

Record: Most Times Replaced by a Courtesy Runner, Game

by Herm Krabbenhoft, Keith Carlson, David Newman, and Richard Dixie Tourangeau

APPENDIX

Text descriptions of the runs scored by the Phillies from various newspaper accounts:

First Inning — Philadelphia scored 3 runs

Philadelphia Inquirer (PINQ) — “The Phillies opened in a lively manner, scoring three runs on a base on balls to Hamilton, a two-baser by Cross, a triple by Thompson, and a single by Hallman.”

Philadelphia Evening Item (PEI) — Nothing at all.

Philadelphia North American (PNA) — “The Phillies made three runs in the first inning on a base on balls to Hamilton, Boyle’s neat sacrifice, Cross’ two-baser, Turner’s force, Thompson’s triple, and Hallman’s single.”

Philadelphia Press (PPRS) — “Hamilton drew a base on balls as a starter, went to second on Boyle’s sacrifice, and scored on Cross’ double to left. Turner hit to Dahlen, who ran out Cross. Thompson followed with a three-bagger over Lange’s head and Turner counted. Hallman pushed a single over Dahlen’s head and scored Thompson. Clements was thrown out by Parrott.”

Philadelphia Public Ledger (PPL) — “The Phillies made three runs in the first inning on a base on balls to Hamilton, Boyle’s sacrifice, Cross’ two-bagger, Turner’s force, Thompson’s three-baser, and Hallman’s single.”

Philadelphia Record (PREC) — “... a base on balls to Hamilton, Boyle’s sacrifice, a two-bagger by Cross, Turner’s force, Thompson’s triple to the centre field corner of the grounds, and Hallman’s single yielding three runs.”

Chicago Tribune (CHT) — “... a base on balls to Hamilton, Boyle’s sacrifice, a two-bagger by Cross, Turner’s force, Thompson’s triple to the centre field corner of the grounds, and Hallman’s single yielding three runs.”

Chicago Inter Ocean (CHIO) — “The game started by Hamilton getting a base on balls and reaching second on Boyle’s sacrifice. Three hits then followed, a two-bagger by Cross, a triple by Thompson, and a single by Hallman, three runs being scored.”

Chicago Times (CHTMS) — Nothing at all.

Second Inning — Philadelphia scored 4 runs

PINQ — “The Phillies kept it up in the second when Taylor’s two-baser, Hamilton’s single and two steals, Cross’ single, and doubles by Turner and Thompson earned four runs.”

PEI — Nothing at all.

PNA — “... four [runs] in the second on Taylor’s double, Hamilton’s single, his steal of second and third, Cross’ hit, and doubles by Turner and Thompson.”

PPRS — “After Sullivan had been thrown out by Irwin, Taylor planted a double against the center field fence and scored on Hamilton’s single. Hamilton stole second. Boyle flied to Ryan. Hamilton stole third and scored on Cross’ single. Cross came in on a double by Turner, the latter counting on a similar drive by Thompson. Hallman flied to Dahlen, who made a clever back running catch.”

PPL — "... four [runs] in the second on Taylor's double, Hamilton's single, his steal of second and third, Cross' single, and doubles by Turner and Thompson."

PREC — "Four more men scored in the second inning on a double by Taylor, Dahlen's excusable miss of Hamilton's grounder, two steals, Hamilton purloining both second and third, singles by Cross and Turner, and Thompson's double."

CHT — "Four more men scored in the second inning on a double by Taylor, Dahlen's excusable miss of Hamilton's grounder, two steals, Hamilton purloining both second and third, singles by Cross and Turner, and Thompson's double."

CHIO — "The Phillies scored four more runs, all earned, in the second on two-baggers by Taylor, Turner, and Thompson and singles by Hamilton and Cross. After reaching first Hamilton stole second and third."

CHTMS — Nothing at all.

Third Inning — Philadelphia scored 3 runs

PINQ — "In the Phillies' third Clements singled to right, Sullivan bunted safely, and Taylor went to first on balls. Schriver made a wild throw to first which cleared the bases." [NOTE: This *PINQ* description may be considered "to be truthful, but not wholly truthful" — because it does not state specifically who were the base-runners who scored as a consequence of the base-clearing wild throw. Thus, this *PINQ* description suggests that Clements, Sullivan, and Taylor scored the runs on Schriver's wild base-clearing throw. See, however, the description given in the *CHIO* account.]

PEI — Nothing at all.

PNA — "The Phillies made three [runs] in the third on hits by Clements and Sullivan, bases on balls to Taylor and Hamilton, Schriver's wild throw to catch Taylor napping, and Irwin's error."

PPRS — "Clements and Sullivan made hits in the third and Taylor reached first on balls. Schriver tried to catch Taylor napping off first and made a wild throw, the ball rolling out to right, Clements and Sullivan coming in. Ryan threw to third and Irwin let the ball get away and Taylor also counted. Hamilton got to first on balls, but was immediately doubled with Boyle on the latter's hit to Dahlen. Cross was thrown out by Parrott." [NOTE: This *PPRS* description states specifically that Clements and Sullivan scored as a consequence of Schriver's wild throw and that Taylor scored as a consequence of Schriver's wild throw and Irwin's error. See, however, the *CHIO* description.]

PPL — "The Phillies made three [runs] in the third on singles by Clements and Sullivan, bases on balls to Taylor and Hamilton, Schriver's gorgeous wild throw to catch Taylor napping at first, and Irwin's error."

PREC — Nothing at all.

CHT — Nothing at all.

CHIO — "Clements and Sullivan opened with singles and four bad balls to Taylor filled the bases. Schriver threw to Decker to catch Taylor off first and the ball rolled out to right field. Thompson, who was running for Clements, and Sullivan crossed the plate, and when Irwin allowed Ryan's return of the ball to go through him Taylor kept on home." [NOTE: Thompson was already in the game when he ran for Clements — Thompson was the starting right fielder, batting in the fifth slot of the batting order, i.e., two slots ahead of Clements. Thus, Thompson was a *courtesy runner* for Clements. None of the other descriptions mention Thompson being a courtesy runner for Clements].

CHTMS — Nothing at all.

Sixth Inning — Philadelphia scored 2 runs

PINQ — “Two runs were added to the Phillies score in the sixth on singles by Boyle and Cross, a fumble by Lange, and two outs.”

PEI — Nothing at all.

PNA — “... two in the sixth on singles by Boyle and Cross, Lange’s fumble, and Thompson’s long fly.”

PPRS — “The Phillies made one [run] in the sixth on singles by Boyle and Cross and a fumble by Lange.”

PPL — “... two in the sixth on singles by Boyle and Cross, Lange’s fumble, and Thompson’s fly.”

PREC — Nothing at all.

CHT — Nothing at all.

CHIO — “Boyle and Cross made the circuit on their singles, a fumble by Lange, and Thompson’s fly to Ryan.”

CHTMS — Nothing at all.

Seventh Inning — Philadelphia scored 1 run

PINQ — “In the seventh the Phillies made a run on Clements’ being hit, a wild pitch, Taylor’s force hit, and Hamilton’s single.”

PEI — Nothing at all.

PNA — “... one [run] in the seventh on Clements’ being hit by a pitched ball, Taylor’s force, and Hamilton’s long single.”

PPRS — “Taylor’s force, an out, and Hamilton’s single netted the Phillies a run in the seventh.”

PPL — “... one [run] in the seventh on Clements’ being hit by a pitched ball, Taylor’s force, and Hamilton’s long single.”

PREC — Nothing at all.

CHT — Nothing at all.

CHIO — “Clements was hit by a pitched ball and Hallman, who took his place, got to third on a wild pitch. Sullivan flew out to Parrott and on Taylor’s grounder to Dahlen [Hallman] was run out by the latter, Schriver, and Parrot, Taylor reaching third on the play and coming home on Hamilton’s single.” [NOTE: Hallman was already in the game when he ran for Clements — he was the starting second baseman, batting in the sixth slot in the batting order, i.e., one slot ahead of Clements. Thus, Hallman was a courtesy runner for Clements. See also the *CHIO* description for the third inning.]

CHTMS — Nothing at all.

Ninth Inning — Philadelphia scored 3 runs

PINQ — “... and in the ninth the Phillies made three more runs on singles by Sullivan, Taylor, Cross, and Turner, a sacrifice by Hamilton, and two bases on balls.”

PEI — Nothing at all.

PNA — "... and three [runs] in the ninth on singles by Sullivan, Taylor, Cross, and Turner, Hamilton's sacrifice, and a base on balls to Boyle."

PPRS — "... and the Phillies made three more [runs] in the ninth on singles by Sullivan and Taylor, Boyle's base on balls, and Cross' and Turner's base hits."

PPL — "... and three [runs] in the ninth on singles by Sullivan, Taylor, Cross, and Turner, Hamilton's sacrifice, and Boyle's base on balls."

PREC — Nothing at all.

CHT — Nothing at all.

CHIO — "Singles by Sullivan, Taylor, Cross, and Turner, two bases on balls, and Hamilton's sacrifice gave Philadelphia the last runs of the game in the ninth."

CHTMS — Nothing at all.

SUMMARY of the 16 runs scored by the Phillies

1 (First Inning) — Hamilton scored on a 1-RBI double by Cross.

2 (First Inning) — Turner scored on a 1-RBI triple by Thompson.

3 (First Inning) — Thompson scored on a 1-RBI single by Hallman.

4 (Second Inning) — Taylor scored on a 1-RBI single by Hamilton.

5 (Second Inning) — Hamilton scored on a 1-RBI single by Cross.

6 (Second Inning) — Cross scored on a 1-RBI double by Turner.

7 (Second Inning) — Turner scored on a 1-RBI double by Thompson.

8 (Third Inning) — Thompson (courtesy-running for Clements) scored (from third base) on a fielding error (wild throw to first) by the catcher Schriver.

9 (Third Inning) — Sullivan scored (from second base) on a fielding error (wild throw to first) by the catcher Schriver.

10 (Third Inning) — Taylor scored (from first base) on a fielding error (wild throw to first) by the catcher Schriver coupled with a fielding error (muffed catch) by the third baseman Irwin.

11 (Sixth Inning) — Boyle scored (from first base) on a single by Cross coupled with a fielding error (fumbled pickup) by the center fielder Lange.

12 (Sixth Inning) — Cross scored on a 1-RBI flyout by Thompson.

13 (Seventh Inning) — Taylor scored on a 1-RBI single by Hamilton.

14 (Ninth Inning) — ?

15 (Ninth Inning) — ?

16 (Ninth Inning) — ?

For the ninth inning, none of the descriptions state specifically which players scored the runs. All that can be gleaned from the text descriptions is that at least six players got on base — Sullivan (single), Taylor (single), Boyle (walk), Cross (single), Turner (single), and Thompson (walk). Fortunately, however, the identities of the three players who did score the three ninth-inning runs can be readily deduced from the runs-scored numbers presented in the box scores provided in the newspaper accounts, which are given in Table 1. Taking into account the complete details for the runs scored in the first, second, third, sixth, and seventh innings (as summarized above), it is crystal-clear that the 13 Philadelphia runs scored in these five innings were scored by Hamilton (2), Boyle (1), Cross (2), Turner (2), Thompson (2), Hallman (0), Clements (0), Sullivan (1), and Taylor (3).

Knowing who scored the runs in those five innings from the text descriptions and knowing the total runs each player scored according to the box score allows one to do the arithmetic and deduce with 100% confidence which players scored the three ninth-inning runs — Sullivan, Taylor, and Boyle. But, while we know who scored the three ninth-inning runs, we do not know for certain who batted in the ninth-inning runs scored by Sullivan, Taylor, and Boyle. As shown here, reasonable various scenarios can be conjectured for assigning RBI credit. First, here's the basic play-by-play:

Sullivan singled, and subsequently scored.
Taylor singled, and subsequently scored.
Hamilton sacrificed.
Boyle walked, and subsequently scored.
Cross singled.
Turner singled.
Thompson walked.

From the basic play-by-play various scenarios can be formulated with RBI numbers assigned; here are a few:

[A] Sullivan singled. Taylor singled, advancing Sullivan to third. Hamilton sacrificed, scoring Sullivan and advancing Taylor to second. Boyle walked. Cross singled, scoring Taylor and advancing Boyle to third. Turner singled, scoring Boyle. [RBIs — Hamilton 1, Cross 1, Turner 1.]

[B] Sullivan singled. Taylor singled, advancing Sullivan to second. Hamilton sacrificed, advancing Sullivan to third and Taylor to second. Boyle walked, filling the bases. Cross singled, scoring Sullivan and Taylor and advancing Boyle to third. Turner singled, scoring Boyle. [RBIs — Cross 2, Turner 1.]

[C] Sullivan singled. Taylor singled, advancing Sullivan to second. Hamilton sacrificed, advancing Sullivan to third and Taylor to second. Boyle walked, filling the bases. Cross singled, scoring Sullivan and advancing Taylor to third and Boyle to second. Turner singled, scoring Taylor and Boyle. [RBIs — Cross 1, Turner 2.]

There are, of course, other reasonable (i.e., not far-fetched) scenarios that can be envisioned. So, we'll summarize the three ninth-inning runs as follows:

14 (Ninth Inning) — Sullivan scored on a 1-RBI sacrifice by Hamilton ... OR ... on a 2-RBI single by Cross ... OR ... on a 1-RBI single by Cross ... OR ...

15 (Ninth Inning) — Taylor scored on a 1-RBI single by Cross ... OR ... on a 2-RBI single by Cross ... OR ... on a 2-RBI single by Turner ... OR ...

16 (Ninth Inning) — Boyle scored on a 1-RBI single by Turner ... OR ... on a 2-RBI single by Turner ... OR ...

Deduction of the events not described in the text descriptions given in the various newspaper accounts.

From the descriptions in the newspaper game accounts for the first, second, third, sixth, and ninth innings we can summarize the batter-by-batter events in a scorecard, i.e., the (partial) scorecard A-1:

Scorecard A-1. From Information in Newspaper Game Accounts.

Player [PA] (h-w-@-O)	1 (3)	2 (4)	3 (3)	4 (0)	5 (0)	6 (2)	7 (1)	8 (0)	9 (3)
Hamilton [6] (2-2-1-1)	*W	*S ¹ (SB,SB)					S ¹		sac
Boyle [6] (1-1-1-3)	sac	FO			XXX	E-8*S			W
Cross [6] (4-0-0-2)	^x D ¹	*S ¹				*S			S
Turner [6] (2-1-0-3)	*SOFC	*D ¹				OUT			S
Thompson [6] (3-1-0-2)	*T ¹	D ¹				FO ¹			W
Hallman [6] (2-0-0-4)	S ¹	FO							
Clements [5] (2-0-1-2)	GO	XXX	E-2*S(CR)			XXX	^x HBP(CR)		XXX
Sullivan [5] (2-0-0-3)	XXX	GO	E-2*S				FO	XXX	S
Taylor [5] (2-2-0-1)		*D	E-2,5*W				*SOFC		S

EXPLANATION of Scorecard Entries

- For the “Player [PA] (h-w-@-O)” column, “PA” gives the plate appearances the player had; “h” gives the hits the player had; “w” gives the walks the player received; “@” gives other plate appearances (sacrifice hits or times hit by a pitched ball) the player had; “O” gives the number of times the player was retired as a batter.
- For the Inning columns, the number in parentheses gives the number of runs scored in the inning.
- * Most of the entries should be readily recognizable. Let’s go through the first three innings to cover all the bases:

FIRST INNING:

- *W indicates that Hamilton walked and subsequently scored (i.e., the “W” is for walk and the asterisk indicates that the players subsequently scored).
- sac indicates that Boyle sacrificed.
- ^xD¹ indicates that Cross doubled, batting in one run, and was subsequently retired on the basepath (i.e., the “D” is for double, the superscript “1” gives the number or RBIs the player achieved, and the superscript “x” indicates that the player was subsequently put out on the basepath).
- *SOFC indicates that Turner was safe on a fielder’s choice and subsequently scored.
- *T¹ indicates that Thompson triples, batting in one run, and subsequently scored.
- S¹ indicates that Hallman singled, batting in one run.
- GO indicates that Clements grounded out.
- XXX indicates that the inning is complete.

SECOND INNING:

- *S¹(SB,SB) indicates that Hallman singled, batting in one run, and had 2 stolen bases and subsequently scored.
- FO indicates that Boyle flied out.

THIRD INNING:

- E-2*S(CR) indicates that Clements singled and was replaced by a courtesy runner who subsequently scored as a consequence of a fielding error by the catcher.

Three box score items that still need to be included in the scorecard are the three double plays pulled by Chicago: (a) Dahlen-Decker (6-3); (b) Lange-Decker (8-3); (c) Lange-Dahlen (8-6). One of the double plays was described in the *CHT* account — “Lange’s catch of Hamilton’s fly off the center field fence was the prettiest play of the game. Taylor was on first base when the hit was made, and thinking he would surely be safe the tall pitcher sprinted for

second and had passed that base when the catch was made. He then tried hard to get back to first ahead of the throw, and was making such good time that it seemed possible for him to do it, when Hamilton, who had slowed up after the catch, coolly headed off the ball and caught it on a long bound. The umpire, of course, promptly declared Taylor out.”

The blanks in Scorecard A-1 can be filled in by deduction. Let’s begin with the ninth inning. We know from the plate appearance numbers for the Phillies that Hallman was the last player to bat in the game for Philadelphia — Hallman had six plate appearances and Clements had five plate appearances. Therefore, we can place a Triple-X in Clements’ ninth-inning cell. And, since there must be three outs in the ninth inning and only one out is presently shown (Hamilton’s sacrifice), Hallman must have hit into a double play. With regard to which players scored the three ninth-inning runs, assuming the box score runs-scored information is correct and considering the runs-scored information given in the various game accounts, the three ninth-inning runs were scored by Sullivan, Taylor, and Boyle. Since the descriptions in the newspaper game accounts did not state who batted in whom, it is not possible to assign RBI credit. It is not unreasonable to presume that Sullivan’s single, Taylor’s single, Hamilton’s sacrifice, and Boyle’s walk loaded the bases. Cross’ single could have batted in both Sullivan and Taylor or just Sullivan; Turner’s single could have batted in both Taylor and Boyle or just Boyle. For simplicity, we’ll presume that Cross’ single batted in Sullivan and that Turner’s single batted in Taylor and Boyle. Irrespective of who batted in whom, when Thompson walked in the ninth, the bases became loaded again. Then Hallman hit into a double play, although it is not known who was retired for the final out. For simplicity, we’ll presume the double play went Lange-Decker (8-6) and that Turner was caught off second base. Incorporating this gives Scorecard A-2:

Scorecard A-2. From Scorecard A-1 and Deductions for the Ninth Inning.

Player [PA] (h-w-@-O)	1 (3)	2 (4)	3 (3)	4 (0)	5 (0)	6 (2)	7 (1)	8 (0)	9 (3)
Hamilton [6] (2-2-1-1)	*W	*S ¹ (SB,SB)					S ¹		sac
Boyle [6] (1-1-1-3)	sac	FO			XXX	E-8*S			*W
Cross [6] (4-0-0-2)	XD ¹	*S ¹				*S			S ¹
Turner [6] (2-1-0-3)	*SOFC	*D ¹				OUT			XS ²
Thompson [6] (3-1-0-2)	*T ¹	D ¹				FO ¹			W
Hallman [6] (2-0-0-4)	S ¹	FO							(DP)
Clements [5] (2-0-1-2)	GO	XXX	E-2*S(CR)			XXX	XHBP(CR)		XXX
Sullivan [5] (2-0-0-3)	XXX	GO	E-2*S				FO	XXX	*S
Taylor [5] (2-2-0-1)		*D	E-2,5*W				*SOFC		*S

NOTE: A deduced or presumed event is enclosed in parentheses, such as the double play that Hallman hit into to end the ninth inning — (DP).

Let’s now consider the eighth inning. We know that Clements was the last batter in the eighth inning and that, therefore, he was either retired for the third out or caused another player to be retired for the third out. For simplicity, let’s presume that Clements was retired for the third out. We know that Hamilton singled in the seventh inning with two outs. Therefore, assuming that Hamilton was not caught stealing or picked off, Boyle had to bat in the seventh inning. We know what Boyle did in four of his plate appearances (sac, FO, S, and W). Therefore, we know that in his other two plate appearances he was retired. Therefore, we can reliably presume that Boyle was retired in the seventh inning, thereby ending the seventh inning. That means that Cross, Turner, Thompson, Hallman, and Clements batted in the eighth inning. We know what Cross did in four of his plate appearances (D,S,S,S). Therefore, we can reliably presume that he was retired leading off the eighth inning. We know what

Turner did in four of his plate appearances (SOFC, D, OUT, and S). Therefore, we know that in the eighth inning he either walked or was retired. Similarly, we know what Thompson did in four of his plate appearances (T, D, FO, W). Therefore, we know that in the eighth inning he either got a single or made an out. And, we know what Hallman did in two of his plate appearances (S and FO). Therefore, we know that in the eighth inning he either got a single or made an out. So, at this point in our treatment of the eighth inning, we have two outs (Cross and Clements) and three batters left to bat (Turner, Thompson, and Hallman). One of these players must make an out and the other two must get on base. Let's presume that Turner makes an out and that Thompson and Hallman each single. This closes the eighth inning and gives Scoreboard A-3:

Scorecard A-3. From Scorecard A-2 and Deductions for the Eighth Inning.

Player [PA] (h-w-@-O)	1 (3)	2 (4)	3 (3)	4 (0)	5 (0)	6 (2)	7 (1)	8 (0)	9 (3)
Hamilton [6] (2-2-1-1)	*W	*S ¹ (SB,SB)					S ¹		sac
Boyle [6] (1-1-1-3)	sac	FO			XXX	E-8*S	(OUT)		*W
Cross [6] (4-0-0-2)	x ¹ D ¹	*S ¹				*S	XXX	(OUT)	S ¹
Turner [6] (2-1-0-3)	*SOFC	*D ¹				OUT		(OUT)	x ² S ²
Thompson [6] (3-1-0-2)	*T ¹	D ¹				FO ¹		(S)	W
Hallman [6] (2-0-0-4)	S ¹	FO						(S)	(DP)
Clements [5] (2-0-1-2)	GO	XXX	E-2*S(CR)			XXX	x ¹ HBP(CR)	(OUT)	XXX
Sullivan [5] (2-0-0-3)	XXX	GO	E-2*S				FO	XXX	*S
Taylor [5] (2-2-0-1)		*D	E-2,5*W				*SOFC		*S

Let's now consider the third, fourth, and fifth innings. For the third inning, we know that Thompson (courtesy-running for Clements), Sullivan, and Taylor scored with nobody out. Therefore, we know that Hamilton, Boyle, and Cross must have batted in the third inning. Similarly, we know that at least Sullivan, Taylor, and Hamilton must have batted in the fifth inning (since Boyle singled and scored in the sixth inning). Considering the fifth inning, we know what Sullivan did in four of his plate appearances (GO, S, FO, and S). Therefore, we know that he was retired in the fifth inning. Similarly, we know what Taylor did in four of his plate appearances (D, W, SOFC, and S). Therefore, we know that he walked in the fifth inning. Thus, at this point in our consideration of the fifth inning, we have one out (made by Sullivan) and Taylor on first base, with Hamilton coming to bat. This must be when Lange started the "prettiest play of the game" double play. So, let's presume that Hamilton hits into a double play to end the fifth inning. This gives Scorecard A-4:

Scorecard A-4. From Scorecard A-3 and Deductions for the Fifth Inning.

Player [PA] (h-w-@-O)	1 (3)	2 (4)	3 (3)	4 (0)	5 (0)	6 (2)	7 (1)	8 (0)	9 (3)
Hamilton [6] (2-2-1-1)	*W	*S ¹ (SB,SB)			FODP		S ¹		sac
Boyle [6] (1-1-1-3)	sac	FO			XXX	E-8*S	(OUT)		*W
Cross [6] (4-0-0-2)	X ^D 1	*S ¹				*S	XXX	(OUT)	S ¹
Turner [6] (2-1-0-3)	*SOFC	*D ¹				OUT		(OUT)	X ^S 2
Thompson [6] (3-1-0-2)	*T ¹	D ¹				FO ¹		(S)	W
Hallman [6] (2-0-0-4)	S ¹	FO						(S)	(DP)
Clements [5] (2-0-1-2)	GO	XXX	E-2*S(CR)			XXX	X ^{HBP} (CR)	(OUT)	XXX
Sullivan [5] (2-0-0-3)	XXX	GO	E-2*S	XXX	(OUT)		FO	XXX	*S
Taylor [5] (2-2-0-1)		*D	E-2,5*W		X ^W		*SOFC		*S

So, now we have only the rest of the third inning and all of the fourth inning to consider. As mentioned above, we know that Hamilton, Boyle, and Cross batted in the third. And we know that at least Clements, Hallman, and Thompson batted in the fourth. That leaves Turner to bat in either the third (as the last batter of the inning) or the fourth (as the first batter in the inning). Since we presumed that Turner made an out in the eighth inning, he must have walked in his remaining at bat. Therefore, it must be presumed that Turner walked in the fourth inning. Similarly, since we presumed that Thompson and Hallman each singled in the eighth inning, it must be presumed that Thompson and Hallman were each retired in the fourth inning. That leaves Clements as the last player to bat in the fourth inning. We know what Clements did in four of his plate appearances [GO, S(CR), HBP(CR), and (OUT)]. Therefore, we know that he singled in the fourth inning — and was replaced by Thompson as a courtesy runner. Thus, at this point in our consideration of the fourth inning, we have Turner on base, Thompson and Hallman retired, and Thompson on base, courtesy-running for Clements. Therefore, either Turner or Thompson must have been retired on the basepath in the fourth inning (with Sullivan at bat) — because Sullivan must lead off the fifth inning. There is no other alternative — since Boyle must bat in the sixth inning according to the text descriptions. Therefore, only Hamilton, Taylor, and Sullivan can and must bat in the fifth inning. For simplicity, let's presume that Turner is retired on the basepath (such as caught stealing) to end the fourth inning. This gives Scorecard A-5:

Scorecard A-5. From Scorecard A-4 and Deductions for the Fourth Inning.

Player [PA] (h-w-@-O)	1 (3)	2 (4)	3 (3)	4 (0)	5 (0)	6 (2)	7 (1)	8 (0)	9 (3)
Hamilton [6] (2-2-1-1)	*W	*S ¹ (SB,SB)			FODP		S ¹		sac
Boyle [6] (1-1-1-3)	sac	FO			XXX	E-8*S	(OUT)		*W
Cross [6] (4-0-0-2)	XD ¹	*S ¹				*S	XXX	(OUT)	S ¹
Turner [6] (2-1-0-3)	*SOFC	*D ¹	XXX	XW		OUT		(OUT)	X ² S
Thompson [6] (3-1-0-2)	*T ¹	D ¹		(OUT)		FO ¹		(S)	W
Hallman [6] (2-0-0-4)	S ¹	FO		(OUT)				(S)	(DP)
Clements [5] (2-0-1-2)	GO	XXX	E-2*S(CR)	S(CR)		XXX	XHBP(CR)	(OUT)	XXX
Sullivan [5] (2-0-0-3)	XXX	GO	E-2*S	XXX	(OUT)		FO	XXX	*S
Taylor [5] (2-2-0-1)		*D	E-2,5*W		XW		*SOFC		*S

So, all that is left now is the third inning. And, as stated above, Hamilton, Boyle, and Cross must bat in the third inning. We know what Hamilton did in five of his plate appearances (W, S, FODP, S, and sac). Therefore, we know that Hamilton must have walked in the third inning. Likewise, we know what Boyle did in five of his plate appearances [sac, FO, S, (OUT), and W]. Therefore, we know that Boyle must have been retired in the third inning. Similarly, we know what Cross did in five of his plate appearances [D, S, S, (OUT), and S]. Therefore, we know that Cross must have been retired in the third inning. Since there must be three outs in the inning — and because we still need to utilize a double play — presuming that either Boyle or Cross hit into a double play serves all of the needs. For simplicity, let's presume that Cross hits into the double play, Dahlen-Decker (6-3). This gives Scorecard A-6:

Scorecard A-6. From Scorecard A-5 and Deductions for the Third Inning.

Player [PA] (h-w-@-O)	1 (3)	2 (4)	3 (3)	4 (0)	5 (0)	6 (2)	7 (1)	8 (0)	9 (3)
Hamilton [6] (2-2-1-1)	*W	*S ¹ (SB,SB)	(XW)		(FODP)		S ¹		sac
Boyle [6] (1-1-1-3)	sac	FO	(OUT)		XXX	E-8*S	(OUT)		*W
Cross [6] (4-0-0-2)	XD ¹	*S ¹	(DP)			*S	XXX	(OUT)	S ¹
Turner [6] (2-1-0-3)	*SOFC	*D ¹	XXX	(XW)		OUT		(OUT)	X ² S
Thompson [6] (3-1-0-2)	*T ¹	D ¹		(OUT)		FO ¹		(S)	W
Hallman [6] (2-0-0-4)	S ¹	FO		(OUT)		(OUT)		(S)	(DP)
Clements [5] (2-0-1-2)	GO	XXX	E-2*S(CR)	S(CR)		XXX	XHBP(CR)	(OUT)	XXX
Sullivan [5] (2-0-0-3)	XXX	GO	E-2*S	XXX	(OUT)		FO	XXX	*S
Taylor [5] (2-2-0-1)		*D	E-2,5*W		(XW)		*SOFC		*S

So, we have achieved a complete scorecard — with everything given in the box score and in the text descriptions incorporated into the scorecard (except a passed ball by the Chicago catcher). BUT, just because we have a

completed scorecard with everything from the box score and text descriptions, it does not mean that the scorecard summarizes exactly what happened in the game. For instance, one could interchange Clements' fourth-inning and eighth-inning events. But that would necessitate also interchanging Thompson's fourth-inning and eighth-inning events as well as Turner's fourth-inning and eighth-inning events. Doing these interchanges gives Scorecard B:

Scorecard B. From Modification of Scorecard A-6.

Player [PA] (h-w-@-O)	1 (3)	2 (4)	3 (3)	4 (0)	5 (0)	6 (2)	7 (1)	8 (0)	9 (3)
Hamilton [6] (2-2-1-1)	*W	*S ¹ (SB,SB)	(^x W)		(FODP)		S ¹		sac
Boyle [6] (1-1-1-3)	sac	FO	(OUT)		XXX	E-8*S	(OUT)		*W
Cross [6] (4-0-0-2)	^x D ¹	*S ¹	(DP)			*S	XXX	(OUT)	S ¹
Turner [6] (2-1-0-3)	*SOFC	*D ¹	XXX	(OUT)		OUT		(^x W)	^x S ²
Thompson [6] (3-1-0-2)	*T ¹	D ¹		(S)		FO ¹		(OUT)	W
Hallman [6] (2-0-0-4)	S ¹	FO		(OUT)		(OUT)		(S)	(DP)
Clements [5] (2-0-1-2)	GO	XXX	E-2*S(CR)	(OUT)		XXX	^x HBP(CR)	S(CR)	XXX
Sullivan [5] (2-0-0-3)	XXX	GO	E-2*S	XXX	(OUT)		FO	XXX	*S
Taylor [5] (2-2-0-1)		*D	E-2,5*W		(^x W)		*SOFC		*S

There are, of course, numerous other complete scorecards that can be devised. The take-away message is that there are reasonable (or not-unreasonable) scenarios which fit with the statement given in the *PREC* account that Clements was replaced with a courtesy runner three times. It is known for certain that Clements was replaced by Thompson in the third inning and by Hallman in the seventh inning. And, according to the logical scenarios devised for Scorecards A and B, Clements could have been replaced by Thompson in either the fourth inning or the eighth inning.

Ancient Trick

An interesting happening in the August 30 game that involved Clements was described in several of the accounts, such as in the *PREC* account: "The spectators did not lack for excitement, however, as at one time a fight between Clements and Lange seemed certain. The trouble occurred in the second inning, and was preceded by a little incident that seemed to get Lange into bad favor with the spectators. The lanky centre-fielder was on third base and Wilmot was on the coaching lines when they tried a very ancient trick. Lange walked unconcernedly toward the plate, while Wilmot sneaked in behind him and played around the bag as though he was the base runner. Finally Lange slid over the plate with a rush, but Umpire Lynch sent him back to third amid the jeers of the crowd. Immediately afterwards Irwin, who was on first, started for second, and when Clements threw the ball Lange started for home. Hallman threw back quickly and Lange was caught between third and the plate. In running him down Clements got close up to him, and Lange suddenly turned and ran into the catcher, knocking him down. He then rushed toward Clements before the latter could rise, and threatened to strike him. Cross, Sullivan, and Hallman prevented any trouble, and Lange starting toward the plate touched it and was allowed his run, though he had followed Clements far out of the base lines. He was roundly hissed for his actions, and made no further trouble." The *CHIO* account added, "Lynch allowed Lange to score, which decision was the only proper one, for no matter whether Clements' interference was premeditated or not it prevented Lange from having a chance to come home."