilmann fanned. Young then singled, scoring Veach.”

DN — “Veach doubled in the seventh and scored on a single by Young after two were gone.”

DT — “Veach doubled to the left field screen. Crawford was out, Mullen to Shocker. Heilmann fanned. Young scored Veach on a single through the box and took second on Peckinpaugh’s wild throw. Harper batted for Stanage. Harper flied to Magee.”

New York Sun (NYSUN) — “Veach opened the seventh with a double to right. Veach took third on Crawford’s out, Mullen to Shocker, and after Heilmann fanned, Young scored Veach with an infield hit.”

New York Times (NYT) — Nothing at all.

New York Tribune (NYTRB) — “The Tigers got a run in the seventh inning. Veach doubled, took third on an infield out by Crawford, and scored on a hit by Young.”

Ninth Inning — Detroit scored 1 run

DFP — “... but the Tigers opened up one of their famous ninth inning drives after one was out. A triple by Veach started it and a double by Crawford scored Veach. Heilmann went out on a grounder to F. Baker, but Young walked. McKee batted for D. Baker and terminated everything by fouling to Mullen, who made a very nice catch in front of the visitors’ dugout. ... Cobb, first up in the ninth, flied to Baumann.”

DJ — “In the ninth Veach tripled, after Cobb had flied out. Crawford doubled, scoring Veach. Heilmann grounded to F. Baker and Young walked. McKee batted for D. Baker and fouled to Mullen.

DN — “Veach tripled in the ninth and was driven home by Crawford, who hit for two bases. There was a chance to tie in this inning as Young walked after Heilmann grounded. But they couldn’t come through.”

DT — Nothing at all.

NYSUN — “After Cobb flied to Baumann, Veach drove a long triple to right and Crawford met another one on the seams, and it also streaked to right, but Crawford only ran it into a double, scoring Veach. F. Baker threw out Heilmann and Young walked. McKee batted for D. Baker and ended the game with a foul to Mullen.”

NYT — Nothing at all.

NYTRB — “In the ninth Veach tripled and tallied when Crawford doubled.”

Summary of the 2 runs scored by the Tigers

1 (Seventh Inning) — Veach scored on a 1-RBI single by Young.

2 (Ninth Inning) — Veach scored on a 1-RBI double by Crawford.

Newspaper Box Scores — 2 runs scored by the Tigers

DFP — Veach 2; all of the other players (Vitt, Bush, Cobb, Crawford, Heilmann, Young, Stanage, D. Baker, Mitchell, Boland, Burns, Harper, and McKee) 0.

DJ — Veach 2; all of the other players (Vitt, Bush, Cobb, Crawford, Heilmann, Young, Stanage, D. Baker, Mitchell, Boland, Burns, Harper, and McKee) 0.

DN — Veach 2; none of the other players (Vitt, Bush, Cobb, Crawford, Heilmann, Young, Stanage, D. Baker, Mitchell, Boland, Burns, Harper, and McKee) are included in the listing.

DT — Veach 2; all of the other players (Vitt, Bush, Cobb, Crawford, Heilmann, Young, Stanage, D. Baker, Mitchell, Boland, Burns, Harper, and McKee) 0.

NYSUN — Veach 2; all of the other players (Vitt, Bush, Cobb, Crawford, Heilmann, Young, Stanage, D. Baker, Mitchell, Boland, Burns, Harper, and McKee) 0.

NYT — Veach 2; all of the other players (Vitt, Bush, Cobb, Crawford, Heilmann, Young, Stanage, D. Baker, Mitchell, Boland, Burns, Harper, and McKee) 0.

NYTRB — Veach 2; all of the other players (Vitt, Bush, Cobb, Crawford, Heilmann, Young, Stanage, D. Baker, Mitchell, Boland, Burns, Harper, and McKee) 0.

Official DBD sheets — 2 runs scored by the Tigers

Veach 2, Vitt 4; all other players (D. Baker, Boland, Burns, Bush, Crawford, Cobb, Harper, Heilmann, McKee, Mitchell, and Stanage) have a blank in the run (R) column.

CONCLUSION: The originally-recorded official DBD record for Vitt is wrong — Vitt actually scored 0 (not 4) runs in the game on September 14, 1916. Therefore, Vitt actually scored 84 (not 88) runs during the entire 1916 season. And, for his career, Vitt actually scored 556 (not 560) runs.

Comment: The official DBD sheets show 6 runs scored by the individual players — 2 runs by Veach and 4 runs by Vitt. But the official DBD sheets for the Tigers team shows that they scored only 2 runs. Thus, a transcription error was introduced somewhere along the line in the generation of the official DBD sheets, specifically Vitt being shown with no at bats (i.e., his AB cell is blank) and 4 runs scored. Furthermore, each of the newspaper box scores shows Vitt with 4 at bats and 0 runs scored. Thus, Vitt actually had 4 (not 0) at bats and 0 (not 4) runs in the game.